Table of Contents

1. Has Breezepelt Truly Changed?
2. Did Lilywhisker kill Badgerfang?
3. Faded Cats Concept
4. Improving Sol
5. Snowkit/Tuft Alternate Theory
6. Appledusk Defence
7. Ravenwing Defence
8. Heathertail and Breezepelt ain't Heathy
9. Bluestar the Hypocrite
10. The Dark Side of Starclan
11. The unfair exile of Brokenstar's Followers
12. Nightcloud's Forgotten Side
13. Mothwing shouldn't be a Medicine cat
14. Goosefeather deserves the Dark Forest
15. The Forgotten War
16. Forgotten Side of Tallstar

Has Breezepelt Truly Changed?

Many people consider Breezepelt to have been redeemed after Crowfeather's Trial. However, if you look at his actions later in the timeline, that's pulled into question. Has Breezepelt truly changed or is there deception?

Overlooked actions:

First, Breezepelt has committed more crimes than the obvious Moonpool attack and the Great Battle. So I'll be providing a quote I believe are often overlooked.

Breezepelt praised the Dark Forest after they murdered Beetlewhisker – *"Breezepelt?" Brokenstar turned to the WindClan warrior, who was peering at Beetlewhisker's body through narrowed eyes. "Did you hear me?" Brokenstar growled quietly. "Why would I leave the strongest Clan?" Breezepelt lifted his head. "My Clan wastes too much time looking after the sick and old. If you led us, we'd never have to beg another Clan for help again."* – Last Hope.

Breezepelt covers up Antpelt's murder – *"It's no use." Kestrelflight's voice, heavy with defeat. "[Antpelt] hunts with StarClan now." Swallowtail let out another grief-stricken screech, but it seemed to fade into the background; Dovewing heard another cat much more clearly. "Sunstrike, Furzepaw, come over here." It was Breezepelt, his voice a low mutter. "Say nothing about the Dark Forest," he warned. "Antpelt may be dead here, but he'll still be in the Place of No Stars. Nothing's changed; he's still on our side."* – Breezepelt about Antpelt dying his wounds after his Dark Forest training, Sign of the Moon.

Beezepelt attacks Crowfeather in the Great Battle – *"As she flung the tom off, the thorn barrier rattled. Crowfeather leapt into the hollow, Breezepelt on his tail. As they dived into the throng, Dovewing*

stumbled." – Last Hope

Breezepelt leaves his fellow Trainees for dead- (This one requires slightly more explanation)

*"No!" As Breezepelt reared up to attack a WindClan warrior, Ivypool launched herself at him. Smashing into Breezepelt's flank, she sent him flying. "You can't fight for the Dark Forest!" "Are you crazy?" Breezepelt struggled free and stared at her. "This is what we've been training for!" * the Last mention of Breezepelt in this scene**

"But you can't believe that this is right!" Suddenly claws raked Ivypool's cheek. Pain shot through her and she staggered sideways. Thistleclaw loomed over her, his lip curled to show long, yellow teeth. "Traitor!"

"I'm no traitor!" Ivypool hissed. "I've been loyal to my Clan all along! I only came to the Dark Forest to find out what you were planning!" Her heart froze as Hawkfrost appeared behind Thistleclaw's shoulder. Then Snowtuft landed beside her, his eyes darkening with hate.

"We won't fight for you either!" Birchfall flung himself at a Dark Forest tabby.

Applefur lunged for a ragged tom. "I fight for the Clans!" Rage flared in Hawkfrost's gaze. "Then we shall kill you first, before we destroy your wretched Clans!" – Chapter 25.

Ivypool was attacked right in front of Breezepelt, yet he just allows it. It's likely he also overheard Hawkfrost swearing to kill Birchface and Applefur. Either way, Breezepelt was aware his allies would execute his fellow trainees and carried on to fight for their side.

If Breezepelt hasn't done this, two deaths might have been prevented. Hollyleaf was required to save Ivypool instead, ultimately leading to her being murdered by Hawkfrost. This scene is also the last living appearance of Applefur, a confirmed victim of the Dark Forest. This is her last living appearance, very shortly after Breezepelt left her – "Applefur and Blossomfall fought back to back, blood dripping from their whiskers, fending off blows from four Dark Forest toms." – Last Hope

This also works as a pay-off for Breezepelt swearing revenge on Ivypool after Antpelt's second death – "What happened to Antpelt?", Breezepelt whispered, "Did you kill him again?" [...] "Ivypool shrugged, "It was necessary. In the end, my loyalty was greater than his." [...] He snarled, "We may be in the same clan here, but I am not your Clanmate. You will be punished for this. Wait and see."

Breezepelt knew his side was especially killing kits – *"Once the kits are dead, their mothers will have less to fight for," Mapleshade pointed out."* – Last Hope, before Great Battle, so Breezepelt knew about it beforehand.

-*"Birchfall was defending a kit at the far side of the camp."* - Last Hope. In Windclan camp, the same assault Breezepelt had joined in.

-"Injured cats littered the clearing. Pinenose, a black queen, wailed over the small, lifeless body of a kit.", Shadowclan camp.

Even after his Crowfeather's Trial's 'redemption':

Dovewing's Silence - Takes place around the same time as Crowfeather's Trial and this is how Breezepelt acts at the Special meeting, when the Leaders decide to forgive the Trainees: *"Onestar arrived before the ThunderClan cats had finished settling. He was accompanied by his medicine cat, Kestrelflight, and Breezepelt. The black warrior's eyes flashed defiantly. He clearly doesn't think he's done anything wrong, Dovewing thought." [...]"Breezepelt was looking smug and Dovewing felt an urge to rake his ears. She was sure he hadn't wanted to be a better WindClan warrior. He had wanted power and strength, and that was all."*

Even in Crowfeather's Trial, he lies about his crimes and motives – "*I trained with the Dark Forest to become a stronger warrior. I needed some cat to believe in me, and the Dark Forest cats did – or at least they seemed to. But I wasn't fighting against the Clans. I'll always be a WindClan cat first. This battle with the stoats is my chance to prove myself."* – Crowfeather's Trial, Page 364.

However He did fight against Windclan – "*There you are!" Breezepelt's eyes shone. "We're going to launch an attack on the*

[Windclan] camp. [...] "As Breezepelt reared up to attack a WindClan warrior, Ivypool launched herself at him. Smashing into Breezepelt's flank, she sent him flying. "You can't fight for the Dark Forest!" "Are you crazy?" Breezepelt struggled free and stared at her. "This is what we've been training for!" – Last Hope.

The Dark Forest cats didn't "seem" anything to Breezepelt, he was aware of their true nature: "He was one of the few cats who understood the true nature of the Dark Forest's attack on the Clans —and he relished the thought of punishing those cats who had made his life so difficult." – Ultimate Guide.

He was motived to join for personal revenge, not for the approval of any Dark Forest cat – Ivypool: Don't do it! Please! Do you really want to destroy the Clans for Brokenstar's sake? [...] Breezeeplt: "This has nothing to do with Brokenstar. Lionblaze should never have been born. None of them should." – Last Hope.

Seasons after Last Hope, Breezepelt still lies about the Moonpool attack:

"Then tell me why," Onestar persisted. "I've made it clear, as Clan leader, that I've forgiven Breezepelt for his part in the battle. And he has sworn a new oath of loyalty to WindClan. So why, as Breezepelt's father, do you refuse to accept that?" "I know that what you say is true," Crowfeather replied, struggling not to unleash his pent-up frustrations on his Clan leader. "But . . . well, you know that I caught Breezepelt about to kill Lionblaze.", If Crowfeather knew about the Moonpool attack, he'd defiantly mention it here.

Breezepelt doesn't protest/care for Crowfeather's unfair exile, despite he himself being lucky not to be exiled:

"Onestar hissed. "I think you need some time alone to think about what makes a loyal warrior, Crowfeather. And until you do, I don't want you in our camp and on our territory. For the next quarter moon . . . you are not a WindClan cat!" [...] He noticed that Breezepelt, at the front of the group, looked shocked out of his fur, his eyes wide and his pelt bristling. Some cat speaks up for me, Crowfeather begged silently. You know I'm loyal . . . I'm WindClan through and through! I've given up so much for this Clan! Tell him!

Tell him he's being unreasonable! But no cat spoke. It seemed that no cat was willing to risk Onestar's ire . . . not for Crowfeather. Not even Breezepelt, Crowfeather thought ruefully. And just as I thought we might be getting closer. He's probably glad to get a break from me." – Crowfeather's Trial, Chapter 18.

"Heathertail explained, "We slipped away and picked up your scent trail." The bitter pain in Crowfeather's heart eased a little, to think that Heathertail and Breezepelt had come looking for him, but he found it hard to respond. Breezepelt was standing a pace or two behind Heathertail, his gaze fixed on his paws, the familiar awkward, sullen expression on his face. He looked as if he didn't want to be there, and at the sight of him Crowfeather's heart hardened again." – Crowfeather's Trial Chapter 19, Breezepelt doesn't show any sympathy.

He lies about being willing to harm Nightcloud in Crowfeather's Trial:

Berrynose: "The difference is, Breezepelt, that even after you found out what the Dark Forest was up to, you stayed with them. You were prepared to kill Lionblaze—prepared to kill your own kin! How can we just accept your word if you tell us that you'd never hurt Nightcloud?"

Breezepelt: "Because Nightcloud was the only cat who ever cared about me!"

Perhaps he wasn't willing to do it himself, but Breezepelt still apart of the harm caused to of all the Clans, including Windclan. He himself personally joining in with an assault on Windclan camp, almost attacking his Clanmate. In the end, 8 of his Clanmates died, including his grandmother, Ashfoot. He was fully aware his side were targeting Heathertail and Nightcloud, just like any other Clan cat. It was only luck they weren't slaughter.

Breezepelt didn't even care to warn Heathetail, keeping his training and the Dark Forest secret from her – "Breezepelt rolled his eyes and leaned farther over the bank so that he could talk to the other trainees without Heathertail hearing him. "Look, I don't want to

fight you over this," he muttered. "But I'll have to if you keep arguing. Just clear out, okay?" – Forgotten Warrior.

He still overly violent toward innocent cats:

When Bumblestripe was rightfully suspicious of trespassing Windclan cats, Breezepelt was the first to attack - *"But at that moment, Bumblestripe padded forward and pushed his muzzle into Breezepelt's shoulder fur. "They're carrying our scent!" he exclaimed. "That proves they're up to no good!" Breezepelt started backwards, his pelt beginning to bristle, and slapped Bumblestripe away with a lash of his tail. A growl came from deep in Bumblestripe's throat, while Breezepelt slid out his claws. Their backs arched, as if they would leap into a fight at any moment. "No!" Crowfeather ordered. He pushed Breezepelt back and stepped between him and the ThunderClan tom. At the same moment, Ivypool snapped, "Stop that, Bumblestripe." She stood beside Crowfeather, separating the two hostile toms. Reluctantly, Bumblestripe took a step back, though he and Breezepelt were still glaring at each other."* - Crowfeather Trial.

When Berrynose expresses his option in a private conversation, Breezepelt shows signs of aggression and gives out threatens - "But how do we know that the Dark Forest warriors in other Clans can really be trusted? If they can't, they should be driven out.", Berrynose mewed. Crowfeather could feel the roiling anger wafting off Breezepelt, as strong as the reek of fox scent. Glancing back, he saw his son's shoulder fur bristling and his amber eyes glittering with fury. He was sure that in a couple of heartbeats Breezepelt would launch himself out of the tunnel and fling himself on Berrynose. [...] "I'd like to claw his pelt off," Breezepelt growled. But to Crowfeather's relief he didn't try to argue. He simply rose to his paws and began to pad back the way they had come." - Crowfeather's Trial. Breezepelt also doing this while he's trespassing and eavesdropping. He has no right to harm an innocent cat to express their opinion on how criminals should be punished, when Breezepelt himself is the guilty one.

Whenever innocent cats have the "audacity" to bring up Breezepelt's crimes, he instantly tries to attack them and shift blame onto them:

- "Breezepelt let out a furious hiss. "It sounds like ThunderClan is planning for trouble—trying to tell other Clans what to do about their Dark Forest warriors. Saying they should be driven out. We're not the cats who are causing problems!" Crowfeather winced as a tense silence followed his son's words. Breezepelt, I may be angry too, but that was a really bad idea. The two ThunderClan she-cats exchanged an alarmed glance, while Spiderleg's tail lashed even more furiously, and Berrynose slid out his claws and flattened his ears. "Were you eavesdropping?" he challenged Breezepelt. "Is that what you were up to? Is WindClan spying on us now?" Crowfeather could see Breezepelt's muscles bunching beneath his pelt, and stepped forward quickly before his son could leap at Berrynose."

- Breezepelt almost broke the truce at the Gathering, to the point of hurting bystanders - "That's right," Berrynose put in. "After we suffered so much betrayal from Dark Forest cats, nothing at all would surprise me." [...] Breezepelt rose to his paws. Other cats were turning their heads to look at him as he **leaped forward and charged straight at Spiderleg. Some of the cats instinctively darted aside, and those who stayed in Breezepelt's way were thrust aside with powerful strokes of his paws**. Crowfeather sprang up to intercept him, terrified that he was going to attack Spiderleg and break the Gathering truce. But instead Breezepelt halted in the middle of the crowd, a tail-length away from the black ThunderClan tom. The cats nearby turned around to stare, shaking their ruffled pelts. "If so many cats have a problem with me," Breezepelt snarled, "they should say so directly, not prowl around it like little mouse-hearts!" Onestar gazed down at him from the Great Oak, lashing his tail in frustration and anger. "Breezepelt, stop now!" he commanded. But Crowfeather could see that his son wasn't looking at their leader, either unaware that he had spoken or determined to ignore him. "I know very well what you might think about me," Breezepelt continued. "But in my opinion, some warriors in other Clans are just looking for a reason to fight. Doesn't that make them just as much of a threat to our day-to-day lives as the cats who once trained with—or even fought for—the Dark Forest?" [...] "Spiderleg twitched his whiskers. "Is that so? Or are you going to eavesdrop on ThunderClan some more?" he mewed. Breezepelt whirled to face the ThunderClan warrior, his muscles tensed and his claws extending. "How dare you, you mangy—" Crowfeather's belly

lurched as he saw that once again the Gathering truce was within heartbeats of being broken. Quickly he stepped between the two hostile warriors, breaking their furious glare. "Calm down," he began. "This isn't—"

When Pickle, the kittypet who helped with Nightcloud's recovery, understandable didn't trust the Windclan cats. But still Breezepelt tempted to kill him - *"That mange-pelt!" Breezepelt snarled. "He's trying to mess up our plan so Nightcloud has to stay. I'll slaughter him!" Crowfeather blocked him in time to stop him from charging into the den to attack the kittypet. "No—if you go in there you might get trapped," he meowed. "Then we'd have two of you to rescue. Right now, we have to get Nightcloud out."*

Reckless abandonment:

Breezepelt considers his revenge on the Stoats more important then anyone else. Including demanding his Clanmates unnecessarily risk their lives and ignoring the Medicine cat's vision: Breezepelt mewed "We can't put it off any longer. We must kill every last stoat. After what they did to Nightcloud, they have to pay! I don't care what it takes."

"Calm down," Crowfeather told him sternly. "Yes, it's terrible what the stoats have done, but they're stupid, crow-food-eating creatures —hardly coldblooded killers. We'll get the stoats out, and prevent that horrible scene in Kestrelflight's vision, but you mustn't do anything rash."

His son gave him a glare as cold as the wind that swept across the moor in leaf-bare. "I don't care about Kestrelflight's vision," he hissed, "and I don't care what you call them. I just want the stoats dead. Nightcloud was the only cat who really cared about me, and they murdered her. I'm going to make them regret ever laying their filthy paws on my mother." For a moment Crowfeather was frozen into silence, stunned by the force of Breezepelt's anger. He knew that he should reassure Breezepelt, tell him that he had a father who cared for him, too—but for some reason the words were stuck in his throat.

Breezepelt was scaring him a little bit. Is this how the rest of the

Clan sees him? Angry and unpredictable? Before he could find what he needed to tell his son, Leaftail sidled up to them, a suspicious look in his amber eyes. "Did you just say you don't care about Kestrelflight's vision?" he asked. Oh, StarClan. Crowfeather wanted to tell Leaftail to leave Breezepelt alone, because he had just learned of his mother's death. But before he could speak, Breezepelt turned on the tabby tom with a snarl of anger. "I don't care! I need to kill the animals in the tunnels. That's the only thing that matters." With a lash of his tail he strode off into the warriors' den. By now more cats were gathering around, listening to the exchange in curious silence. "That proves it, then," Leaftail announced, his gaze raking across the crowd. "If Breezepelt were truly loyal to WindClan, he would respect his medicine cat. Every cat knows how important Kestrelflight's vision was! How can we prevent the flood if we don't work together?"

Breezepelt almost gets himself killed, right after Nightcloud's supposed death, by trying to slaughter the stoats alone with complete reckless abandonment. This is selfish, as Breezepelt has grieving loved ones and endangered his Clanmates by forcing them to physically restrain him - "At dawn that morning, Breezepelt had tried to leave the camp, intent on taking revenge by entering the tunnels alone and killing every stoat he found there. It had taken five cats to hold him back, and finally Heathertail had convinced him to wait. She'd told him they would take on the stoats, but to do that, they needed him at his full strength. He needed rest. He argued for a while, but eventually he gave in, and now Heathertail watched over him as he slept. But what happens when he wakes up? Crowfeather asked himself gloomily. How do I help him deal with his grief, without running foolishly into an ambush of stoats?"

Then tries to do it a second time - "You can all believe whatever you want. I don't need any cat's help. As soon as I get the chance, I'm going back into the tunnels to kill all the stoats and avenge my mother—even if I have to do it alone."

The way he treats the stoats is worrying. Even if they are different species, Breezepelt takes too much pleasure in slaughtering every single one for revenge, while the Clan cats themselves are

responsible for killing stoats as well. Treating it like a sport, rather a genuine attempt to defend his Clan. When dealt with a similar situation in Firestar's Quest, their sole aim was killing the Rat's Leader, as that the quickest way to end the conflict. Firestar didn't then go ahead and kill more rats for his own amusement. Neither did he unnecessarily endanger himself or his clanmates with reckless abandonment.

After examples, go with Brindleface's litter, Willowpelt's litter and Leafpool - Who had loved ones killed by another species, yet never did what Breezepelt did. The savage slaughter of prey is not supported in the Warrior Code, stating thanks should be given for its life. When Tigerstar killed many rabbits for the dogs or Hollyleaf mauled a vole, their Clanmates were horrified. Considering Breezepelt just come off the genocide of his whole community, it seems like he just shifted his murderous tendencies to something he can get away with.

Long after Crowfeather's Trial, he still carries on doing many questionable actions:

Long after his 'redemption', he's shouting hypocritical statements at Gatherings:

-Rowanstar gazed out gravely at the Clans. "The rogues that attacked Onestar's patrol are living on the edge of our territory, near our border with ThunderClan." [...] Breezepelt showed his teeth. "They're murderers!" – Thunder and Shadow

-Breezepelt supporting the exile of cats similar to himself, even at the expense of unborn kits: "I have decided to allow Sleekwhisker and Yarrowleaf to stay with SkyClan—at their request—since Yarrowleaf is very close to kitting. But they will be on probation until the kits are born and weaned." [...] "No ShadowClan cat could ever be trusted!" Breezepelt of WindClan yowled.

He's hardly the cat to talk about trustworthiness! Alderheart thought. He was glad to see that many cats, including some of his own Clan, turned to glare at Breezepelt.

Bramblestar was one of them. "That's not true," he declared.

"ShadowClan was one of the original five clans, and a noble Clan. Just because it no longer exists doesn't mean that its cats shouldn't be respected."Breezepelt glared defiantly back, but no cat was paying attention to him now, as the meeting continued." – River of Fire Chapter 9

Breezepelt so entitled, he believes he's the only who deserves forgiveness, even for those who are done less than him. Despite the fact, he should really be the most understanding out of all the Clans. He'll undermine them to the point of demanding their exile, even if one of them was pregnant.

Every other appearance he's made in Vision of Shadows shows he's kept his old aggression and Distaste for cats who ain't Clan pure blood:

- "Hi, Crowfeather." Tigerheart stood his ground and mewed briskly. "We've come on an herb-gathering mission. It's urgent."

A black tom with amber eyes padded closer, showing his teeth. "Wait, Breezepelt," Crowfeather cautioned." – Thunder and Shadow

- "Breezepelt strode toward [Leafpool] and [Alderpaw], chest puffed out indignantly. "What are they doing here?"

"They want to speak with Kestrelflight," Emberfoot told him. Breezepelt narrowed his eyes." – Thunder and Shadow, to Medicine cats, who are no threat and should be respected.

- "Who is this cat?" Breezepelt of WindClan demanded. "Wasn't he a rogue?" Thornclaw added, "He was. And he isn't even a real Clan cat now! "Who is he to tell us what to do?", River of Fire, Breezepelt about Tree at the Gathering, when he's announced to be joining Skyclan as a Mediator.

- Alderheart lashed his tail urgently. "We must put an end to conflict."

"How?" Mallownose yowled. "There has always been conflict between Clans!" "And there always will be." Breezepelt called from the other side of the clearing. "We are five Clans, not one.", The

Rising Storm, at the Gathering, after Medicine cat announce their vision and interpret it as the Clans needing to work together.

Squirrelflight's Hope

Even further down the timeline, when Breezepelt has two litters, one fully grown - He's still up to his old habits.

Another example of how Breezepelt's attitude towards outsiders hasn't changed at all - "It's decided," the ShadowClan leader growled. "Tree will talk to the Sisters." Below him, Breezepelt rolled his eyes. "Why send a loner to do a warrior's job?" Hawkwing bristled beside Squirrelflight. "Tree is no loner!" he snarled, eyeing Breezepelt. "He's a loyal Clan cat now."

Still holding grudges against Squirrelflight, despite already having forgiven Crowfeather for many of the same things:

Breezepelt: "She's disloyal!"
Squirrelflight: "That's not true!"
Breezepelt: "And it's not the first time.You raised your sister's half-Clan kits and told your Clanmates and Bramblestar they were your own! You're a liar."
Bramblestar: "We came here to talk to the Sisters, not rake up old bones."
Breezepelt: "We didn't expect to find your deputy here, mixing with the enemy! Squirrelflight's disloyal. She's been disloyal before. She can't be trusted!"
Squirrelflight: "You don't get to lecture me on loyalty! Who did you fight for in the battle with the Dark Forest?"
Crowfeather: "We can listen to Squirrelflight's explanation later."

Despite supposedly reconciling with Crowfeather and gaining forgiveness from Lionblaze seasons ago, Breezepelt still harbouring bitterness towards Squirrelflight and Leafpool. He's picking and choosing which grudges he decides to keep for his own connivance. During Crowfeather's Trial, he only gained forgiveness from the bare minimum of victims, he knew was necessary to save his reputation. Never bothering to apologise to Jayfeather, Poppyfrost or Leafpool, not even mentioning Hollyleaf either. Shedding even more doubt that Breezepelt was genuinely trying to redeem himself.

Silent Thaw

When a possessed Bramblestar gives out cruel punishments to Codebreakers and hypocritically breaks the rules himself - A secret meeting is held to discuss what do with him. When Breezepelt is among those attending, his motives are suspicious considering his recent track record. Though since the Broken Code arc only has two books out, no conclusions can be made yet. Yet even in this one scene, Breezepelt does another questionable action. Among everyone there, he's insists on the most violent/risky approach and dismissive of potential casualties - Invading Thunderclan camp to banish Bramblestar, even if it causes a war:

- "Stemleaf stared at the SkyClan medicine cat. "We have to do something! StarClan can't really want us to turn our backs on one another. If Bramblestar wants to banish cats, I say we should banish him!" He gazed around at the cats, and Rootpaw saw Sneezecloud, Slightfoot, and **Breezepelt** nod in agreement." - Silent Thaw, Chapter 16.

- Cloverfoot: "How could we banish the leader of ThunderClan? There aren't enough of us."
Sneezecloud: "And we're from different Clans. Even if we could each persuade our own Clans that what we're doing is for the best, what could we do—invade ThunderClan's camp?"
Cloverfoot: "We could end up causing a war."
Stemleaf: "Not if enough cats agree that Bramblestar has to go."
Breezepelt: "When was the last time the Clans agreed on anything without fighting about it first?"

Did Lilywhisker kill Badgerfang?

Well, Su claims that Lilywhisker went to the Dark Forest because 'she couldn't accept her fate after her hind leg was broken'. However, I like to think this isn't actually the reason but simply the motivation, on what later caused her to do the horrible things that sent her to the Dark Forest.

And there's even some evidence supporting it. Here's the opening of Badgerfang's story in the "Code of the Clans" and only appearance of his killer: *"The Windclan warrior sprang with his claws unsheathed, and the little black-and-white cat fell to the ground without making a sound. A trickle of blood crept from his ear, which was crumpled in the dust. Flintfang shook off the warrior trying to sink her teeth into his tail and bounded over to his unmoving Clanmate."*

What we know about Badgerfang's killer:
It's a she-cat.
It's a Windclan cat.

It's also very likely this cat is also in the Dark Forest. It's shown that simply training in the Dark Forest (Redwillow and Antpelt) or being loyal to the wrong cat (Tangleburr and Stumpytail), is enough to get you into the Dark Forest. So killing a kit would be more than enough to land you in the Dark Forest. Out of the three Windclan Dark Forests cats, we know of; Houndleap, Lilywhisker and Antpelt, it had to be Lilywhisker who killed Badgerfang. As she's the only she-cat and lived in the right time frame to be alive when Shadowclan drove out Windclan.

Antpelt wasn't even born yet and Houndleap was already in the Dark Forest when Spottledleaf was an apprentice, meaning Badgerfang wouldn't of even born yet.

Possible counter-arguments:

"She would have of been too old by that point to be alive.". - At this point in time, Tallstar was still alive, with still serval years left in him (Not dying until Starlight). And when Lilywhisker was around the age of a young warrior (retired very early), Tallstar was a kit. So it's not too much of a stretch to think Lilywhisker could an alive at this point. Probably being around the age of a senior warrior or actual proper to age to become an Elder.

"It's said a warrior killed Badgerfang, not an elder.". - Remember the story told from the point of view of 3/4 moon old kit. So it won't be surprising that Bangerfang mistook most grown-up cats for warriors. And if Lilywhisker was fighting, that gives him, even more, of a reason to think she was a warrior. Also, remember what I said earlier, Lilywhisker very retired early, so she might have still been the age where she could be a warrior if her leg was never injured.

"It was during a battle, so it wouldn't of been enough for her to be sent to the Dark Forest." - I'd like to point to Clawface, he was sent to the Dark Forest for killing a Medicine cat from another Clan during a battle. And I'd say killing another clan's kit during an attack can do the same thing. And I'd say it's a lot worse. Badgerfang was clearly too young to be fighting and didn't pose any threat, the warrior could have simply knocked him away with a single paw. But despite that, the warrior still lunged at him with unsheltered claws and continued to attack him after Badgerfang had been knocked to the floor. Acting way too ruthlessly. Murdering him was completely unnecessary. It beyond the excuse of 'self-defense'.

"She didn't know he was kit" - Anyone could have easily seen he was a kit. For example, during the battle when Moonflower died, Bluepaw and Snowpaw had been made apprentices slightly early, probably about 5.5 moons and Hawkheart was instantly able to tell she was a kit. For another example, during Brokenstar's exile,

Firepaw was attacked by Littlekit/paw, he was also able to instantly see he was a kit, sheltering his claws and knocking him away, saying 'this is not your fight'. So if: Bluepaw was able to recognize as a kit at 5.5 moons and Firepaw could identify a kit, despite being one himself not too long ago, then Badgerfang as 3 moons olds could easily be recognized as a kit.

Even his official description of "**very tiny**, **fluffy** black-and-white tom. His face is striped like a badger's.", just screams with the topical kits traits of being tiny and having fluffy fur.

"Elders don't fight." - If you look back at the battles during the series, especially in the first arc, they'll see elders do indeed fight. For example, Rosetail was killed by Blackfoot while defending the Nusary. While it's not recommended/their duty anymore, elders can still fight if they want to. Usually doing this when cats directly attack their camp.

"Her crippled leg means she couldn't fight" - An injured leg isn't the end to be all. In Lilywhisker's very own time, Deadfoot was able to fight and even become deputy despite having a twisted front paw. Cinderpelt was also able to brawl with badgers, despite having barely any warrior training at all. So Lilywhisker would of definitely been able to fight to some degree, especially against a kit, who are easily killed and not much of a threat.

Motive:

Some of you might say that Lilywhisker wouldn't have the motive/ guts to do something so horrible. However, I would remind you, the last time we saw her, was all the way back in Tallstar's revenge. Which was a long time ago and a lot can happen in that amount of time. Her broken leg may not be the reason she went to the Dark Forest, but it was a cause of a chain of events that lead her down that path.

Just remember what she had to go through; being forced into the Elder's den too early, having no duties, having apprentices give you prey, clear out your bedding and check your pelt for ticks as if you

were helpless. Just made worse as Deadfoot, a cat with a similar condition is allowed to become a warrior while she can't. Then the tunnelers tradition, something her whole life was built around, was ended forever. The thing that gave her so much pride. This quote from Tallstar's revenge, "I used to be able to hear a cavern halfway across the moor, just by the echo of my paw steps.", proves she struggles to let go of the past and is quite prideful.

Possible Story:

So after years of this, she becomes more and more bitter, desperately wanting to be useful to her clan. Then the perfect moment arrives, when Shadowclan attacks. This isn't like most fights. Shadowclan isn't satisfied with just scaring Windclan, they're trying to chase them off for good. Lilywhisker can allow herself to do nothing, so throws herself into battle. The rage that had been building inside her for years is suddenly freed. Nothing would ruin her moment of glory. She becomes bloodthirstily in her battle rage and ends up going too far, killing an innocent kit (Possibly others). Sadly, Lilywhisker is never able to redeem herself in time before she dies, sending her to the Dark Forest.

Faded Cats Concept

So I was looking into theories about Fading away in the Warrior cats series like; They're in a 2nd Starclan, They don't exist anymore etc. But I wasn't satisfied with any of them, so I was like "I'll just make one of my own!". And here we are! It's a bit complex but hopefully, you'll be able to understand it.

If you don't understand anything, just ask.

What faded cats are:

A faded-cat is a spirit in their purest form. They can not physically affect the world around them in any way, neither can things like gravity affect them either. All cats, no matter who they are will eventually become faded. A cat becomes faded once they are completely forgotten or being given fetal wound as a non-faded spirit, which simply speeds up the process. Being a faded cat is like being in your own "personal heaven or realm of existence", no one to bother you.

Faded cats still exist but just completely invisible (No scent, make no sound etc.). They're best described as being a 'presence'/'wandering consciousness' but nothing more. In this state, they forget everything; they're memories, who they're family were and even their own name. They show little emotion or personality, being completely at peace with themselves and the world around. They have no concept of self or time.

Faded cats are extremely knowledgeable and wise. They have the ability to go into Living cats'/non-faded spirits' heads (Possessed) and see their; Memories, dreams, feelings, thoughts, and perspective (Like Jayfeather's power). Through the post won't be aware of being

possessed. Faded cats also can't affect the possessed cat, but only observe them. Faded cats aimlessly wander the Earth/Realms of the afterlives, until they find something that peaks their interest. Though cats who fade-away in the Dark Forest will usually remind trapped there for some time, struggling to leave it due to the Dark Forest's endless and tricking nature. However, they don't seem to mind this.

It's impossible for a living cat to ever see a faded cat, the best thing they can do, is "feel a slight presence of a faded cat". However non-faded spirits are able to sometimes catch "glimpses" of faded cats but this is very hard and rare. Only those who are very knowledgeable and skilled on spiritual powers are able to do this. No one has ever managed to talk to a Faded cat. Faded cats also can't talk to one another or even aware of each other.

Reincarnate:

After many generations, all faded cats will eventually reincarnate. They do this by possessing the lifeless body of unborn kit. If they do not have spirit/soul inside of them at birth, the kit's body will never be conscious and will come out as a still-born. However this doesn't tend to happen due to the sheer number of faded spirits. Since the Faded-cat has already lost all sense of their former selves, it won't affect their new life in any way and they will develop a new identity. Sometimes the faded cat will even be the opposite gender from their old life. Unlike when Non-faded spirits reincarnate, who still have a strong connection with their former life due to retaining their old memories.

However rarely a kit may be processed by two separate spirits (More than 2 is extremely rare). Depending if the spirits are faded or not, different things can happen. If two non-faded spirits process the same kit, it can develop into a split-personality disorder due to the clashing, separate, already established personalities. If they are both faded cats, it wouldn't make a difference as the two personalities will develop together and coexist.

Though in the cause of Cinderheart, she was being processed by Cinderpelt, a non-faded spirit, and a faded cat. Since Cinderpelt already had an established personality, the faded cat simply

developed its new personality around what was already there. To the point, it seemed that both spirits' personalities were almost identical, only that the Faded cat side lacked Cinderpelt's memories. So when Cinderpelt felt Cinderheart's body, there was still Cinderheart's unique spirit inside of her for her to live on. (In usual circumstances, if a spirit left their body, the body would drop dead due to there being no spirit/soul inside of them.)

Improving Sol

Side note before reading:

-Hollyleaf is a part of the three in this version and Power of Three and Omen of the Stars are merged into one. Ivypool and Dovewing could still exist, but not as main characters. Maybe Ivypool is apprenticed to Hollyleaf instead of Cinderheart, having a completely different teaching method to Liionblaze. Could be used as a way to show the contrast between the two siblings.

- All supernatural craziness would be toned down. Rock and Jayfeather going back in time to the ancients is dropped as well as Midnight the talking badger spirit. And Starclan and Dark Forest cats can't physically appear in the real world. (But Jayfeather may keep his stick, but only as a running gag. Maybe it could be the stake from the foxtrap, used to kill Hawkfrost.)

-Hollyleaf's power: she can make herself completely undetectable, even to Starclan. So she can cut off her scent, able to move without making a sound and her black pelt makes her blend perfectly into the night. The only thing giving her away is her holly green eyes.

- I'd also make a tweak to Lionblaze's power, which instead of having the vauge power of 'never being able to be defeated in battle', he'd go into unstoppable battle rages, wildly attacking anything in his path, friend or foe. And it can only be switched off by Jayfeather's powers.

Where his character went wrong:

When Sol first appeared and claimed he was a "traveler" and he seemed to know things he shouldn't, I was really fascinated by where his character would go. I thought he may of been like real world cult leaders, a cat that uses deception to get what he wants. Which he was for the most part, but it wasn't executed very well. I feel like his manipulation wasn't very believable. I wasn't convinced Sol was able to accomplish what he does to Shadowclan in that short of time. It's always characters telling the reader how's Sol 'really creepy' or 'great with words'. But we never get to see those apparently great skills in action.

A good example I think to show this, is in Sunrise, after Sol is captured by a Thunderclan patrol becuase they thought he'd murdered Ashfur. Now the scene itself has a good setup: Sol is staring at the moon, with Hollyleaf standing below him, both of them completely alone. This could of been an excellent hero and villain moment, them simply talking. However, the main problem is build up. This scene doesn't feel earned due to the previous books failing to invest most readers into Sol's character. When Hollyleaf even admits she still feels like she can trust her life with him, despite everything he's done, it feels like it comes out of nowhere and neither is there a payoff. It's a real missed opportunity for Sol not to know about Hollyleaf killing Ashfur or the three being Half-clan.

When his strange amount of knowledge is written off, as Midnight just telling him everything, it feels too convenient and really washing down his character, making him feel less intimidating. Not to mention, it makes Midnight's character also look bad in the process, seemly telling this random cat everything for no good reason. It gets worse when Sol's backstory is revealed as; random kittypet, abandoned by his mother because she couldn't look after

him. We have seen this 'parent(s) abandoning their children' backstory for too many villains already: Tigerstar, Brokenstar, Darktail etc. And we've seen so many kittypets, rogues, loners etc. it makes me want to see a group of cats, to help expand the world even more and reminding us that the Clans don't make up the entire universe. The only other major unique group is the Tribe, who still share their ancestors with the Clans.

Characters feel stupider for falling for Sol's plainly obvious manipulation, with Blackstar trusting him for seemly no reason and Windclan and the tunnels, despite Sol being a well-established threat by then. Every time Sol appears, he never really makes an impact, never causing any deaths or anything. Each time he reappears in the Clan territories it's predictable, almost a cycle: Sends most of his time moping about the borders, gets lead to Thunderclan's camp, tries to manipulate someone but failed at it and gets chased off for the 3rd time in a row. Turning him from a possibly threatening presence to no more than annoying pest. He's meant to be a charming narcissist, he should steal whatever scene he's in. He's not even slightly funny or creepily charming.

Then his character just seemed to be forgotten, half-way through omen of the Stars, never to be seen again, making it feel like a waste of time. Sol never accomplished anything or had any lasting effects on the series. Take him out and not much is lost. It's a real shame too, as we never saw villain like him before. It was a refreshing break from all power-hunger tyrants like Tigerstar and Hawkfrost. He had such wasted character potential.

My version:

His personality will mainly be kept intact, with having a lazy, laidback and 'goofy' persona, but coming off as creepy, mysterious and cowardly once his true colours start to show, not scared to overstep social boardies if he considers it necessary. He's also somewhat childish, holding grudges against cats for pretty reasons. Though unlike the canon Sol, the version tends to be more sarcastic, liking to toy with others.

He's a terrible fight, preferring not to get his paws dirty, getting others to do it for him whenever possible. Has a silver tongue, able to worm into the way in favorable positions, usually acting aloof to seem innocent. Only cares for himself, having no sense of honor/ loyalty, willing to use cheap tricks to get the upper hand. Also willing to backstab or abandon almost anyone. He's master of manipulation, able to be patient if it gets the goal he wants. But one the rare occasion Sol loses control, he'll be prawn to panicking slightly, not use to not being in control all the time. He likes to stick to tight plans/goals but can be more flexible if he's forced to. Rarely he shows genuine emotions, usually only being a brief flash in the eyes.

I would keep with the concept of a "Travelers", intruding a new group of cats called this. They're a small group of pacifists, with no ranks, treating everyone in their group equally, acting more like a large family. Anyone is easily able to join and can leave whenever they wish. They come from many different backgrounds, have many different forms of names. They travel around the world, seeking out different cat cultures for knowledge. Unlike most of his group, Sol went against the tradition of joining the group willing, instead of being born into it.

However, this was where Sol differs. Where the rest of his group meant no harm to anyone, Sol let the fact he was smarter than most get to his head, giving him a superior-complex. He's especially interested in spirits and the afterlives, knowing the majority of his existence would be sent in death than life. After finding out about of 'fading away', he becomes obsessed with keeping his afterlife to go on for as long as possible. However, he feels restricted by his group pacifist ways, so he leaves the Travelers. He goes from one large group to the other, doing horrible things, to try and get cats to remember him. But nothing too terrible, that's he'll be exiled instead of killed. And the cycle continues.

He first hears of the Four Clans after joining Skyclan, wanting to target them due being a large group and having powerful spiritual activity. But he was in no rush, so makes it his next destination after he's done with Skyclan. After learning about Whispering Cave

(Skyclan version of Moonstone), he becomes curious, convincing Echosong to take him. While in Starclan, Skyclan ancestors tell Echosong about the Power of three prophecy, with Sol overhearing it. This accelerates Sol's plans. As with those cats on his side, he could be unstoppable. So he kidnaps Leafstar's kits, to get himself purposefully exiled from Skyclan and heads for the Lake.

Now, this is where Firestar's constant acceptance of outsiders comes in handy. As to the reader, Sol would just another kittypet/loner like Millie and Dasiy. Not too much focus is put on him at first, he's just treated like another background character, not a villain. This is where Sol slowly gets more and more involved with the three's lives, so slowly, the reader doesn't really notice it. Also, he shows some interest in Cinderheart for being a reincarnation. He manipulates the three by appealing to/worsening their delusions and constantly agreeing with them.

For Jaypaw: since Sol can't really fight, he becomes a Medicine cat helper, where he uses this to get close to Jaypaw. Using Leafpool and Jaypaw's distant connection to his advantage, Sol fills the role of a mentor for Jaypaw, making him finally feel appreciated as someone sees him for himself and not his blindness. There would be funny scenes where Sol and Jaypaw are simply throwing rude remarks at each other, Leafpool groaning in the Background.

For Hollypaw: He gets close to her by appealing to her dedication to the Warrior Code, pretending he doesn't understand it as a loner and getting Hollypaw to teach him about it. Which she's more then happy to do. Also, commenting how she's the only one who seems to follow the Warrior Code in a codeless era. An example of this: is when Millie refuses to get a warrior name and Hollypaw is annoyed at it, Sol agrees with her, commenting that's she's right to point out it. Even suggesting, that if she becomes leader, she could amend the Warrior Code to include this. Promising her that if she achieved this, he'd change his name.

For Lionpaw: In this version, Lionpaw is obsessed with living up to Brambleclaw's and Firestar's legacies, getting a slight inferiority complex from it. A lot of his self-worth comes from the need to be the best at everything, but when his weaker littermates started to overtake him in smarts and leadership, he begins to question

himself. Which is why he's so obsessed with fighting, as it's the only thing he still has over his siblings, desperate to not let Hollypaw to overtake him in that as well. He becomes reckless in the effect of impressing his Clanmates. But unlike the other cats, who he just gets in trouble with, Sol applauds Lionpaw on his 'brave acts'. And when Lionpaw accidentally slips he's training the Dark Forest, Sol encourages him to continue with it, pointing out that Tigerstar and Hawkfrost are his 'kin' and he'd allow him to become the most powerful warrior in the forest. Due to spending alot of time also spying on the Three, Sol quickly discovers the tunnels Lionpaw sneaks into. However decides to keep it secret for now, as he could have a use for it later.

For Squirrelflight and Brambleclaw: In order to help him get closer to the three, he also gets close to the parents. He pretends to be a former kittypet, to get closer to Squirrelflight, being half-kittypet herself. And 'admires' Brambleclaw's loyalty to his Clan despite his father, creating a fake story that he had a 'similar experience with his own mother, who wanted him to become a cold-blooded rogue'. He also keeps a close eye on Ashfur, seeing it as a possible exploit for future use.

This is where he's creepiness comes in, slowly he oversteps his boundaries, becoming a constant part of the three's lives: always making sure he was on the same patrol as them and asking how they're day was. Constantly, he's described like a snake, crawling around and lurking in the shadows. Then when Sol's displays a strange amount of knowledge of Starclan for a 'rogue', this where the reader could start to suspect him. By this point, he has the three under his every whim, convincing they're all special. When they do start to develop their powers, this is when he reveals the prophecy to them, revealing to them; he comes from a faraway Clan, called Skyclan, their grandfather set up himself and 'was sent by Starclan to guild them with their powers'.

By this point, Sol becomes over-confident. He can't help himself but dabble into the other Clans, becoming overly familiar with them. His loyalty in the air. How could he stop himself? There were so many cats that could remember him. Ironically, Sol ended up doing

too good of a job worsening the Three's deletions, starting to lose control of them. Their powers had gone to their young heads, filling them with self-rightness, acting as an independent rogue like a group. When Sol attempts to destabilize Windclan, (Shadowclan will be left alone for once) by sparking up the old Mudclaw and Onestar situation by pointing out, Onestar was being the terrible leader that Tallstar feared Mudclaw would become. Sol helps manipulate Breezepaw, claiming his father is a Onestar's supporter while his mother is a Mudclaw's supporter, pressuring him to choose a side.

However, due to Lionpaw's personal connection to Windclan through Heatherpaw, he convinces his siblings to stop the war. The three end up fixing the problem Sol was trying to create, when they faked a Starclan omen, claiming that the 'forest would fall' if Windclan broke out into another civil war. Obviously, Sol was irritated, claiming the three shouldn't get involved with other Clan's business. But the three feel betrayed as well, jealous that Sol wasn't giving them as much as attention like he promised.

To force the three to listen to him, he sets up a large battle between all four Clan (the one in Eclipse), by spreading rumors at Gatherings and stealing prey from one territory and dumping it on another. Also revealing the tunnels' existence to the other Clans. During the battle, knowing Lionpaw's powerful fighting skills, Sol travels around with him in the battle, claiming he needs protecting due to his poor fighting skills (Which is actually true). To test Lionpaw, Sol purposefully seeks out Heatherpaw. Sol lies to Lionpaw that it was Heatherpaw who revealed the secret, claiming she was a traitor. In a fit of rage, Lionpaw lashes out at her with too much force, accidentally kills Heatherpaw.

Now confused and angrier then ever, Lionpaw turns on Sol. But Sol warns him, saying he'll regret attacking him and when Lionpaw asks why, something remarkable happens. The Sun starts turning black. Using his quick thinking, Sol claims that's he the one making the Sun disappear and that the three ain't the only ones with powers. Terrified of Sol's 'powers', Lionpaw runs away.

After the battle, the three confront Sol about this, Hollypaw especially furious, that he would break the warrior code like that.

Sol blackmails the three that if they don't do as he says, he'll cause the Sun to disappear permanently. Unknown to him, Jaypaw was reading his mind, finally realizing everything he'd told them was a lie. That night after they'd return to camp, Jaypaw told his siblings his findings and come up with a plan. The next night was a gathering and the three revealed that Sol had set up the massive battle. Sol is then banished in front of the entire gathering, being completely exposed and his plans becoming ruined. Furious that he still didn't have the three under his control, he claims he'll be targeting the Tribe of Rushing Water next, forcing Thunderclan to keep him in camp as a prisoner.

There, he manipulates Ashfur, convincing him the three deserved to die after what Squirrelflight had done to him. During the fire, Sol manages to escape the fire with the rest of Thunderclan, not being present for the famous Fire scene. But he didn't need physically be there, to know Ashfur had tried it, it was written all over their faces. He then gets the gullible Ashfur to tell him about the three being not being Squirrelflight's. And then Sol struck gold, Ashfur's body being found in a stream, knowing it could only be the three or someone connected to them. Still a prisoner, Sol starts asking about the circumstances of the three's birth, getting important details: Leafpool had been present at the Squirrelflight's 'birth' and that just before, Leafpool had run away with Crowfeather. Eventually, he put it together, Leafpool and Crowfeather were the three's parents.

Next, Sol figures out Hollyleaf specifically killed Ashfur from her body language alone, always subtly flinching whenever his name is mentioned. Sol gets Lionblaze and Hollyleaf to help him escape camp on a specific night, by promising he'd tell them who their parents were if they did. Going to the border, he reveals he knows Hollyleaf killed Ashfur and that they're half-clan, claiming someone will find out soon and their exile would be imminent. Going further on to say, that after the murder of Ashfur and Heatherpaw, Starclan planned to send them to the Dark Forest. So Sol offers for them to leave with him now peacefully, claiming it's the only way for them to escape that fate.

But Hollyleaf argues that wasn't what they agreed, demanding he'd tell them who their parents were. But Sol assures her that doesn't

matter anymore, saying that cats like them shouldn't be dragged down by the burden of borders, rules, and family. Staying in the Clans, limits their potential. Reinforcing his offer again, he can give them a life much more fulfilling than any Clan life if they leave with him now.

Disgusted Sol would insult the Clans like that, Hollyleaf is about to kill him but he makes her stop by questioning if she'll break the warrior code further. Not wanting Hollyleaf to take the burden of a second murder, Lionblaze gives chase to kill Sol himself. But Sol has it planned out, as it's the same time of the Half-moon. So Sol takes shelter at the Moonpool while the Medicine cats sleep there, knowing the honor-driven Hollyleaf won't let Lionblaze kill him on such sacred ground. He smirks to himself.

However, Sol underestimates the Medicine cats. While they still waking up, Sol stands over Jayfeather, threatening to snap his neck if they come any closer. They're not happy to see him. Using his powers, Jayfeather places a message in his siblings' minds, who are still watching from afar, that he has everything softed. They decide to trust their brother and back off. While still Sol's prisoner, Jayfeather throws dust into his open eyes, causing him to stagger back, freeing the blind tom. With an opening the Medicine cats approach. As a last resort, Sol argues they can't hurt him due to their code but at this moment, they don't care. Jayfeather with mocking Sol, asking why he's not blocking out the moon right now. Sol is killed by the Medicine cats, with Jayfeather giving the killing bite, his blood turning the moonpool red. Oh, the irony.

However, this isn't the end of Sol. Starclan makes the mistake of sending Sol to the Dark Forest. Which deeply troubles Sol, dying too early and in the wrong place, ruining his plans of a long happy afterlife. His instant response after going to the Dark Forest is visiting Breezepelt in a dream, telling him that the three were is his half-siblings. Breezepelt ends revealing this information at the next gathering. However, Hollyleaf was able to avoid exile by revealing Ashfur's former crimes, Thunderclan considering it self-defense.

Sol knew things about the afterlives that very few others did, thanks to his travels. The fact that all the 'Sky afterlives', including Starclan

and Dark Forest are the just reflections of the 'collective consciousness' of the Living Cats. The livings' thoughts, become the dead's reality. This was the reason why spirits faded after they're completely forgotten about by the current generation. It was a long shot, but if Sol could somehow convince enough living Clan cats that Starclan/Dark Forest were different to the currently conceived notion, then he could cause the very spirit world around him to change. Then maybe through that, he could make the Dark Forest lose its ability to trap the souls of its residents in which he could make his escape.

However, the other Dark forest wanted to take advantage of Sol's spiritual knowledge for their own goals. Forcing him to help them overcome the tricky of the Dark Forest; allowing them to find each other and visiting dreams of trainees more regardlessly. Also, helping to pick out weak-minded cats who could become trainees, including Breezepelt. To convince the trainees into training, Sol manipulates the Medicine cat, Kestrileflight. Through him, he falsely preaches to all the Clans that Starclan has already decided/'destined' the afterlife for every cat from birth, no matter what they do. Blaming Brokenstar and Tigerstar on Starclan, which causes some Clan members mistrust their spiritual guardians. So according to him, anyone who is 'destined to go to the Dark Forest', will go there regardless if they're innocent or not. So uses this to win the trainees over, using the logic, 'Since you're going to end up Dark Forest anyway, why not get revenge while you still can?'.

Due to the Dark Forest becoming such common knowledge and the new mistrust of Starclan among the living cats, it allowed a shift in power that never happened. For the first ever, the Dark Forest had more influence, being able to visit dreams more and more regularly. Fear of Dark Forest Trainees going rapid, some calling for them to be witch hunted. To stop the Clans breaking down, the three were forced to publicly reveal themselves, to give them a beacon of hope. There were mixed reactions, but in the end, the Clans were desperate, so put their faith into the young cats.

Seeing their mistake, Starclan makes a deal with the desperate Sol, if he helps them, they'll give him a second chance at life. When the three are looking for the fourth cat, they are given this prophecy,

"You will find them, in a place hidden from sun and moon. A rouge amoung rouges. A traitor among traitors. They will destroy the destruction and peace will settle among the ruins." It's then discovered that Sol is the fourth cat. Forcing the Three to reluctantly work with Sol, despite how much they hate it.

He becomes a double agent, for the Dark Forest and Starclan. Lionblaze continues his training in the Dark Forest, acting as a spy, working with Sol. Due to not being able to fight, the Dark Forest cats are constantly questioning why they're keeping him around. So Sol has use all his manipulation skill and sharp tongue to constantly come up with excuses on why they need him alive. Which is especially difficult, dealing with other intelligent like Mapleshade and Tigerstar, pushing Sol to his limits.

This causes Sol to break down, showing an emotional side of him we've never seen before, his cowardice really showing through. He wants to give up on serval occasional, making Hollyleaf, who aware of all his tricks by now, to constantly put him back in his place and force him on. Switching their roles, Hollyleaf the one in control now. She has high expectations for the cats around her and he's no different. She won't tolerate Sol's whining, especially since Sol is needed to win against the Dark Forest.

While strolling for time, Sol employs cats such as Clawface, who feel guilty for their crimes, promising if they act as his secret bodyguards, he claims 'he can get them into Starclan's ranks'. When the Dark Forest residents are satisfied with the amounts of trainees, Sol can afford to slip away alone more often, which is when he sets his secret plan in motion - To convince enough living Clan cats that the Dark Forest/Starclan aren't what they thought they were, in order to phyically alter them.

Due to not being able to enter Starclan, Sol finds himself sending more and more time on the border between the two afterlives, inside a large fog barrier. In order to visit someone dreams, they must have no mental barriers, by either not being aware of the spirit or willingly allowing them to visit. So since everyone knew who Sol was, mosts Clan cat had mental defends against him. So Sol visited the Three's dreams, telling them of the extreme importance of him being able to talk to all the living Clan cats, even if he was

dead. Knowing his importance in the prophecy, they hesitantly go along with his plan. By now, the Three's powers were public knowledge, so Sol knew they were respected and would be listened to. So in the physical world, they explained at the Gathering, that Sol needed to visit all their dreams, so when they went to sleep on that night, they needed to willingly allow Sol in.

That night, serval Clan cats reluctantly followed suit, lowering their mental barriers. Then, they found themselves in the fog barrier, Sol there to greet them all, apologizing to them all about his crimes while alive, promising he was only here to save them from the Dark Forest. Afterwards, the cats who attended were able to confirm to their clanmates, that Sol did nothing to harm them.

This led to more allowing their mental defences to go down, soon the numbers at the meetings growing. This was the start of a long chain of meetings, where Sol would tell the Living cats the 'truth' of their spiritual ancestors. Which in reality, he was making up everything. He told them; 'That in ancient times, that the Clans' were meant to have one fair afterlife. Where all cats would walk through a fog realm; to live through all the emotions, both positive and negative they made others experience, where eventually their souls would be pure enough to move onto a Starry paradise. However, Starclan abandoned those plans, some members wanting to continue getting away with their crimes, scot-free. Using the fog border as evidence, claiming it was the only fragment left of this once planned afterlife.'

To test his theory of the afterlives being based on 'collective consciousness of the living', at the end of one of the meetings, Sol subtly slipped in, 'I'll see you all again at the Gathering stone', despite there being no rock. However, low and behold, at the next dream gathering, the large stone had appeared. He'd been correct. If he convinced enough Clan cats that their afterlives should be something else, that's exactly what it'd become.

Up until this point, the Three hadn't understood what he'd been doing, however, it was starting to become obvious to Jayfeather. Despite knowing Sol was only doing it for his own selfish gain, he still agreed that it was time for Starclan to change, so allowed Sol to carry on. With Jayfeather explaining it to his siblings and

convincing this was for the greater good. With Hollyleaf just barely agreeing. Though still warning she'd make Sol fade away if he took a signal step out of line. With Sol getting the message loud and clear, being very careful with each move he took.

Then, carrying on with the lies, Sol claimed that was still a way to 'activate this ancient plan' - That every full moon, this stone within the fog, would begin to glow. Then if four living cats from all the four Clans were to touch it simultaneously, the barrier Fog would begin to expand, turning Starclan and Dark Forest alike, into this 'fair afterlife'. When the Final Battle come along, Sol specifically planned for it to be on the night of the Full Moon, in order to try and make it even more convincing this ceremony was real. As if not enough Clan cats didn't believe it, it wouldn't work.

In my version; Instead of taking place at the Lake, the Great battle will take place in the Dark Forest and Starclan. Each Dark Forest cat would visit their chosen individual's dreams they hated and have a one on one battle with them in an isolated clearing, etc. Firestar vs Tigerstar, to make it a lot more personal. For those Dark forest cats with no one living they'd like to kill, they'd team up with a trainee, to make sure they stay loyal and killed their chosen cat, for example, Brokenstar making sure Breezepelt killed Crowfeather.

Once, their chosen cat(s) are killed, they'd go off to help their fellow residents. So it basically the Dark Forest's planned to visit every cats' dreams individually, slowly killing the Clan cats off in one long night. With those one-on-one fights, they would have the advantage, with a Dark Forest being trained better than any Clan cat. But Sol knew the location where every battle would take place, so ran to each spot. The previous nights, Sol had tirelessly visited every Clan cat, giving them clear intrusions: Once they saw him, stop fighting their opposites and follow him as he would guide them to the Starclan border, where all of Starclan would be waiting.

With the help of the Three and other traitorous Dark Forest like Clawface, Sol rounded up as many cats as possible. Jayfeather would try to detect where everyone was with his mind powers. Hollyleaf would sneak around, scouting the area without being detected. And Lionblaze acted as Sol's bodyguard, effortlessly

ripping any Dark Forest cat to screeds if they figured out what Sol was doing and tried to kill him. Sadly, he couldn't make it to everyone in time, but he managed to save the majority of cats, leading them safely to Starclan.

After the three's jobs are done, they head to the border, helping the Starclan warriors fight off the Dark Forest ones. The three alone are able to cause matter damage: Jayfeather freezing cats with fear by bringing their most horrid memories, leaving the open to attack. Hollyleaf able to do surprise attack after surprise, no able to chase after her as she disappearing into the undergrowth again. And Lionblaze- he switches on his battle rage, and Starclan help whatever Dark Forest warrior he got his claws on.

Before Firestar can reach the border, Tigerstar manages to drag him away from the major fight, into an isolated clearing. Sol sees this and heads after them. He's just in time to see, Tigerstar had already taken Firestar's last life, waiting for Firestar's spirit to be exposed, so he cause his spirit to fade away for ever. Sol rushed forward, leaping at him. Luckily for Sol, Tigerstar had already been deeply wounded earlier in the battle, so all it took was a slash to the throat and Tigerstar's spirit faded away. After saving Firestar, Sol lead Firestar's spirit safely to Starclan.

Once enough Clan cats are gathered safely in Starclan, Sol yowls for them to follow him to the Ancient Stone within the fog border, reminding them of the 'ceremony'. Some refuse to go, but the majority hesitantly, wanting to see a change after losing their hope in Starclan.

And there, when they arrive, the Stone was indeed glowing. Without Sol even needing to give the order, the Clan Cats imminently crowded round the glowing ord, trying to reach it. With the Swirling Mist around them starting to shift and change in ways, it had never before. Despite it being all made up, Sol's words had made Clan cats believe it the ceremony would work. They wanted it to work. So that's exactly what happened, the spirit world bending to the Livings' will. By now, confused Starclan and Dark Forest cats had caught up, demanding to know what was going on. But it was already too late, as the Fog began to expand, beginning to the long

process of consuming both Starclan and the Dark Forest, ready for the new afterlife.

The crowds of cats, both dead and alive, were starting to panic trying to retreat to their respected territories. The Living disappeared one by one as their spirits returned to their waking bodies in the physical world. Yet it was hopeless for the dead, as soon they'd all be trapped, about the start the long process of their purification. The only ones left at the Stone; were the three, Sol and a few select Starclan cats. Among them, Yellowfang steps forwards, ordering to know what Sol had done. With him calmly replying he'd done what they agreed, saved the Clans, asking for his reward of reincarnation.

Yet Yellowfang refused, claiming that wasn't the deal at all. Surprisingly, the Three start taking Sol's side, now seeing the unfairness of the current system. Jayfeather challenging Yellowfang by reminding her of her own crimes, of lying to her Clan and killing her son, questioning why she should get away those crimes, while others are main to suffer for eternity for theirs. Each siblings admitting themselves, they're all murderers.

With the Fog fast enclosing in on them, Sol then threatens Yellowfang, saying that if they allowed him to remain as a spirit; he could still convince the Clan cats to turn the new afterlife into something much worse, then it already is. Or, turn him into a harmless kit again.

The choose was obvious.

Slowly, Yellowfang steps forward, placing her nose to Sol's, as he then disappears in a flash of light. Just before the Three wake up, they see the remaining Starclan cats are swallowed up by the fog. Yellowfang's final words, admitting it will be a painful process for everyone, but at least they'll all eventually get to paradise - Announcing she couldn't wait to see her son as the caring tom he was always meant to be.

As the last of the Clan cats wake up, it's just past dawn. With some refusing to sleep for days afterwards, scared what sleep could bring them. However, nothing happened, no one visiting their dreams.

Starclan seemingly had fallen silent. As soon as it turned the next half moon, the Medicine cats rushed to Moonpool, to see what had become of Starclan. What they found was a large starry purple void, similar to Starclan, but somehow even more beautiful. The only problem it was empty, no one was there to greet them. No spirit purified enough, to make it through the fog realm yet.

The news shock the Four Clans to their core. For at least awhile, they'd have no one to gild them. And what made it even worse for the Three specifically, it turned out Squirrelflight was pregnant, it was obvious who one of those kits would be. Now Sol had truly become kin of Firestar's kin, the cat that had killed Starclan.

Maybe Sol's reincarnation being Alderheart himself. Going further with the reincarnation idea, he would probably be a tortoiseshell again but to keep some Alderheart's old design, the only white he would have is his tail tip, the rest being black and ginger. And maybe his new name could be something contributing to the light and dark like: Glowshade, Dusklight etc.

It could give him a reason for his anxiety and add extra layers to his character. He doesn't understand why cats treat him different. They desperately try to treat Sol's reincarnate as his own person out of respect of the leader and deputy but can't help but see Sol. His parents debate constantly on whether they should tell him. Bramblestar is able to relate Alderheart due to being looked at the same way for being Tigerstar's son and convinces himself Alderheart got his colouring from Tawnypelt, not Sol. The three find it very awkward that Sol is basically their brother/cousin now, but to learn to live with it. Alderheart has a close friendship with Lionblaze's mate, Cinderheart, due to her being a reincarnation as well, she knows what's he's going through, even if he doesn't know it yet.

With the older generations completely lost without their spiritual ancestors, they fail to control the current apprentice become faithless and rebellious. Alderheart a bit of a trickster, but unlike Sol, he only does it for harmless jokes, still very self-aware if he's hurting anyone. Maybe due to his poor fighting skill, he's forced to use his intelligence to trick others, but his morals tell him not to,

even against cats like the Kin.

The themes of Skyclan would also come fall circle. As Alderheart's former self-had been apart of Skyclan, explaining his emotional connection to them and wishing to stay at the side of the lake. It would also explain Alderheart seemly lack of interest in she-cats, as Sol himself wasn't interested in having a mate and kits. As a loner she-cat named Speckle, who lives in the twoleg during Sunrise, claimed she wanted Sol to be the father of her kits but he didn't show any interest.

Snowkit/Tuft Alternate Theory

So I've seen this theory being kicked around the fandom for quite some time, and I have to say, I like the idea of Snowkit being Snowtuft but the original theory's idea on how he gets to that point, doesn't make any sense. So I'm here to analyze the old theory and propose a new one I think could work.

Basic theory:

After Snowkit is sent to Starclan, he's lured into the Dark Forest, which is where he becomes Snowtuft.

(There are serval alternatives details to this theory like: Mapleshade being the one to lure him in, he joined the Dark Forest becuase he felt Starclan/Thunderclan had betrayed him by letting him die etc. but those details are irrelevant)

Or.

Hawk carried Snowkit too far from the Forest/'Starclan's skies', so accidentally ended up in the Dark Forest.

(Since so little is established about the supernatural forces in the series, it's not an impossibility it may work like this. Physical geography has shown to effect sprits before. Such as Starclan needing to "travel" with the Clans to the Lake. Or Fallen Leaves remaining trapped in the Tunnels after he died.)

Counter-arguments:

"Spirits can't age any older then they were in life." - As most of you know, Cats can change their age in Starclan to when they were happiest, for example: Bluestar going back into her prime as a young warrior and Yellowfang remaining older for her time in Thunderclan. There's this mentality in the fandom, that cats can only be an age they reached in life. So cats like Snowkit and Mosskit can't become adults in Starclan, even if they wanted to as they died as kits.

However, this isn't directly true, as, in Code of the Clans, there are those three ancient Windclan kits: Smallkit, Wolfkit, and Runningkit, who drowned in the Gorge River after sneaking out of camp. But even though they died as kits, they still become adults in Starclan and given their names if they'd lived; Smallstar, Wolfheart, and Runningstorm. However, it was revealed by Vicky that this was a 'special case' and most kits keep their kit age/names. Also, it was mentioned in the book that those kits' deaths 'weren't suppose to happen' which may explain why they were treated differently. As during Mosskit's death, Snowfur's spirit claims 'it's her time', suggesting Starclan has a detailed and mainly accurate idea of when cats' deaths are meant to take place. So if Snowkit's died like he was 'destined to', he wouldn't have become an adult. Which is very likely, considering cases like Smallstar, are extremely rare, only happening once in the Clan's history to our knowledge.

So since Snowkit would have been a kit in Starclan if he was killed by the Hawk, it brings up the question: Why would the Dark Forest want a kit to join them? A kit would border-line useless. They wouldn't be able to fight fully grown cats and they couldn't even be used as a punching bag to demonstrate moves in a Training session, being too easily killed. The Dark Forest cats are already annoyed by Darkstripe enough becuase he acts like a kit, so just imagine if they had an actual kit, they'd be no more then whining pests. Snowtuft

has been shown to fight fully grown cats during the Great Battle. And even if he somehow still was a kit, it would of been noted by Ivypool. And him being described as 'small' wouldn't count, as a grown tom who's just small is still hugely different to a kit.

"**Snowkit is deaf, Snowtuft isn't." -** There are four options here:

1) Snowkit was spent to Starclan first, which is where his deafness was healed. Then a hearing Snowkit went to the Dark Forest, where he becomes Snowtuft.

2) But if he was sent to the Dark Forest straight away for whatever reason, it's possible that the Dark Forest has a weaker version of Starclan's healing abilities. As Brokenstar died blind, however, there's no mention of this when he was in the Dark Forest. This may make sense as the Dark Forest is intended to be a place of punishment, where cats are forced to walk aimlessly in isolation until they fade away. (Though they somehow managed to overcome this.) So the Dark Forest for a regular cat is bad enough, however for a cat which is blind/paralyzed/etc. especially when they weren't born with it, would even worse. They're being punished more than other residents, and Starclan may consider this unnecessarily cruel, especially if their crimes are lesser then other cats'. So heals the worst injuries or disabilities, so everyone is on equal footing.

Some may argue that Brokenstar was indeed blind but it 'simply was never mentioned' but I would find that highly unlikely. As a cat being blind is a
very noticeable detail. When Blind cats in the series are being described by others like Rock and Jayfeather, their blindness is brought up constantly. So I doubt Brokenstar would be any different. If Ivypool is observant enough to make note of Snowtuft's horrible scar, then she would of mentioned Brokenstar's scared blinded eyes are some point as well.

3) He just so well-adapted to his deafness, no one really notices it. Even people born deaf are still able to learn to lip-read and even talk, so it's possible Snowtuft can do the same. Jayfeather is blind

but is still able to swim and travel around a large territory on a daily basis unaided. So there's no reason why Snowkit/tuft wouldn't be able to adapt to his disability, especially since he was born with it. Even as a kit, Snowkit was still able to speak, saying "S'all right". So with some patience, this would only get better. Also, Snowtuft rarely speaks and when he does, it always in response to someone addressing to him directly, this may be because he's deaf and so only talks when he needs to. Doing things such as saying one-liners/ muttering to himself, would be rather pointless if he can't hear them.

4) Though we don't the technicalities of it and never will, it's safe to say spirit biology is not the same as physical living bodies. Confirmed since Dark Forest and Starclan members don't need to sleep or eat to survive. So even if a cat was blind/deaf due to physical disabilities while they were alive, doesn't mean they will have the same problem as a spirit. So in short, just because a living Snowkit/Tuft was deaf, doesn't mean his spirit would be.

"Snowkit has blue eyes, while Snowtuft has green eyes." - Now, this mainly comes from the comment section of WarriorUnlimited's video on the topic, in which, they use and . And yes, they indeed have different eye colours in those artworks. However I'd like to point out, they are simply fan artworks, who ain't canon in any way. Snowtuft's eye colour is never mentioned in the Books at all. This Snowtuft's official design on the Wiki, gathered from the books themselves: "a small, skinny, white tom with a long scar snaking from his belly to the tip of his ear.". And as you can see, no mention of eye colour. Just by searching up Snowtuft on google images, you'll see he's drawn with a wide range of eyes colours, all the way from: Blue, Yellow, Amber, and Green. If you don't believe me; go to the Snowtuft's Wiki page yourself, click on the numbers and it'll take you to a list of the references used, with some of them being Book titles and even their pages numbers. Find a book you have, go to that specific book page and you'll see yourself if the references the Wiki uses are valid.

Eye colour alone isn't even a valid way of identifying a character,

considering for how inconsistent the Erins are with the colours of specific details like eye and collar colours. Prime examples being Dovewing's eye colour and Scourge's collar colour. (Do ***not*** get into a debate about this, it's just a waste of everyone's time. There are multiple examples of either colour being used, so no side is right or wrong, it's just personal choice on which one to headcanon.)

"**Snowtuft is a Windclan cat.**" -This is just a rumour. I've never seen a screenshot of any of the Erins confirming this. And if this quote existed, it would have appeared on the Warriors Wiki by now. Even if Snowtuft was from Windclan, it doesn't stop him being Snowkit, as he could have simply joined Windclan later on if he survived the Hawk attack.

"**He could of gotten his scar from the Hawk.**" - People seem to think that it's unknown how Snowtuft's got his famous scar. But the thing is, we do know, we even got to read it as it happened: In Fading Echoes, 'Spottedleaf and Jayfeather are sneaking around the Dark Forest, when they come across a training session, taught by Hawkfrost. Snowtuft is there but is watching with half-closed eyes, so Hawkfrost shouts at him if he's ready to learn, which Snowtuft replies, that's why he's there. Hawkfrost then pinned Snowtuft down, ordering Shredtail to rip his belly open. Spottedleaf and Jayfeather leave before they can see what happens next, only hearing Snowtuft's screams of pain.'

It's possible that Snowkit/tuft did get a scar from the hawk when he was young, but it healed and become faded. Then during in the training season, when Hawkfrost orders Shrewtail to rip open Snowtuft's belly, Shredtail sees the faded scar Snowtuft got as a kit and uses it as a "guild-line" because that area would be naturally weaker, re-opening the old wound. After that event, the scar isn't able to heal properly and becomes much worse then before. Which why Snowtuft's scar is given so much attention as a pose to all the other Dark Forest cats' scars, as it's much worse to than others due to being a reopened wound.

Alternate Theory:

So I've heard another Headcannon that Snowkit was dropped by the Hawk and become a kittypet, and I think this could be used for the Snowkit/tuft theory. So instead of Snowkit going to Starclan and being lured into the Dark Forest, he survives the Hawk attack, this can happen multiple ways: He's saved by another cat(s) leaping onto the Hawk and dragging to the ground, the Hawk getting caught in a tree/wires, the Hawk being shot by a Twoleg hunter etc.

Then he's found by a Twoleg and taken to a vet. This is where he becomes a kittypet and gets used to his deafness, learning to lip-read and talk properly. He then decides to leave and return to the Clans again. However, he doesn't remember which Clan is his birth-Clan possibly because: he got mild-amnesia after being dropped, was too young when he was taken by the hawk to form proper memories of Thunderclan, could never learn Thunderclan's name due to not being able to lip-read at the time etc.

There's even a convenient time gap when this could of happened between: Darkest Hour and Midnight, 18 moons in total. Which is more than enough time for Snowtuft to return, commit his crimes to earn his place in the Dark forest then disappear again. (Which would either be death or exile.) The only requirement being he must have died by Omen of the Stars. The other book in this time gap is Firestar's Quest, which a large majority portion takes place in Skyclan's far away Territory. So Snowkit may have had the chance to rejoin the Clans during this time without it being noted by Firestar.

Option 1:

So he ends up joining up one the Clans that's not Thunderclan, (Which is where he could join Windclan) which is where he becomes Snowtuft.

(It's the most unlikely to be Thunderclan, as it would of been noted at some point by specially Firestar or Brambleclaw - that Snowkit had survived the hawk attack and had returned, even if was very briefly.)

Option 2:

He's rejected by the Clans, so remains a rouge and names himself, Snowtuft.

After this, it's impossible to say what he did to be sent to the Dark Forest. Though, we can make an educated guess. Looking at the way he acts in the Dark Forest, constantly being used as the punching bag and hiding away from the other Dark Forests, it clear that he's not your typical Dark Forest cat, so it's likely that his crimes aren't anything similar to other villain's crimes we're read about. He doesn't seem like the type of cat to do crimes independently, so I'd say he's somewhat similar to Darkstripe, being a pawn in someone's else schemes.

Appledusk Defence

I'll quickly debunk a few common misconceptions, before getting into the main article:

1) Appledusk never called Flowerpaw stupid for trying to save her mentor. This is mixed up with the Quote where Appledusk calls the entire Sunningrocks battle, including his own Clan, 'Mousebrained'. Appledusk never mentioned Flowerpaw by name once: "But Sunningrocks has always made our Clans a little mouse-brained." - Chapter 1.

2) Darkstar ordered a respectful burial for the Kits: "The loss of any

kits is a loss to all of us." [...] "Rainfall, help Splashfoot and Eeltail to bury these kits. The accident of their birth is not their fault. They may lie in peace in our territory now.". There's nothing unusual about it. Close family of the dead cat don't bury them, which is why neither Mapleshade or Appledusk did it. A Vigil is only held for cats close to the deceased. The Kits never officially joined Riverclan, they were strangers. As the only Riverclan cat effected and an exposed traitor, Appledusk had no right to demand the rest of Riverclan to hold a Vigil.

3) Appledusk isn't this heartless tom who doesn't care about his kits at all, like so many like to portray him as. There are many quotes disproving this, that I'll get more into detil with down below: "*I am so proud of you.",* "I'm going to be a father. Incredible.", "But our kits are too precious", "*Thank StarClan you didn't get hurt in the battle"* etc.

Appledusk cared about all his Kits/Mates:

The interpretation that Appledusk is a kind of sociopath, who's action/speech in an elaborate facade, is unsupported fan speculation. As a 10 Chapter Novella, which is already rushed and overly-cramped, the author doesn't have time to imply Appledusk was lying the whole time. If this was the case, it would addressed in the book as it would be an important plot-line. As a Kid's book, it wouldn't have such a "read between the lines" approach to Appledusk's character, requiring rereads and close analysis. For example, when Appledusk said Birchface's death was an accident - It was an accident. The author needs to establish this detail quickly before moving on, they don't want the Reader to think the character lying. Appledusk's personality consistent with every character he interacts with: His mates, apprentice and Leader - Never once displaying sociopathic traits of being able to switch facades. So his dialogue/actions are genuine and valid evidence.

Appledusk's affections towards Mapleshade before he even discovered about the kits. Proving Appledusk loved Mapleshade, for Mapleshade and not some of other malicious motive involving kits:

"Appledusk took a step closer and lowered his head until his muzzle brushed the tip of Mapleshade's ear." [...] "Mapleshade leaned forward until her cheek pressed against Appledusk's feather-soft chest fur." [...] "The tom's breath warmed the back of her neck. [...] "He licked the top of Mapleshade's head". - Chapter 1, at the Gathering.

The simple act of Appledusk being in a forbidden relationship with Mapleshade should be evidence alone he genuinely loved her. Forbidden relationships in the Clans, is a very risky business: constantly needing to sneak out and lie around your own Clanmates. All that, but there are actually very little benefits to those actions, other than seeing the mate themselves. To put so much on the line just to see one cat, requires a very strong motive, which in this case, would be romantic love. Appledusk did love Mapleshade. It wouldn't make any other sense otherwise.

He clearly wasn't doing it to get some tactical advantage for Riverclan, as his Clanmates or even his leader were shocked when they discovered what he'd done. Even if it was a plan he was doing by himself, he would of definitely mentioned it while he was confessing everything in Riverclan camp as it would of been a good way to defend himself. But he doesn't. Clearly showing, it's not true. If he wanted to use his kits within Thunderclan for Riverclan's benefit, when he meets them at the border, he would definitely make sure they were aware of him being their father. Yet again, he doesn't, he allows Mapleshade's plan to carry on, letting them think Birchface was their father, naturally making them hate Appledusk, as his supposed murderer. Though Appledusk allowed this to happen, as it was necessary to protect their half-clan status.

Appledusk expressing how he's proud of all his kits:

"I'm going to be a father." he ***purred****, "Incredible."* - Appledusk after hearing he was a father. Also, the purr is a physical reaction and is much harder to fake then words, for anyone who thinks he's lying about his emotions. Mapleshade's vengeance, chapter 1.
-*"They are* ***wonderful, Strong and brave, and as confident*** *as any*

*RiverClan cat in the water. **I am so proud of you.**"* , Appledusk talking to Mapleshade while their kits play in the River. Chapter 3.

*-"I'm not letting you do anything," he mewed. "Think of our kits!". Reedshine glanced at her belly, barely swollen beneath her pelt. "I'm not sick!" she protested. "I know you're not," meowed Appledusk. "But **our kits are too precious** to risk Perchpaw injuring you by mistake!"* - Appledusk about his unborn 2nd litter, Chapter 9.

- This more caring side of Appledusk also extends to his apprentice, Perchpaw: "You need more height than that, Perchpaw," he chided. "You must be prepared to fight full-grown warriors when you go into battle." The young cat's blue eyes stretched wide. "I will get taller, won't I?" **Appledusk purred. "Of course you will,** but you still need to learn how to jump." - Chapter 9. Even when his apprentice makes a mistake, Appledusk doesn't harshly scold him for it. Instead of finding humour in it and encouraging his apprentice on by ensuring him he'll grow up tall.

Him risking his life to save Mapleshade and then immediately trying to save all the kits as well. Also, his physical reactions to hearing the danger his mate had put their kits in, that just can't be faked, which shows he's genuine:

*"Mapleshade! Mapleshade! Grab hold of the branch!" There was a **frantic shout** from the shore. Mapleshade saw Appledusk wading into the river, his **fur fluffed up in alarm.** He gestured with his tail to the overhanging tree. "Hold on and I'll drag you out!" Mapleshade was only dimly aware of hooking her claws into the branch beside her. She felt herself being dragged through the water, and then strong jaws were in her pelt, hauling her onto the stones. Appledusk loomed over her. "What in the name of StarClan are you doing? Where are the kits?"* - Appledusk saving Mapleshade, Chapter 4. Take note of adjectives used to describe Appledusk. He's clearly Genuinely Concerned for Mapleshade. Second, the first thing Appledusk asks her when she's safe, is about is the kits, also showing he cares about them.

Appledusk crouched beside Mapleshade. "I will find them, I

promise," he whispered. Then he raced away from her." - Chapter 4.

"Appledusk's face appeared above her, **his eyes huge with horror.** "Are you telling me the kits are in the river?" - Chapter 4.

"What are you talking about?" Appledusk **sounded stunned**. "Do you mean that you deliberately tried to cross the river? In the middle of a flood?" - Chapter 4.

"Appledusk set down Petalkit's body as **gently** as if she were sleeping." - Chapter 5, even when his kit is dead, Appledusk makes sure to be careful with their body.

(This one requires more context)

-"Mapleshade waited for Appledusk to send the other warriors on ahead, to find some excuse to be alone with her so they could mourn their kits together before facing the rest of his Clan. But he didn't turn back to look at her. He hasn't even asked what I named them.' Chapter 4 - Directly after the kits' deaths. The reason he doesn't stop to talk to her privately is that he blames her for their kits' deaths and doesn't want to see her again. Why would someone want to have private time with the person they blame for their all children's deaths? Oakheart technically did the exact same thing to Mosskit. When Bluefur told him one was dead, he didn't even ask for her name either. But it's never brought up in the fandom, because the narrative doesn't draw attention because they want Oakheart to be seen as a positive character, despite doing the exact same thing as Appledusk.

Regardless - Considering the evidence beforehand, Appledusk wouldn't have any ill-tent towards his kits, specially after their deaths. As it would be out of character for him. Since we don't his PoV, his exact motives will never be known, but I'll still attempt to speculate.
1) He thought it was inappropriate to learn his children's names, from the person he blames for their deaths. He can learn from other cats, it didn't specially have to be Mapleshade.
2) He already knew their names without Mapleshade being aware. There were 2 moons between the kit's birth and deaths - So a lot of time for Appledusk to learn their names. Prime chances he had:

Thunderclan speaking about them at the Gatherings or when Mapleshade ran into Appledusk when she took the kits to play in the river, in which she called them by name serval times.
3) He was so overwhelmed with the situation, he didn't realise he didn't know his 1st litter's names until it was too late to ask their mother. Mapleshade was sent away quickly, only being present for the walk to Riverclan camp and brief conversation with Darkstar.
4) He planned to rename the kits himself. (No evidence for this, but still a possibility.)

Appledusk has been shown to be quite a lot smarter than Mapleshade when it comes to keeping the secret:

"You must know how dangerous it is for you to be here. What would happen if your Clanmates saw you talking to me?" - When Mapleshade talks to Appeldusk at the Gathering Chapter 1. Gatherings are literally the meeting place for the majority of the cats in the Four Clans. They are at a massive risk of getting exposed here.

"Mapleshade: I'm expecting your kits.
Appledusk: "**Are you sure?** I'm going to be a father. Incredible. **But these kits will be half-Clan. Half RiverClan. How will your Clanmates feel about that?**"
Mapleshade: "They won't know. At least, not at first. I will raise them as ThunderClan until they have been fully accepted. Then every cat will be able to cope with the truth. Why should it matter that their father lives in a different Clan?"
*Appledusk:"**You have great faith in your Clanmates**,"*
Mapleshade:"No, I have faith in StarClan, and in the warrior code."
*Appledusk: "**You think StarClan approves of what we are doing?**"*
Mapleshade: "I think our warrior ancestors know that our Clans need kits and we are providing them. How can our innocent kits not have their blessing? They will grow up to be fine warriors, loyal to ThunderClan and RiverClan equally."

Chapter 1, Appledusk and Mapleshade at the Gathering discussing the fates of the kits. As you can see Mapleshade is painfully naive about the whole situation. Actually putting the kits at risk, by assuming all her Clanmates will be fine with her having Half-Riverclan kits with the tom who the supposed "purposeful

murderer" of two of their members. And to think the Kits can somehow be loyal equally to both Riverclan and Thunderclan, she's putting an unrealistically high expectation on their kits. However, Appledusk in this scene is trying to be a realist and bring down Mapleshade's dangerous expectations, by bringing up important questions.

However at the same time, he still respects Mapleshade, not scolding or insulting her for those naive ideas. And when she makes the choice to raise them in Thunderclan, Appledusk doesn't try to pressure her into abandoning everything she knows to join Riverclan. As it's in Hindsight the better option, as the kits would be with both parents and would be safer, since they wouldn't be in the same Clan where their father accidentally killed two of their members. But even still, Mapleshade chooses Thunderclan and Appledusk respected that.

However, when the kits are older, Mapleshade takes them to the Riverclan border and allows them to swim around. When Riverclan patrol undoubtedly discovers them, Appledusk is forced to stand up to his own clanmates, including the Deputy, to prevent them getting aggressive or even attacking his kits: *"What is that kit doing?"* ***growled*** *Spiketail. He stepped onto the shore,* ***the fur along his spine bristling.*** *[...] "I think one kit is hardly a threat to our territory," Appledusk meowed. "I'll return him to where he belongs."* - Chapter 3.

Then afterwards: *"I think this one's worn out from all that swimming," he commented. His eyes burned into Mapleshade's. "You took a risk, bringing them this close to our boundary. I don't want to see you or these kits anywhere near the river again," he meowed."* - Chapter 3, Appledusk after helping a struggling Patchkit get out the water. Appledusk is completely right here, Mapleshade is being completely unnecessarily reckless by doing this. Yes, she wanted to get away from Rabbitfur after he was judging her kits for not pouncing properly - However she could literally be taken them anywhere in the territory, but she just couldn't control herself and had made to be the Riverclan border.

Mapleshade: took her kits to the Riverclan border in board daylight, where any Riverclan or Thunderclan cat could be passing by and

allows her kits to swim in the water, showing off their Riverclan traits and talking lovingly with Appledusk. It was lucky the Riverclan patrol showed mercy and only a Medicine cat saw it, or that could of lead to a battle, endangering lives. In fact, Mapleshade doing this, is what actually got the kits caught as Half-clan in the first place. Without that, Ravenwing's omen by itself: Three Reeds in a Thunderclan camp, could have had a million meanings and didn't directly point to Mapleshade's kits at all. However, by Mapleshade taking her kits to the river and talking with Appledusk, she gave him all the clues he needed.

Also, Mapleshade mentioning Appledusk in Thunderclan camp, not being subtle at all: *"I wish I could be there to see that, too. Make sure you tell them that I've had three perfect, strong kits who are going to be great warriors!" she told Frecklewish. "**Especially Appledusk. Tell him first.**" - Chapter 3.* Mapleshade is saying this as "Birchface's mate" and "at his kits' birth". She blatantly said that out loud to Frecklewish, the sister of Appledusk's murder victim. She's being careless to allow herself to speak those things aloud, when she's supposed to be protecting the secret in order to keep the kits safe.

Quote to show it's the kits were the reason for Appledusk leaving Mapleshade and something that isn't as selfish as people make it out to be. Also why it's reasonable to blame Mapleshade for the kits' deaths:

- "But night is falling!" Mapleshade protested. "Where will I go? Appledusk, help me!" The pale brown warrior shook his head. "Why should I? **It's your fault that these kits are dead. I never want to see you again**." - Chapter 4, When Mapleshade is sent away from Riverclan camp.

Appledusk is disowning her because in his eyes, she caused their deaths, showing he genuinely cared about the kits. Not only did the Kits die, but Mapleshade almost got herself killed and risked the lives of a Riverclan patrol to save them, including Appledusk himself. I wouldn't blame anyone for doing that honestly. If the kits' deaths can justify Mapleshade's murders for some fans, but can't it

for Appledusk's much less extreme act of rejecting his forbidden mate?

He's also not completely wrong for blaming the mate who gets all their kits killed through their recklessness. Yes, Mapleshade was in exile, however, she was still the one who made her kits swim in a clearly dangerous flood. The kits were already tired and hungry. And earlier that day, when Mapleshade allowed them to swim in the river during calm conditions, Patchkit still struggled and needed Appledusk to help him. If her kits struggled to swim in calm water, this should be a clear indicator they can't swim in a flood and storm.

Petalkit even shouts, "*There's too much water!"* during the Flood scene in Chapter 4. If a kit can see the danger, Mapleshade has no excuse. She'd JUST left camp and weren't being actively chased, they weren't in such a rush they needed to cross a flood. This is the same reason why I blame Bluesfur for Mosskit's death. Like Mapleshade, she unnecessarily dragged her kits through a clear danger when she had other obvious options to her, like simply warning Sunstar.

Even if Thunderclan patrol found Mapleshade and her kits after the time limit, they wouldn't of been seriously hurt or kill Mapleshade, especially with kits. Even protecting Mapleshade during her trial, when two warriors hauled Frecklewish off from attacking her. At worst, they would of given her a few warning bits or scratches, most likely would of simply lead them out of the territory. Even when Mapleshade is found trespassing after the kits' deaths, she's still offered by Frecklewish and Appledusk to leave peacefully before they called a patrol. Where they still likely to just chase her out, not kill her. Clan cats rarely kill cats just for trespassing, not even those outside of the code.

Mapleshade had far better options like calling out for a Riverclan patrol, finding a safer way around, sheltering from the storm somewhere etc. Or at the very least, taking them one by one in her mouth, instead, she swim behind them, expecting young tired kits to swim completely unaided in a flood.

There were plenty of areas where they could have stayed until the

storm passed, like Four Trees, somewhere around the borders or Twoleg place/Garden. Rogue or loner mothers are able to sleep alone with their kits every night, without every one of their kits dying. Mapleshade has to do this for one or two nights at most, the likelihood of something happening to kill the whole litter is very unlikely. While a flood, is extremely obvious and likely feral danger. Also, the badger or fox attacks are also unlikely if she stays reasonably close to the Clan territory as Clan cats chase out all other predators. Then in that case, it wouldn't be her fault, as it would be up to complete luck. However floods don't chase, Mapleshade made a willingly choice to go into it.

Also, the Twoleg place is quite a safe place as it only has soft kittypets. The claims Oakstar had "toughened up the loyal kittypet population because of his constant raids" is a myth. Oakstar only ordered one attack during that entire book of Pinestar's choice and it was because he'd been getting several reports from patrols beforehand they were being troublesome. During the Battle of the Clans, Cloudstar when he was a warrior, he laid a very similar raid, so this isn't exclusively something Oakstar did.

Oakstar's one attack took place in Pinestar's choice, 3 years after Mapleshade was alive, which is a long time in cat time. When Mapleshade was alive, all the outsiders she did come across were Myler and a Kittypet during Chapter 7, where they were either a non-threat or actually friendly.

And considering Mapleshade had young kits and outsiders ain't bothered by Half-clan cats, the likelihood of Mapleshade running into a cat willing to hurt them in the one night she needed to wait out the storm, is very unlikely.

Also, Mapleshade is a Clan cat, some of the best fighters around. She's a fully trained warrior, who was noted to be the expected future deputy in the Ultimate Guild. She managed to scare away the kittypet from Chapter 7 with a single scratch. Local Rogues and Kittypets should be more scared of her, then she is of them. Mapleshade is fully capable of defending her kits from any outsiders just for one night.

So to summarize, Appledusk was right to blame Mapleshade for

making the kits swim in the flood, as it was unnecessary and had other obvious options.

Back to Appledusk. He was doing the technical right thing by choosing loyalty to his Clan instead of one forbidden mate, like it says in the Code. Choosing the one reckless mate who just got his kits killed, over his entire Clan, is a lot more selfish as he'd be abandoning a lot more: All his clanmates, vulnerable members who need protection, any kin he has, his apprentice, new mate and unborn kits. Young cats needed him: Perchpaw to finish his training and unborn kits to be their father. Him valuing duty to the many over Kin of the few, isn't automatically a bad thing either. In fact, the Clans highly value those kinds of morals, ingraining into their members, "*As the warrior code says, the safety of the Clan is more important than the security of any single member" - Into the Wild Chapter 18.* And Appledusk was being asked to choose between one cat and an entire Clan, including his other kin. The choice is obvious if you ask me.

And what Appledusk does is a lot better than what other forbidden mates do like Greystripe, who abandoned both his kin and Clans. First, abandoned Thunderclan to raise his kits in Riverclan. However, didn't dedicate himself to the Clan that showed him unneeded hospitality by leaking information on the Sunningrocks attack and refusing to fight on their side. Knowingly getting himself exiled while his kits were still in the Nursery, the whole reason he left in the first place. In the end, he just ended up betraying two separate Clans and abandoned his kits.

Fans also have double standards when it comes to a similar situation: Pinestar gets criticized for abandoning his whole Clan, including his young mate and kits. However, when Appledusk chooses to stay loyal to his Clan with his new mate and unborn kits, fans scrutinise him for not staying with and going into exile with a single forbidden mate over his entire Clan. Despite after everything Mapleshade had just done, that would of been a seriously unhealthy relationship for the both of them - forced into exile with either the cat they blamed for their kits' deaths or a mate who doesn't want to be with them anymore.

Mapleshade is guilty of blaming Appledusk as well:

People get furious at Appledusk for blaming the kits' death on Mapleshade. However, Mapleshade is guilty of doing the exact same thing, convinced Appledusk could of somehow saved all the kits:

"He never wanted my kits, so he let them drown. He could have saved them, I know he could have!" - Chapter 8.

"Mapleshade twitched the tip of her tail. "And you thought I would? You're more mouse-brained than I thought. You killed our kits, and now you must pay." - Chapter 8.

Appledusk's accusation is built on valid reasoning but Mapleshade's is complete nonsense and ignores key facts, so she doesn't have to take any responsibility for her actions, just blaming it all on others. Many quotes from Appledusk prove how much he cared about his kits. If he never wanted kits and wanted to hide his crimes, he wouldn't of saved Mapleshade as she could of exposed all his crimes as well. But he didn't and he willingly confessed all his crimes himself.

Mapleshade also completely ignores the fact, that she was the one who put the kits in danger in the first place. The kits were in the flood for a good amount of time before the patrol even had the chance to arrive. Mapleshade also wasted Appledusk's short time to save their kits, by forcing him to save her first. And by the time he set off to find their kits, it was already too late, as the kits' bodies had washed up on shore.

And for Mapleshade to have the expectation Appledusk could of somehow saved all the kits by himself, is just unrealistic and unfair. Especially when Mapleshade herself couldn't save the kits. Yes, she's not a Riverclan cat but she had more time than anyone and actually had one kit in her mouth at one point but lost her grip on them. So if she couldn't save a single kit, she shouldn't expect others to.

And even if he blamed Mapleshade for their deaths, he still does

care about her. After he found her trespassing, falsely accuses him of killing their kits, threatening him and kidnapping his apprentice, he has every right to attack her. Yet he still gives the chance for her to leave peacefully:

- *"Mapleshade twitched the tip of her tail. "And you thought I would? You're more mouse-brained than I thought. You killed our kits, and now you must pay." Appledusk bared his teeth. "What are you talking about?* ***You killed our kits, making them cross The river. Let Perchpaw go and get out of here before I call for a patrol."*** - Chapter 8.

Even after Mapleshade is threatening him and attacks him, he still refuses to fight her:

- *'Mapleshade snarled: "But you'll have to fight me first."*
'His eyes clouded and he suddenly looked weary. "Mapleshade, I don't want to fight you,". - Chapter 9.

-*"I'm not giving you a choice!" Mapleshade hissed. She bunched her hindquarters beneath her and lunged at him.* ***Appledusk dodged away. "Just leave!" he gasped."*** - Even when Mapleshade is attacking him, Appledusk still refuses to fight her.

And of course, the quote that's criminally underused. The one critical act that's redeemed the likes of Hollyleaf and Needletail to many people. Even Stonefur has done this. So why can't it for Appledusk? He sacrificed himself to save Reedshine and his unborn kits while Mapleshade is trying to kill them:

"Half-blind with fury, Mapleshade hurled herself at the orange she-cat. "You and your kits must die!" she screeched. "Appledusk is mine!" She unsheathed her claws, aiming for Reedshine's face. There was a thud of paws, then silence, and a solid brown shape flashed in front of Mapleshade. Her claws struck home, piercing fur and flesh, and a spurt of blood leapt out at her. With a grunt, Appledusk dropped at her feet, blood pouring from his throat." - Appledusk's sacrificing himself Chapter 9.

Let's also get into the fact, that when Mapleshade went after the Riverclan cats: Perchpaw, Appledusk and Reedshine, she was only avenging herself anymore. Her other victims, who loosely and indirectly caused her kits' deaths, unfairly signalled out because the entirety of Thunderclan were guilty. Mapleshade herself being a massive hypocrite, because she plays as large of a role in the drownings, if not more. However the Riverclan victims are the complete opposite, they tried SAVING the kits or had nothing to do with it at all. And it can't not be understated that Mapleshade tried to kill a pregnant Queen.

Appledusk personally saved Mapleshade and instantly went to go save the kits afterwards. The kits were already dead by the time Appledusk rejected Mapleshade, so it was something solely between mates. Her recklessly making their kits swim the flood actually being the reason why. When Mapleshade killed Ravenwing, she secretly hoped he would go to the Dark Forest. Since she knew of it's existence, she was aware the crimes she was committing could get her separated from her kits. Even knowing two of her Riverclan victims were completely innocent. Yet she did it anyway. Her kits are also victims of Mapleshade's killing spree too, as they have to watch in horror from Starclan, their mother trying to kill their unborn half-siblings and killing their father, all while she condemns herself to the Dark Forest.

This is why doing crimes is so selfish, not only because of the suffering the victims or even offender gets, but also the families as well: Goldenflower is separated from Tigerstar, Mothwing is separated from Hawkfrost, Thistleclaw is separated from Whitestorm and Snowfur- and yes, Mapleshade is separated from her kits, the whole "reason" she's claiming to do those crimes.

Good father (Summary):

Appledusk was actually beyond his time when it came to how much he cared about his kits. During Rising Storm, when Greystripe left to be with his kits, it was considered strange, even by Fireheart: *"Why don't you come home?" Fireheart asked. "I can't leave my kits", Greystripe meowed. Fireheart couldn't help the look of disbelief that flashed in his eyes. After all, kits were raised by Queens, not their fathers."* - Rising Storm, Fireheart speaking with Greystripe after he

accidentally attacked him for sneaking round the Riverclan borders Chapter 14.

And this was 3 whole generations after Appledusk's time, which was even more stricter, considering Half-clan kits could be exiled without protest. Appledusk could of easily completely abandoned Mapleshade right then and there when she announced her pregnancy at the Gathering. Yet he carried on to take the risk, in order to have a full conversation on the kits' future and respected Mapleshade's choices.

When he helped Patchkit out the water after Mapleshade took them to the Riverclan border, he could of instantly turned away as soon as possible, Even pretend to threaten her to show he had no connection to Mapelshade. However he took the time, to say something to his son, calmly warn Mapleshade to stay away, but still stayed to briefly celebrate their kits, watching them playing and say how proud he was of them.

Despite only having 2 months with both his litters, one of them not even being born, it's impressive how much he managed to prove himself as a good father. Commenting many times how proud he was of them. He's highly aware and realistic about his kits safety, especially his Half-clan litter and took the precautions to protect them. Like warning his mate twice to stay away from him. And bringing up important questions at the Gathering when Mapleshade first announces her pregnancy, bringing down her blind-faith and overly high expectations.

Couldn't be apart of his Thunderclan family and moved onto another family and, in order to keep the secret, even though it was obvious he would of liked to raise them. Understood that after accidentally killing two Thunderclan cats, that getting involved with his Half-clan kits would be too selfish and risky, as it would put their very lives in danger.

He was shocked and panicked when he discovered his 1st litter were in the flood, doing his best to save them. And was disgusted by their deaths caused by their mother's recklessness, being the only

reason Appledusk didn't want to see her again, proving he cared about their kits. And for his 2nd unborn litter, he didn't want his new pregnant mate to train, as he didn't want to risk their unborn litter's safety. Finally, he made the ultimate sacrifice, ending in his death, in order to save them and Reedshine from a crazed Mapleshade.

"Cheater":

Cheating isn't a concept or at least not considered morally wrong in the Clans:

Those are inbred family groups of feral cats, they aren't humans: The Clan cats are less then Cavemen - Still sleeping in bushes, hunting/eating prey raw, not using tools etc. Their romance system is much more akin to the Animal Kingdom's free-for-all then Human's Advanced one. It's a very basic system in the Series, either you're someone mate or you're not. There's no midpoint like dating or marriage ceremony. Besides from only having mates within your Clan, there are no rules to it - Not how many or not gender. There ain't even unspoken social rules, as characters never judge others for having multiple mates. None of Stormtail's clanmates obviously judged him for flirting with Dappletail while he had kits in the Nursery. The rare examples of cats who negatively react are Reedshine and Nightcloud, who shown to get clingy and possessive cats anyway - Suggesting this is an overreaction by Clan standards. Specially Nightcloud, who no one shows sympathy for despite what humans would call "being cheated on" by Crowfeather.

Going further with this, terms such as: Sexuality names, Affairs, etcs. are never used in the series. Suggesting cats have no concept of them. For example, no character reacts to Ravenpaw's and Barley's obvious gay relationship, most likely because they don't really know what it is.

Getting more onto Appledusk's accusation of cheating - Having

multiple mates in the norm in Warriors. Queens are even respected if they don't wish to name the father of their kits - With no regard for the father himself. Suggesting how impersonal and impermanent cats relationships are compared to humans, just like real life. It makes sense considering there's no birth control, leading to more unwanted pregnancy between two cats who ain't life-long mates.

There are so many examples of multiple mates, many close to each other as well: Whitestorm, Brindleface, Goldenflower, Patchpelt, Dovewing, Crowfeather, Greystripe, Robinwing, etc. And from this list, many of those cats ain't considered "cheaters" and even seen as "Noble". And there's no reason they shouldn't be, they're only doing the norm of their society. The Horse Place cats do the same. Smokey was having litters with both Daisy and Floss, neither jealous of each other.
Also, as soon as Dasiy entered Thunderclan and while Smokey's kits were newborns, she was already flirting with Cloudtail. Then when Hazeltail told her father about Spiderleg's litter, Smokey hardly reacted to his old mate finding a new lover.

Probably the best example of the Clan's casualness towards multiple mates is Toadskip, Poolcloud and Nettlespot in Yellowfang's Secret: "*You can't go risking your life when you have your son, Cloudkit, to think about. [...] Toadskip is the father of my kits, too. But I wouldn't dream of telling a warrior not to fight.*" and "*It's Nettlespot. Her milk is drying up again. Poolcloud is hunting for her, but there's so little prey in this weather, and when Poolcloud does catch something, Nettlespot doesn't seem to want it.*"

Even if you want to ignore this. Forbidden mates actually have one of the best reasons to "cheat" or have a second family out there. In fact, it could be considered necessary or morally good, as it's helping to protect lives. When Half-clan cats are exposed, the worst things happen to them: Executed, kept as prisoners, attempted to be murdered by revengeful cats- And Appledusk's own litter, getting exiled as kits into a flood season. Mapleshade and Appledusk must do everything they can to protect the secret, in order to protect the kits they endangered in the first place. And the best way of doing that is moving on. It's literally the real-life equivalent of someone in

Nazi Germany having a 2nd family to protect/hide their half-Jewish family or in Old America for their mixed-race family.

All Forbidden Mates have done the same as Appledusk/Double Standards:

Apart from Featherstorm and Fallowtail, all Forbidden mate have taken on cats from their own Clan as "Mates" to some extent or tricked them into adopting their kits: Mapleshade and Birchfaxe Yellowfang and Lizardstripe, Raggedstar and Foxheart, Bluestar and Thrushpelt, Oakheart and Greypool, Leafpool and Brambleclaw, Crowfeather and Nightcloud, Dovewing and Bumblestripe, etc.

Like when Dovewing, she's seeing both Tigerheart and Bumblestripe around the same time, without the other being aware. And even admits she's only trying out Bumblestripe because he's Thunderclan.

Or, when Bluefur allowed Thrushpelt to pose as her mate and father of her kits, when she was fully aware he was actually in love with her. That's extremely close to becoming Thrushpelt's actual mate when Oakheart was still alive and unaware. So was Bluefur "Cheating"?

Even Mapleshade herself pretended to be the mate of the deceased Birchface and sister/daughter-law to his grieving family. She had 4 moons to correct this and has the Queen's right to keep the father nameless, yet didn't. Appledusk's accidental murder victim. Now his own kits will grow up to hate even more then regular Thunderclan kits, because they'd think Appledusk "killed their father". Oakstar and Frecklewish were even planning on using them for revenage for Birchface, raising them to want to kill Appledusk.

Appledusk is no worse then Crowfeather, if not better. The earlier quotes prove Appledusk generally loves both his mates and all his kits, even if at the same time. Crowfeather didn't generally love either his mate or son and mistreated both of them. He also wasn't aware of his Thunderclan kits, so when he took on Nightcloud, he was only doing it to protect himself. It's actually confirmed in The Ultimate Guide, Breezepelt was born before the Three. And when he

exposed as the father of a Thunderclan litter, he denied it even though he knew he was guilty. And instantly disowned his Thunderclan litter just to protect himself.

Meanwhile, Appledusk didn't disown Mapleshade as soon as he out found she was pregnant. He also never disowned his kits. He only did it to Mapleshade later on, for the far better reason of her causing all their kits' deaths by making them swim through a flood. And him being aware of 1st litter and taking on a Riverclan mate, was actually helping to protect his Thunderclan family. If Appledusk deserves the Dark Forest, so does Crowfeather.

Appledusk couldn't prevent Mapleshade's rejection from Riverclan:

Appledusk wasn't the one to cause Mapleshade being rejected from Riverclan, neither could he do anything to prevent it. He was only a warrior and exposed traitor, he had no authority to decide anything. It was Darkstar's choice, not Appledusk. He barely stayed in Riverclan himself:

Even after confessing absolutely everything and desperately trying to apologise in Chapter 4. Those are all Appledusk's line from the conversation:

Confessions: "Three kits have drowned in the river. I...I am their father," [...] "Many moons ago, I met with Mapleshade in secret." [...] . "Mapleshade told me she would raise them in ThunderClan," [...] "Mapleshade's Clanmates learned the truth and she had to leave. The river is flooded and the kits were too young to swim across."

Apologizing: "I'm so sorry, Reedshine. Please forgive me." [...] "I will regret it for the rest of my life, and I can only beg for your forgiveness." [...] "I knew I had made a mistake so I said nothing to my Clanmates." [...] "I should never have betrayed my Clan by meeting with Mapleshade." [...] "I will never forget your mercy, Darkstar. Thank you. I promise my loyalty lies only with RiverClan, and my Clanmates."

Even after all that, Darkstar still uses those quotes: *"The loss of any kits is a loss to all of us. But you broke the warrior code, Appledusk.* **How can I ever trust you again?***" and "I will allow you to remain in RiverClan—but know that I and the rest of the* **Clanmates will be watching you. You will have to earn back our trust.***"*

And as you can see through all those quotes, Appledusk is either simply stating facts or sincerely apologizing for himself. He never once insults his kits or Malpeshade. Or never tries to purposeful shift blame to anyone else. Actually, he does the opposite, always only referring to himself in the 1st person, making it sound like he's more the one to blame. Only ever referring Mapleshade in factual explanations.

So when Appledusk said, "I knew I had made a mistake.", he wasn't referring to the kits or Mapleshade as a "mistake". If he was doing that, he'd be wording it like '*They* were a mistake" or "*She* was a mistake.'. But no, Appledusk uses 1st person, "*I* knew *I* had made a mistake.". He was only referring to his own actions themselves. Considering the earlier quotes proved Appledusk genuinely loved his oldest kits, it would be inconsistent with his character to ever insult his kits like that, specially after their deaths.

And when Appledusk does directly blame her: "*The pale brown warrior shook his head. "Why should I? It's your fault that these kits are dead. I never want to see you again.*" This was only after Darkstar had already made her official choice to reject Mapleshade from Riverclan. Up until that point, Appledusk had only stated facts about Mapleshade, with no bias wording to make it sound worse. So Appledusk did nothing to encourage or influence Darkstar's choice.

It's shouldn't be underestimated how much courage it takes to do what Appledusk did - Admitting absolutely everything to his Clan, accepting responsibility and begging for forgiveness. Appledusk could of taken the easy way out and purposefully blame Mapleshade or kits, maybe even insult them. But he doesn't, he takes the harder way out. Unlike Mapleshade, who refused to admit any of her crimes or even apologize. Actually threatening Thunderclan after her sentencing: "You were my mentor, Bloomheart! You know I would never betray my Clan!" [...] "You

have betrayed me and my kits. You will live to regret this day forever, ThunderClan, and that is a promise."

He was on very thin ice himself, and many cats needed him in Riverclan, including an apprentice and unborn kits. So he couldn't afford the risk of getting himself exiled in order to push his Leader's fragile mercy and stand up for his Forbidden mate. That would just demonstrate to Darkstar he's more loyal to Mapleshade then his Clan. And why would he want Mapleshade in his home and risk exile for her?: When she'd failed their shared responsibility to help protect the secret and kits, by bringing them down to the Riverclan border and letting them show off their Riverclan traits. And she recklessly crossed the flood: causing all their kits to die, almost got herself killed and forced Appledusk to risk his own life, along with two of his Clanmates.

I wouldn't blame anyone for not wanting to see someone like that again. Appledusk had a right to shut Mapleshade out of his life after doing something like that. Mates have broken up for far more minor reasons like as simple as not feeling like it's working out. Appledusk has one of the strongest reasons in the whole series to reject his mate, alongside Tigerclaw lying to Goldenflower about his murders.

Punishing Appledusk would of just been unnecessary, when he'd already had been punished enough. In the form of losing an entire litter. Just like when Silverstream's death was considered punishment enough for Graystripe, just that for Apledusk, it was tripled with 3 deaths. He had also had his reputation ruined and mistrusted by all his clanmates, including being labelled a traitor.

The Clans are small groups with only 15-40 members where deaths are frequent. With a large portion reliant on the Warriors population, including: Elders, Queens, kits and apprentices somewhat. Every Warrior counts. If Appledusk left, a Clanmate could die because he wasn't there to save them or starve because he wasn't there to catch those extra pieces of fresh-kill. Especially when it's was such a harsh season during Appledusk's sentencing. Darkstar even mentioning this: "*This is not the season for losing warriors. Appledusk.*" - Chapter 4. Thunderclan was foolish to throw away a decent warrior and whole litter of innocent kits on

ulimately more minor crime, however, Riverclan is more merciful and doesn't make the same mistake. So Riverclan can't afford to be wasteful and needlessly exile warriors, when they are regretful and want to redeem themselves.

Either Appledusk chooses to leave or Darkstar exiles him, nothing useful comes out of him being a rogue. It's clear he didn't want to be with Mapleshade after she made their kits swim in a flood, so he'd just be looking after himself and escaping his Warrior duties. His Riverclan kits would be needlessly devoid of a father, potentially affecting their ability as future warriors. Unlike his Thunderclan kits, which was a requirement for him to stay separate from for their own protection.

Also, Appledusk's exile would affect Perchpaw's training as well. Mentors can't just be carelessly replaced, the apprentice grows a special bond that lasts for their entire adolescence. Appledusk would be abandoning a young cat that needs him if he left. At least Mapleshade is fully grown warrior and is capable of looking after herself.

How Thunderclan chooses to punish their offender isn't Riverclan's business or problem. It's not their responsibility to take on a Thunderclan exile, when her own Clan won't. Mapleshade had no blood relation to Riverclan herself and she was only hoping to get in there through sheer pity alone. But it's hard to say if she even deserves that pity, considering she was the one to drag the kits through a flood. Riverclan had already done quite a lot for her by saving her and her kits, respectfully burying their bodies and not attacking Mapleshade despite it being their right as she was trespassing.

And for the many misconceptions that burial of the kits was "disrespectful" in anyway, this is what Darkstar says about them: "The loss of any kits is a loss to all of us." and "Rainfall, help Splashfoot and Eeltail to bury these kits. The accident of their birth is not their fault. They may lie in peace in our territory now." - Chapter 4. And as you can see, she's very respectful towards Half-

clan kits she's never even met before.

The Clans aren't a free shelter for every weakened cat who come stumbling into their territory. Outsiders like Rogues and Loners probably have plenty of tragic events happen to them all the time, yet it's not the Clans' responsibility to take in every single one. They themselves have limited resources, barely able to survive Leafbare. Especially for Riverclan as their lifestyle requires specialised skills like swimming and fishing that are rare for cats. Usually taught to their members from birth. So fully grown cats who grew up in a completely different territory would require special training and extra resources then normal. All that and the end result would only be: a cat who's outperformed probably almost by the entire Clan.

Mapleshade also does at least deserve a harsher punishment then Appledusk, as she's committed worse crimes. Appledusk was only in a forbidden romance with a regular Thunderclan cat, not telling them the existence of his Thunderclan family but showed some loyalty to Riverclan by taking on another legal mate. He acknowledged his crimes, confessed everything and begged for forgiveness. However, Mapleshade was mates with the Riverclan cat who "killed" two of her Clanmates, yet continued to love and see him even afterwards. She cruelly used one of the victims' names and his grieving family, including her best friend, pretending to be his mate and mother of his kits. And when she was exposed, she refused to acknowledge any wrongdoing and threatened Thunderclan after her sentence.

Appledusk and Mapleshade really should of been taking on new mates from their own Clans:

The best thing for either Appledusk and Mapleshade to do, in order to protect their kits, was to move on, so no one could suspect them. Even Mapleshade did something similar when she lied that Birchface was the father of her kits, yet was still obsessive over

Appledusk. He took it a step further and actually properly tried to move on by starting a new family. Something Mapleshade should of really been doing. If she'd done that, the Kit would of probably never be caught as Half-Clan. Ravenwing would of still been given the Omen however if Mapleshade had never let her kits swim in the River while she talked lovingly to Appledusk, the Medicine cat would have never made the connection.

Is Mapleshade and Appledusk's relationship even close enough to count as "Cheating"? They see each other very infrequently, especially when around the time of the Book itself. As it was noted after Birchface's death, Patrols were doubled, preventing Mapleshade and Appledusk sneaking out to see each other. To the point, Mapleshade had to risk seeing Appledusk at the Gathering.

It just got worse when Mapleshade had the kits, with 2 moons of pregnancy and 2 moons after the birth, that's a total of 4 months/ moons. And this is when Appledusk sees the kits for the first time at the River, which is also presumably the first time he's seen Mapleshade in 4 months. *4 months.* And once again, Appledusk is forced to tell them to stay away or it's could give away the secret and endanger the kits.

Appledusk has to stay absent from his kits lives to keep them safe while Mapleshade is forced to lie to them their 'father' is dead. Neither can Mapleshade or Appledusk see each other at all. Their "relationship" is down to: Use to only see each other a handful of times a year, later was forced to avoid each other completely and to painstakingly keep it secret from everyone they know. This isn't any kind of relationship or family. How can anyone really stay "loyal" to a partner in that situation?

That's why it's so much better for them to move onto a legal mate, Mapleshade to find a step-father for her kits. While Appledusk can actually be a present father to a litter of kits. They'd also have the benefit of having a mate who's always there for them, rather than a basically non-existent one. They can also relax slightly from such an extremely stressful situation, as they can finally have a public relationship. And not to be careful of every word they say to their own Clanmates in an effort not to give away their forbidden romance.

When Reedshine it confirms is pregnant, is describes it like this barely *"swollen beneath her pelt."*, meaning she's only in the early stages. And this was in Chapter 9, when Mapleshade had already been in exile for several days, maybe even a week or two. And since cat pregnancies last 2 months or roughly 8 weeks, 1 week can make a big difference. So Appledusk could of easily got Reedshine pregnant after his first litter died and Mapleshade exiled.

Also, we don't even know if Appledusk had officially asked Reedshine to be his mate while his 1st litter was alive. As he may of considered her a friend at the time or just seeing if he was interested, and only choice to become mates with Reedshine after Mapleshade got exiled.

Appledusk had already told Mapleshade to stay away twice and could of easing his way into a new relationship. However, Mapleshade and their kits' exile threw a wrench into that, before the rest of Appledusk's plan had the chance to happen. So we can't say that if Appledusk would of told Mapleshade or not, he was moving on. If he had more time and allowed it to sink in, maybe wouldn't be a total shock to Mapleshade.

Birchface and Flowerpaw:

First, Appledusk clearly isn't invested in the Sunningrocks battles. So he'd get no benefit or pleasure from the accidental death of those Thunderclan cats. He calls the battle as a whole "Mousebrained", including his own clanand was just glad Mapleshade wasn't hurt: *"But Sunningrocks has always made our Clans a little mouse-brained." He licked the top of Mapleshade's head. "Thank StarClan you didn't get hurt in the battle."* - Chapter 1.

This similar sort of attitude is expressed later in the book when it comes to training his apprentice: *"Why don't I spring at you to show him how it's done?" asked a voice. An orange she-cat [Frecklewish] slipped into the clearing. [...]* **"I'm not letting you do anything,"** *he mewed. "Think of our kits!" Reedshine glanced at her belly, barely swollen beneath her pelt. "I'm not sick!" she protested. "I know you're*

not," meowed Appledusk. **"But our kits are too precious to risk Perchpaw injuring you by mistake!"** - Chapter 9.

When Appledusk is looking for Perchpaw after Mapleshade kidnapped him: "If I find out you've been practising battle moves instead of collecting moss, you're going to be in big trouble, Perchpaw!" - Chapter 9. This is clearly a behaviour Perchpaw has done before however, Appledusk doesn't encourage it. A more battle-hungry mentor would probably dismiss or actually praise their apprentice for doing extra battle training, even when they're not supposed to. However, Appledusk isn't so eager for Perchpaw to do excessive battle training, actually willing to punish Perchpaw for it.

Appledusk clearly privatises his loved ones' safety over fighting and training, not taking it too seriously, by the fact he also called his own Clan "mousebrained" for the Sunningrocks battles. He's not the kind of cat to take any pleasure in accidentally killing another cat. In fact, he's much more likely to feel guilty. Appledusk even shows a physical reaction to when it brought up, actually hinting towards this.

"She felt Appledusk ***stiffen beneath his pelt****. "It was an accident," he growled. "I never meant for him to fall into the river." Mapleshade closed her eyes. "That's not the way my Clanmates see it. They blame you for both of our losses." [...] "Then they are fools." Appledusk* ***shuddered****, then relaxed."* - Chapter 1.

It uses language like shuddered and stiffened, Appledusk is having a physical reaction to when he's reminded of the accidental death he caused, clearly showing he's uncomfortable about it and yes, regretful.

Accidental deaths happen all the time in battle, like with Whitethroat, Whiteclaw or Russetfur. And it's not the complete fault of the accidental killer either - Like the others examples, Appledusk and Birchface weren't in that situation willingly, they were following orders and trying to defend/claim territory for their Clans. And who's to say Birchface isn't somewhat reasonable for his own deaths

"Appledusk, a light brown RiverClan warrior with piercing green eyes, striking Birchface so hard that the ThunderClan cat lost his footing and slipped from the very top of Sunningrocks." – Birchface and Appledusk were fighting in a high and dangerous area. Neither of them should of been fighting there and both were acting in self-defence. Also, it was Birchface himself who lost footing and tripped. Appledusk didn't shove him towards the edge. It could of very easily have been the other way round – Birchface hitting Appledusk too hard and making him slip into a dangerous river.

Also, Birchface's death was the only one Appledusk's directly caused. It was still Flowerpaw's choose to recklessly throw herself into danger. The River was specifically described as "Swollen", meaning it had burst it banks and was flooding. As a experienced warrior, Appledusk can see a hopeless situation when he sees one, but as a Reckless apprentice made the mistake of trying to save an unsavable cat and paid the ultimate price for it.

And for all those may be arguing: "Appledusk should have saved him". Here are the reasons why that's extremely hard and borderline impossible. Also unfair demand of Appledusk:

In only reference of Birchface's death we have (Direct Quote in the previous comment) described the River as Swollen.

Meaning: contains more water than normal as a result of heavy rain or snow that has melted.

And later in Chapter 3, Mapleshade says this: "Mapleshade shrugged. "There's been so much rain this leaf-fall, bits and pieces must be washing all over the place."

So at the same time around Birchface's death, there had been heavy rainfall. Conditions were much more dangerous than normal. This proven further when the kits drowned, the River flooding and it was storming, struggling this weather could of happened before.

Which is where Birchface's death comes in.

2) In the same reference used, it also states Birchface and Appledusk were fighting on the top of Sunningrocks, which is

where Birchface fell. In order to "save" him, Appledusk would be required to jump from a long distance.

Hitting the water from height can cause injury. Which is made worse, added with the factor the river was already swollen.

Whiteclaw faced very similar conditions – Falling from a height and going into dangerous waters. Yet he has instantly accused dead. So the same would apply to Appledusk. Riverclan cats have a clear limitation on their swimming skills and they are aware of this.

Don't overestimate Riverclan swimming ability. They are not immune to drowning in floods, they are still just cats. Examples of Riverclan cats drowning in floods: Duskwater, Whitethroat, Pebblefoot and Grasspelt. Appledusk is no different, he's just like any other Riverclan cat.

3) Appledusk had just been fighting in a battle. He was already exhausted and wounded to some degree. If he tried jumping from a high point, he would end injuring himself further, making swimming in a flooding river even harder.

4) Even after all those factors, Appledusk is still expected not only get himself to safety but somehow also haul out two other cats, all alone. One of them being fully grown tom, Birchface.

His father, Oakstar, is described as broad-shouldered and faced. So Birchface likely has a build similar to his father, meaning he probably weights quite a lot.

5) After seeing Birchface falling into the River, other Thunderclan warriors in the battle, who would instantly be targeting Appledusk, likely aiming to kill him in revenge considering the time period. This is a massive distraction.

So Appledusk couldn't fully put his attention on deciding what to do with Birchface, while also having to be aware of the Thunderclan warriors rushing towards him. Appledusk very likely now trying to escape with his very life against multiple revengeful opponents.

6) Birchface's death would of happened very quickly. For Appledusk

to have a reasonable shot of saving him, he would of been required to get over his natural shock of accidentally making someone fall instantly, to grab him before he falls off the cliff. Which simply can't be done. Instantly/willingly snapping out of temporary shock is impossible, it's your natural reaction, it can't be fraught. This can display anyone from taking instant action.

And all in a few seconds, Appledusk also required, to get over the immense fear of willingly and recklessly throwing himself over a cliff into a flood, that could likely result in his death from all the factors we cover earlier, for an enemy cat who was literally just attacking him a second ago.

Flowerpaw, an impulsive apprentice, may have been reckless enough to do and she paid the ultimate price for it. Appledusk, as an experienced warrior, can more logically know what situations are hopeless or not.

In the entity of the Clans, Warriors have never had the obligation or apart of the code to save enemies on the battlefield. In fact, the code points to the complete opposite:"Defend your Clan, even with your life. You may have friendships with cats from other Clans, but your loyalty must remain to your Clan, as one day you may meet them in battle." It acknowledges Battles are apart of everyday Clan life and orders warriors to put their Clan above all else. Appledusk should be no different. If he risked his life to save attacking enemies above protecting his own clanmates, he'd be betraying Riverclan.

Appledusk, like everyone already have enough to worry about in those life and death situations: Their own lives, their clanmates and their territories. Even Greystripe's rescue attempts had it's limits, he tried catching Whitethroat on land, but halted at the ledge, because he knew it would result in his unnecessary death as well.

Ravenwing Defence

Some claim that Ravenwing was breaking this code: "No warrior can neglect a kit in pain or danger, even if the kit is from a different Clan."

However it's the complete opposite, this code works to Ravenwing's advantage. He's simply the reporter, not the cat to give the final order - Which goes on Oakstar's shoulders. The kits are legally protected, so Ravenwing should have nothing to worry about - Unless he believes so strongly in the assumption that his Leader will break the code, that he won't report it - He'd have to think very lowly of his own Clan and boarding paranoid. Just because it happened in the Canon, doesn't mean it was a foreseeable event on Ravenwing's part.

Leafpool's Wish confirms Medicine cat can't pick and choose which omens they report: "Reluctantly, Leafpool had told her sister what she had seen; **it was not the duty of a medicine cat to choose which omens and visions to keep secret.**"

It's apart of the Medicine code to interpret Omen and tell them to another party, one of the most sensible being the Leader: "A medicine cat must be able to inturpret signs from StarClan." Notice the word, "Interpret" - By definition there's no right or wrong reading. Once the true meaning is relieved by Starclan or happening in real world events - The Medicine cat is not at fault, they're trying to do their best with Starclan's vague information.

Ravenwing confirmed to have no ill-tent. Simply revealed the secret because he felt forced by his duty as Medicine cat because Starclan themselves told him to and his Clanmates had the fight to know when one of them is traitor by mating with an enemy cat who killed two of their own. Even guilty/remorseful, not truly wanting to do it:

"You have told me plenty," Ravenwing responded, and there was

sadness in his sky-colored eyes.

"The truth must come out."

"Please don't say anything!" Mapleshade begged. "These are ThunderClan's kits!"

"They are half RiverClan," Ravenwing corrected, his voice as hard as ice. "Our Clanmates

deserve to know. I'm sorry, Mapleshade. Sorry for you, but even sorrier for these kits. They will end

up suffering for the lies that you have told." – Chapter 3 of Mapleshade's vengeance.

Mapleshade is a massive hypocrite, as reasonable, if not more, for her kits' deaths as any of her victims: Being banished for her crimes/lies and making them swim in dangerous waters. It was Oakstar who choose to exile innocent kits and endanger them and his alone. Ravenwing shouldn't be blamed for Oakstar's or Mapleshade's crimes. He received an omen from Starclan themselves and simply fulfilled his duty as a Medicine cat , interpreted it and told his leader. He shouldn't be punished for not being willing to become a liar/traitor himself, just to protect someone from their own crimes. Especially when he's Thunderclan only Medicine cat, with everyone relying on him to keep them alive. Medicine cat lying have never ended well: Both Yellowfang and Leafpool's kits were 'punished by Starclan' with Brokenstar's crimes and Jayfeather's blindness. Also, Hawkfrost faking an omen and manipulating his Medicine cat sister is one of the reasons he's in the Dark Forest.

I feel like people have impossible standards for Ravenwing, it's impossible for him not to either lie/betray or snitch. He has no choice but to choose a side and 'betray' the other. Mapleshade was a traitor and danger to the Clan. Having kits should never be an excuse to get away with her ongoing crimes. She could have: Leaked information to Riverclan, Constantly trespassed on enemy territory, etc. All things that could of provoked more attacks from Riverclan, worsening the war and possibly leading to many deaths.

Mapleshade could of even attacked/killed a Clanmate herself for all Ravenwing knew.

And she already doing things like that; by taking herself and her kits so close to the Riverclan border and speaking to Appledusk. It was lucky the Riverclan patrol simply escorted them out and only a Medicine cat witnessed it, it could of easily been taken the wrong way and led to a battle.

Ravenwing must choice between one traitor + Unknown gamble with their kits or literally everyone else, including other Queens/ Kits, Elders and Apprentices. Ravenwing chooses to protect the majority over the individual. Once again, I'd like to reinforce the fact that Ravenwing had no way of knowing Oakstar would exile the kits. Medicine cats ain't expected to get to know the Leader personally. Specially since this involved Oakstar's son, he would of act multiple ways. Another factor, that I think should offer him some leeway, is the fact he's young and inexperienced, even less reason why he wouldn't really know his leader. His mentor, Oatspeckle had died just 4 moons before Ravenwing was sent this omen from Starclan themselves and forced to make this very tricky decision. So Ravenwing thought he could rely on his more experienced leader to make a right decision. Unfortunately, Oakstar just so happened to turn out to be a terrible leader, deciding to punish kits for their parents' crimes. It the reasonability of the Leader/Judge to be fair with their verdicts, not the accuser.

Also take note that Ravenwing never does state the kits should be punished or showed signs of supporting it. The only quote thing that may be interpreted as that is: "They will end up suffering for the lies that you have told.". However 'suffering' is an extremely vauge and broad term, which literally refer to anything. It very specifically meaning Ravenwing will know for sure that the Oakstar would exile the kits, despite it being against the code, is very unbelievable to me.

Also take note, he was referring to Mapleshade's lies. Of course, they would suffer, they'd discover that their mother lied to them, their father alive and was the Riverclan cat who killed two of their Clanmates.

It could mean anything from: The kits suffering from discovering their mother lied to them or watching their mother get rightfully punished (Having kits is not an excuse to escape her crimes, it wasn't for Tigerclaw). The was nothing to suggest the kits would actually get punished for someone else's crimes. Those would of more likely happened: Mapleshade is allowed to stay just under close watch or they are adopted by another Queen while Mapleshade is punished for her crimes. Sure, Thunderclan may react negatively, but to actually do something official to them, is again, was very unlikely and only happened because Oakstar was a terrible leader.

He took a neutral stance during the whole situation, only focused on getting Mapleshade to admit the truth. It wasn't his place to advice on Clan Politics without being asked by the leader first, it was up the rest of Thunderclan to decide what they did with the information. He had no way of knowing how the Clan would react, there were many possibilities: Only Mapleshade was banished while the kits were adopted by another Queen, allowed to stay but kept a close eye, etc. The fact the worst case scenario happened was nothing more then bad luck on Ravenwing's part, that he ended up with a terrible leader and a storm that day.

To fault or even blame Ravenwing for not foresight such ridiculous unlikely event, I find unfair. Especially, when literally everyone else in the Clan said nothing, including the deputy Beetail and Mapleshade's mentor, Bloomheart. I always had the mentality you punish no one or you punish everyone.

Even then, being exiled isn't an anatomical death sentence for the kits. Many kits have travelled long distances without dying. Also, most rouges/loners are able to raise their kits without the support of territory or Clanmates. When Oakstar exiled the kits, it was obvious to the whole Clan, Mapleshade would take them to Riverclan. It was only a short trip. Even earlier in the book, Mapleshade had managed to take them to the border with no trouble. A storm happening on that day was completely unpredictable and nothing more than a coincidence.

And to Ravenwing himself, had seen how they'd probably be better off in Riverclan anyway. From what he heard from Rabbitfur, they

could barely function on land, not even able to pounce properly yet saw himself they were very good swimmers, even without training. Everyone would also be safer. The kits wouldn't be judged or in danger from any revengeful Clanmates like Frecklewish, due to their father being reasonable for two Thunderclan cats' deaths. It also worked the other way around, just in case the Omen was warning about the kits being future evil, they'd be far less dangerous if they weren't in Thunderclan itself. Even better, everyone including the kits and Frecklewish/Oakstar would know the truth of their 'kin', knowing how they were had lied to. It would be painful at first, but better to know the truth then lies. In Riverclan, the family wouldn't be forced to live separately and they know their true father is alive and be with him. Mapleshade's kits also wouldn't be as harshly judged and just generally be in a better environment for them.

I think it's safe to say why Ravenwing didn't stop the kits' exile, it was best for them and everyone else, that they were in Riverclan. The only 'risk' factor Ravenwing took: was simply to reply on Mapleshade, a fully grown warrior, to be able to transport three kits a reasonably short distance without getting them killed, in a territory she knows extremely well. Something many have none in the past, even she herself did earlier that day. Which personally for me anyway, I say is pretty reasonable expectation of Mapleshade.

This is actually situation Fireheart was in. They were both dealing with: a tom who had, at least tried or succeed, in killing 2 of their clanmates (At the time at least) but was also the father of young kits. Who's victims were personally connected to the Leader, which may of risked bias in their verdict (Birchface = Oakstar and Redtail/ Herself = Bluestar).

And Ravenwing/Firestar had the choose expose the traitors or not – If they exposed them; it would mean they'd be less of a danger to the Clan and be punished for their crimes however there may be unforeseen consequences for their friends/families. Or leave the traitor unexposed by becoming a liar themselves (Ravenwing/ Fireheart), allow the traitor to carry on being a danger to the Clan, but it would it mean nothing could happen to the friends/families.

The only thing separating Fireheart and Ravenwing, is luck.

Fireheart was lucky enough to have a decent leader. If it was another leader, they could of easily lashed out at murderer's mate and kits. Then we could just have a repeat of Mapleshade, if Goldenflower and Tigerstar's kits died after they were exiled/left willingly with Tigerclaw, would that justify one of them killing Fireheart later on? As for what happened in the canon, Tigerclaw's friends and kin's lives were still deeply affected by Fireheart exposing his crimes: All of them mistrusted/judged by their Clanmates including a Queen/kits, insulted and even yelled at for it, pressuring them to go into exile, which eventually led to Tawnypaw to actually defect to Shadowclan.

Ravenwing had no right to speak up during Mapleshade's sentence, he's the least qualified in the whole Clan. The meetings was dealing with traitors, war and territory - Subjects Medicine cats are disconnected with and can't fully understand. As it's in their code, they have range of all the Clan territories without being attacked and above Rivalries. They can't grasp the threat a traitor like Mapleshade could impose.

There are so many character who have lied/told the truth, and no fans give them slack for it. Which is why I believe the hate towards Ravenwing is unfair:

Cinderpelt: She reported an omen to her Leader, who had a personal connection to the situation, that she interpreted of being a future evil. This lead to Firestar overworking and harassing a Young warrior and apprentice. To the point, when Brambleclaw and Squirrelpaw left, it was assumed it was because of Firestar's treatment. Cinderpelt wasn't punished or criticise for reporting her omen.

Goosefeather: Reported the omen of Thistleclaw being evil solely Bluefur, the main competitor for deputy position. Goosefeather was aware of Bluefur's Half-clan kits and she couldn't possibly be Deputy while caring for them. Put the burden of preventing a future evil solely onto one Queen, never telling anyone else. However if he literally just reported it to Sunstar, it could of avoided the three kits being endangered, with Mosskit even dying.

Jayfeather: Never told about the Dark Forest recruiting for seasons,

so innocent trainees were left be targeted and the Clans were less prepared for the Great Battle.

Yellowfang: When Brokentail becomes deputy, received a warning her omen her son causing kits to fight to the death. Doesn't suggest to Raggedstar he should demote him . Never tells anyone, even when her dream become reality and kits starts dying.

Fireheart: Broke the Code to gather testimony from Riverclan cats and made everyone think a Thunderclan apprentice was dead. Exposed Tigerclaw all of his crimes.

Outcome: Lead to an innocent Dustpelt, Longtail and Darkstripe being humiliated for being offered to go into exile with Tigerclaw. A Queen and her young kits are judged/bullied - Leading to Tawnypaw defeating to Shadowclan. For Brambleclaw, cats like Ashfur attempt to prevent him finding a mate by using his father as an excuse. Far down the line, Tigerstar's grandson is named after him, judged because of it and possibly trains in the Dark Forest for it.

Heathertail and Breezepelt ain't Heathy

In the fourth arc of the Warriors Series, Breezepelt and Heathertail were confirmed to be mates. But are they destined to follow the fate of Nightcloud and Crowfeather's relationship or could they somehow overcome it?

Why they're probably not a heathy couple:

I think it's impossible for Breezepelt to ever be a stable mate or father. As an apprentice, Breezepaw was disrespectful and insulted everyone around him, including his Clanmates. He's controlling of the other apprentices, including Heatherpaw and she has to serve as his apologist:

Breezepaw's controlling nature:

"Though you couldn't tell it from his manner. He's been trying to boss the other apprentices from the moment he went from a 'kit to a 'paw."

"He led out a patrol of apprentices to see if the dogs had come back

to the far corner of our territory. Without asking permission, of course, and without even a single warrior for backup." - Whitetail about Breezpaw controlling the apprentices, Outcast Page 135

"*And then there was the fight you provoked with the RiverClan patrol...They were* not *trespassing, they were* not *stealing prey, and Onestar didn't appreciate having to apologize to Mistyfoot for the trouble* you *caused...Breezepaw has many lessons to learn before he becomes a warrior.*"—Tornear about Breezepelt Outcast, Page 136

(Specially Heatherpaw's the personal experience) "Breezepaw thinks that I have to do what he says because his father, Crowfeather, is my mentor."

"It's hard to believe, but Breezepaw can be great fun on a good day." (Take note of "good day", this implies him being "fun" is rare and he's difficult a majority of time.) – The Sight

At the Gathering, he rudely questions Heatherpaw's choose in peers and pressures her away:

"You're not going to waste your time chatting to these two, are you?" The black-pelted WindClan apprentice sat down beside Heatherpaw. "Ivypaw and Owlpaw have just challenged Berrypaw to a competition to see who can jump the highest." He licked a forepaw and drew it over his ear. "Why don't you go and watch it, then?" Heatherpaw replied. "Why don't you come with me?" A challenging glint sparked in Breezepaw's eye." – The Dark River

Heatherpaw feels the need to apologize for someone else she knows is in the wrong:

"Please don't be angry," Heatherpaw begged. "Crowfeather's always bad-tempered. It's just his way. And Breezepaw thinks he's a warrior already." – The Dark River

Example of Breezepelt ordering Heatherpaw around:

"Breezepaw sent me to catch mice between the rocks just over the top of the moor, not far from camp. I chased one down into a crack

and realized that the crack opened into a tunnel. When I went inside I found that there were tunnels leading everywhere." – The Dark River.

Heatherpaw and Breezepaw arguing over his bullying of Jaypaw:

Contrasting reactions to Jaypaw falling in the Lake: "Will he be okay, Whitetail?", [Heatherpaw] mewed. She crept forward and crouched beside Jaypaw. He could feel her pelt trembling against his. "He'll be fine, Heatherpaw.". [...] [Breezepaw] snorted, "Typical that a ThunderClan cat should thank us by trying to drown us!" [...] Heatherpaw leaned closer in, brushing Jaypaw's pelt with her whiskers. "Can you see anything at all?" she asked curiously. Breezepaw snorted. "If he can, he must be stupid, walking off the edge of a cliff!" - The Sight

"Now What?" Breezepae snapped, "Do you think you can lead us back? Or did you just bring us here to show us a boulder? Let me guess, it's a special Starclan rock and it's going to tell us where the kits are."-Heatherpaw hissed at her Clanmate, "Shut up!"
- Dark River

Breezepaw being ungrateful that Thunderclan saved Heatherpaw:

"We should go," Brambleclaw meowed. He dipped his head to Onestar. "Those dogs won't dare come near this part of your territory again." "If they do, we can manage them by ourselves," Breezepaw muttered. "Breezepaw!" Nightcloud snapped. "Heatherpaw might have been hurt without this brave apprentice." She blinked gratefully at Lionpaw. – The Sight.

Heathertail and Breezepelt arguing over his aggression:

The two WindClan warriors flanked them as they crossed the moor. No one spoke, but a low growl rumbled occasionally in Breezepelt's throat. Heathertail swung her head and glared at her Clanmate. "Will you stop making that noise!" she growled.
"Do you want to make them feel welcome?" Breezepelt snapped back.

"I think they got the message from Onestar," Heathertail pointed out. "They don't need you snarling at them all the way to the hollow. They're just apprentices."
"It'll teach them not to do it again."
"Just shut up!" Heathertail snorted. "No one died and made you a leader."
Breezepelt let out a hiss, then was quiet. – Fading Echoes.

Heathertail's and Breezepelt's clashing ideologies on Non-Windclan cats:

The two mates have completely opposite options on this topic - Breezepelt for his whole life insults every non-Windclan member, to the point he used it as a justification for murdering his Half-Clan siblings. While Heathertail was actually in a forbidden relationship herself. Could you imagine how Breezepelt would react if he ever discovered this?

Breezepelt - "Your mother betrayed my father as well as her Clan. You have no right to be a medicine cat. No right to even live among the Clans. I'll never forgive you for what you've done! Never!" - Breezepelt using Jayfeather's half-clan status against him.

"He's way old! Older than any of our elders. Why isn't he dead yet?" [...] "Brambleclaw continued, "And I hope all three of you have thanked Purdy. You're lucky he guessed where'd you gone. If he hadn't- "We could of found our own way out of the hay.", Breezepaw interrupted, "We don't owe anything to this crazy old cat." - Breezepaw insulting the loner, Purdy, even after he saved his life from dogs.

Heathertail - "Some of us have explored and played and battled for our lives in the web of tunnels coiled below our new home. Cats in other Clans know our secret—Lionblaze, Jayfeather, and Hollyleaf. But it was all a terrible mistake. I never should've followed my curiosity belowground, out of the safety of daylight and fresh, clean air. I risked everything because I was in love with Lionblaze. But my discovery nearly carried us to StarClan—and the games we played ended up breaking our hearts." - About her Forbidden relationship.

"Go, and don't come back, you can take the catmint. I've no quarrel with

ThunderClan; I don't want to see cats suffer, whatever you might think. Just be careful you don't end up a bully like your kin, Tigerstar." - Heathertail allowing Lionblaze to steal Windclan's catmint in order to save Thunderclan.

Breezepelt clearly never told Heathertail about his Dark Forest training:

"Breezepelt rolled his eyes and leaned farther over the bank so that he could talk to the other trainees without Heathertail hearing him. "Look, I don't want to fight you over this," he muttered. "But I'll have to if you keep arguing. Just clear out, okay?" – Forgotten Warrior.

Why does Heathertail feel safe becoming mates and having children, with the same cat who tried killing their half-siblings and wished to kill their father? Murdering Family is a line Breezepelt is all too willing to cross and actually his whole motive. And willing apart of the Army leading a genocide against Windclan, which included Heathertail and Nightcloud. Breezepelt was aware of this – the two cats who had faith in him could get killed – yet he did anyway. This was the side who killed 8 of his clanmates, 1 Shadowclan kit and 2 of his kin, Ashfoot and Hollyleaf.

"Not straight for the throat!" Breezepelt of WindClan snarled. "Death shouldn't come too quickly. We must terrify our enemies before we kill them." – Last Hope.

"When cats from the Dark Forest walked in his dreams, offering him a chance to become a better warrior than his Clanmates, Breezepelt accepted. He was one of the few cats who understood the true nature of the Dark Forest's attack on the Clans—and he relished the thought of punishing those cats who had made his life so difficult." - Ultimate Guide.

"Breezepelt?" Brokenstar turned to the WindClan warrior, who was peering at Beetlewhisker's body through narrowed eyes. "Did you hear me?" Brokenstar growled quietly. "Why would I leave the strongest Clan?" Breezepelt lifted his head. "My Clan wastes too

much time looking after the sick and old. If you led us, we'd never have to beg another Clan for help again." – Last Hope.

"There you are!" Breezepelt's eyes shone. "We're going to launch an attack on the [Windclan] camp." – Last Hope.

Heathertail knows all this from personal experience with Lionpaw, when he tried killing her and her mentor. And Heathertail is cold and keeps her guard up with every new encounter with Lionblaze and rightfully so. It's a necessary measure to keep herself getting hurt again.

Heatherpaw's traumatic experience with another murderous lover:

"Behind them Heatherpaw reared up on her hind legs, her blue eyes wide with shock. Lionpaw lunged at her and
grasped her scruff between his teeth. She struggled, wailing, as he dragged her through a wall of ferns and flung her to
the ground in the small clearing beyond. Enclosed in the pale green cave, he pinned her down, letting his paws prick her skin. [...]
Lionpaw stared down at her, stifling the urge to shred her fur. "I don't believe you," he breathed. "You've never forgiven me for wanting to be a loyal Clan warrior." He leaned closer and dug in his claws as she tried to wriggle away from his hot breath. "I'll never forget this, Heatherpaw. I will be your enemy forever."

[...] "Get out of my way!" Lionpaw lunged at Crowfeather. Hooking his claws into the dark gray warrior's neck, he flung him through the ferns and thumped him onto the ground. Still gripping his throat, he leaped on top, tearing at his flesh in a frenzy. Suddenly teeth sank into Lionpaw's shoulder and claws dug into his flank. Heatherpaw was dragging him off. "Stop it!" she shrieked. "What are you doing?"

Startled by the terror in her voice, Lionpaw froze. Crowfeather lay among the green ferns by his forepaws, bright red blood bubbling at his throat. Heatherpaw crouched over her mentor. "Crowfeather!"

Heathertail's later response to Lionblaze: "Meeting Heathertail's gaze, Lionblaze saw nothing but cold contempt in the eyes of the cat who had once been his friend." – Sunset.

But when Breezepelt does much worse and is actually a Clanmate, Heathertail is the complete opposite. She's instantly forgiving/ supportive of him directly after the Great Battle, which even Crowfeather couldn't do. Quite suspicious on if this comes from a heathy place for Heathertail.

Breezepelt doesn't even know what a healthy relationship is. He's never had a positive relationship in his life, friend or family. Mistreats all his peers and bystanders with insults, possessive and aggression. Even in Vision of Shadows, he still has his aggressive attitude and shouts hypocritical statements at Gatherings. The closet to functioning relationships he has still had unhealthy aspects to it. There's no need to get into Crowfeather, as I'm sure you're fully educated on it already.

With Nightcloud:

"Nightcloud coddled her son, encouraged him to believe he was better than the other warriors, and in doing so, never gave him a chance to prove his own worth. [...] His mother's insistence that he had to answer to no one gave Breezepelt a dangerous arrogance" – Ultimate Guild.

"Nightcloud should trust her son to prove his own worth, without leaping in to defend him first. [...] Breezepaw shares his mother's arrogance, but perhaps we can forgive his readiness to draw blood in defense od his Clan." – Cats of the Clans.

"Breezepelt writhed, snarling. "I always knew you hated me!" "I never hated you!" Crowfeather growled. "That's just what you were determined to believe. And Nightcloud encouraged you." – Last Hope.

"Nightcloud had carried Breezepaw like a kit. His hind legs had dragged over the forest floor, but he was too exhausted by shock to complain. Crowfeather had padded beside his mate the whole way, offering to help, but Nightcloud kept hold of her kit as though she

might lose him again at any moment." – The Sight.

(Example of Nightcloud unessarily defencing of her son. And supporting Breezepaw's overreaction to Crowfeather's perfectly normal question) "No damage to the barrier," Breezepaw called. "Have you checked it all the way around?"Crowfeather asked. Breezepaw glared at his father. "Of course! That's what Whitetail ordered me to do." Nightcloud stepped forward. "You should have more faith in our son, Crowfeather," she chided. "Whitetail's my mentor, not you," Breezepelt added."

And the earlier quotes that Heathertail often doesn't have good interactions with Breezepelt either. Breezepelt has no experience to speak of when it comes to having healthy relationships – So how is he meant to know how to act being a mate or father? It's highly unlikely Breezepelt can even handle it, coming straight off the attempts murders of his own family.

Breezepelt's lies to Heathertail and capability to hurt others, including kin, therefore endangering Heathertail:

Crowfeather's Trial is contradicted by both Visions of Shadows and Dovewing's Silence. Suggesting there's definitely forms of lying/ manipulation on Breezepelt's part when he's at Windclan's camp, trying to gain "forgiveness". So once he gained that forgiveness, he started slacking off on being a "changed person" and going back to his old ways. During the Dovewing Novella, which happens around the same time, when he's in front of the other Trainees and Leaders, he has no shame for his actions:

Lack of remorse:

"Onestar arrived before the ThunderClan cats had finished settling. He was accompanied by his medicine cat, Kestrelflight, and Breezepelt. The black warrior's eyes flashed defiantly. He clearly doesn't think he's done anything wrong, Dovewing thought." - Dovewing's Silence. Breezepelt during gathering to decide Trainee's fate.

"Breezepelt was looking smug and Dovewing felt an urge to rake his ears. She was sure he hadn't wanted to be a better WindClan warrior. He had wanted power and strength, and that was all." — Dovewing's Silence, page 24

However this completely contrasted with this quote – "I trained with the Dark Forest to become a stronger warrior. I needed some cat to believe in me, and the Dark Forest cats did – or at least they seemed to. But I wasn't fighting against the Clans. I'll always be a WindClan cat first. This battle with the stoats is my chance to prove myself." – Breezepelt, Crowfeather's Trial.

Breezepelt's lies are even pointed out in the Crowfeather's Trial itself - "Oh, you'd like to pass the blame on elsewhere? The difference is, Breezepelt, that even after you found out what the Dark Forest was up to, you stayed with them. You were prepared to kill Lionblaze—prepared to kill your own kin! How can we just accept your word if you tell us that you'd never hurt Nightcloud?" - Berrynose arguing with Breezepelt.

Breezepelt flat-out lies here. He knew exactly what the Dark Forest's true intentions were:

"It's no use." Kestrelflight's voice, heavy with defeat. "[Antpelt] hunts with StarClan now." Swallowtail let out another grief-stricken screech, but it seemed to fade into the background; Dovewing heard another cat much more clearly. "Sunstrike, Furzepaw, come over here." It was Breezepelt, his voice a low mutter. "Say nothing about the Dark Forest," he warned. "Antpelt may be dead here, but he'll still be in the Place of No Stars. Nothing's changed; he's still on our side." - Breezepelt about Antpelt dying his wounds after his Dark Forest training, Sign of the Moon.

"What happened to Antpelt?", Breezepelt whispered, "Did you kill him again?" [...] "Ivypool shrugged, "It was necessary. In the end, my loyalty was greater than his." [...] He snarled, "We may be in the same clan here, but I am not your Clanmate. You will be punished for this. Wait and see." - Breezepelt to Ivypool about Antpelt's second murder after the Dark Forest make them fight to the death. - Forgotten Warrior

"Breezepelt?" Brokenstar turned to the WindClan warrior, who was peering at Beetlewhisker's body through narrowed eyes. "Did you hear me?" Brokenstar growled quietly. "Why would I leave the strongest Clan?" Breezepelt lifted his head. "My Clan wastes too much time looking after the sick and old. If you led us, we'd never have to beg another Clan for help again." – Last Hope.

Breezepelt definitely knows the Dark Forest isn't there to make him a 'stronger warrior' - Two of his fellow trainees got killed during the training, including his own Clanmate twice. He's also the one to get the others not to tell Windclan about Antpelt's true cause of death, saying he's still "on their side". If he were loyal to Windclan he wouldn't be doing this. He's loyality goes first towards the Dark Forest.

And he eagerly fought for the Dark Forest during the Great Battle. He never once fought for the Clans:

"As Breezepelt reared up to attack a WindClan warrior, Ivypool launched herself at him. Smashing into Breezepelt's flank, she sent him flying. "You can't fight for the Dark Forest!" "Are you crazy?" Breezepelt struggled free and stared at her. "This is what we've been training for!" – Last Hope

"Pain scorched through Dovewing. As she flung the tom off, the thorn barrier rattled. Crowfeather leaped into the hollow, Breezepelt on his tail. As they dived into the throng, Dovewing stumbled." – Last Hope

"Look out!" Dovewing shrieked a warning as Breezepelt flew from the edge of the clearing. Lionblaze turned, caught off balance, and fell beneath the WindClan tom. Breezepelt ripped his claws along Lionblaze's cheek. "You're not as strong as I expected," he gloated. [...] "Lionblaze should never have been born. None of them should." He flicked his tail triumphantly toward Hollyleaf's body. "She's dead; now it's your turn, Lionblaze." He bit into Lionblaze's neck. – Last Hope

Breezepelt also lied about the full expert of his crimes when he was trying to seek "forgiveness". The only crime he allowed Windclan to

do know about was training in the Dark Forest and attempting to kill Lionblaze. However, he never tells anyone of his independent attack from the moonpool, attempting to kill a Blind Medicine cat and Pregnant Queen. All with the aid of Brokenstar and before the Great Battle.

Crowfeather's Exile:

Also during Crowfeather's trial, Breezepelt is spared any official punishment by Onestar, despite all his murders and genocide support. However, when his father, Crowfeather is exiled for rightfully speaking out against Onestar's bad plan, Breezepelt remains silent, not offering him any support. Despite the fact, he should be more sympathetic and know how unfair it is after his own crimes:

"Onestar hissed. "I think you need some time alone to think about what makes a loyal warrior, Crowfeather. And until you do, I don't want you in our camp and on our territory. For the next quarter moon . . . you are not a WindClan cat! Take some time and think about your actions. When you think you've figured out where you went wrong, you may request my permission to return." [...] He noticed that Breezepelt, at the front of thegroup, looked shocked out of his fur, his eyes wide and his pelt bristling. Some cat speak up for me, Crowfeather begged silently.You know I'm loyal . . . I'm WindClan through and through! I've given up so much for this Clan! Tell him! Tell him he's being unreasonable! But no cat spoke. It seemed that no cat was willing to risk Onestar's ire . . . not for Crowfeather. Not even Breezepelt, Crowfeather thought ruefully. And just as I thought we might be getting closer. He's probably glad to get a break from me." - Crowfeather's Trial, Chapter 18.

"Heathertail explained, "We slipped away and picked up your scent trail." The bitter pain in Crowfeather's heart eased a little, to think that Heathertail and Breezepelt had come looking for him, but he found it hard to respond. Breezepelt was standing a pace or two behind Heathertail, his gaze fixed on his paws, the familiar awkward, sullen expression on his face. He looked as if he didn't want to be there, and at the sight of him Crowfeather's heart hardened again." - Crowfeather's Trial Chapter 19, Breezepelt doesn't show any sympathy for his father's exile.

Going back to Heathertail, she entered under false pretences. Would she be so willing to be with Breezepelt if she knew the true extent of his crimes? Breezepelt already tried to kill his family and pregnant Queen – Surely that would Heathertail in some degree of danger?

Skipping to Vision of Shadows – Breezepelt regressed from his "redeemed Crowfeather's Trial version", back more to his own self again. He's not murdering anymore, however, that is such extremely low standards, it's not worth acknowledging. He continuing his old habits:

Insulting others well after Crowfeather's Trials, especially non-Clan-borns. When he himself is lucky not to be exiled:

"Who is this cat (Tree)?" Breezepelt of WindClan demanded. "Wasn't he a rogue?" "He was. And he isn't even a real Clan cat now!" Thornclaw added. "Who is he to tell us what to do?" – River of Fire, After Tree is announced to be joining Skyclan at Gathering Chapter 15

Shouting hypocritical statements at Gatherings. Like with the Crowfeather's exile example earlier, Breezepelt wants to hog the concept of forgiveness and doesn't want others to gain it. Going as far as actively attempting to keep cats in exile. Including a pregant Queen, close to kittening.

Breezepelt is supporting the exile of kits:

Rowanstar gazed out gravely at the Clans. "The rogues that attacked Onestar's patrol are living on the edge of our territory, near our border with ThunderClan." [...] Breezepelt showed his teeth. "They're murderers!" – Thunder and Shadow

"I have decided to allow Sleekwhisker and Yarrowleaf to stay with SkyClan—at their request—since Yarrowleaf is very close tokitting. But they will be on probation until the kits are born and weaned." [...] "No ShadowClan cat could ever be trusted!" Breezepelt of WindClan yowled.

He's hardly the cat to talk about trustworthiness! Alderheart thought. He was glad to see that many cats, including some of his own Clan,turned to glare at Breezepelt.

Bramblestar was one of them. "That's not true," he declared. "ShadowClan was one of the original fiveClans, and a noble Clan. Just because it no longer exists doesn't mean that its cats shouldn't be respected."Breezepelt glared defiantly back, but no cat was paying attention to him now, as the meeting continued." – River of Fire Chapter 9

Breezepelt is now like a worse version of himself in Power of Three and early Omen of the Stars (Before Moonpool attack) And the main article already has many quotes showing how unhealthy Breezepaw's and Heatherpaw's relationship back then. Breezepaw overly controlling her and them having an intense argument about Breezepelt's aggression towards apprentices. Considering Heathertail doesn't appear in Vision of Shadows, the most likely kind of relationship she has with Breezepelt isn't a pleasant one.

Erin Hunter Evidence:

And going into slightly more questionable evidence in the form of the Erin Hunters. During an Erin Chat during 2009, a Fan asked Vicky if Heathertail and Breezepelt are in love. This was years before Vision of Shadows and they were confirmed mates.

Question: Does Heathertail still like Lionblaze? Or are her and Breezepelt really in love?
Answer: Vicky Holmes: Poor Heathertail, I suspect part of her heart still belongs to Lionblaze even though she knows it is an Impossible Love (yay, one of my favourite things!). No way are she and Breezepelt in love! Although their relationship is more complicated than "just friends".

If one of the Authors – finds the idea of Breezepelt and Heathertail being in love outlandish, doesn't say something? In the eyes of Vicky at least, they were never functional as a couple and if they were, it certainly wouldn't work. At least, certainly not a healthy pairing. Vicky even states they're not even proper mates. Instead,

they have a complicated, confusing and murky relationship that doesn't even count as love.

Now for the loosest piece of evidence, is a Youtube video:

"Liking Heathertail? - Harestar: Day 3 - Warrior Cats Speedpaint/ Theory"

(Quickly search if you need to, less then 2 minutes, so it's no issue.)

It talks about supposed comment Vicky made about: Harespring had a crush on Heathertail but Breezepelt threatened him during Dark Forest training, so he would stay away. Considering Vicky often likes to have off-handed small stories and there are no strange details – I'll say it's more likely to be true, just not tracked now yet. Now if this is true, this just completely speaks for itself. That Breezepelt threatened his own clanmate just to hog a single Heathertail's romantic interest. If there's any form of threatening, it atomically can't be healthy.

Bluestar the Hypocrite

The Fandom often praise Bluefur for stopping Tigerpaw attacking Tiny - However what's not brought up enough, is that Bluestar took the exact same role as Thistleclaw years later, not once but twice, taking place Into the Wild.

What I'm speaking about, is Bluestar standing aside as Rusty is attacked by Greypaw and Longtail. Regardless of the fact, Rusty was almost apprentice-age, he's still considered a kit and has to be remain unharmed according to the Warrior Code. Lionheart himself called him this: "Bluestar is only offering you training, young kit."

What's worse is the fact, it was also Greypaw's first day as an apprentice - "Tonight is my first night out as an apprentice". For all intents and purposes, Greypaw is a kit as well. How many mentors would allow an untrained kit to attack another kit? This situation was too dangerous for both young cats - Greypaw had no discipline when it came to his fighting yet - He could of gone too far and seriously hurt his foe. Then Rusty was a kittypet, inexperienced with any violence, so was especially helpless. He'd have to reply solely on his fight or flight response to battle Greypaw, which could of gone wrong as well. There was too much uncertainty to this battle for Bluestar and Lionheart to allow it.

The fight between those two kittens was more violent than any legal training sessions, with claws unsheltered and bleeding wounds: "Twisting and yowling, he tried to throw off the attacker that had fastened itself to his back. It was gripping him with incredibly sharp claws. Rusty could feel spiked teeth pricking at his neck. [....] "The pain from his scratches stung beneath his fur."

And participants being violently thrown around: "The creature hit him like an explosion and Rusty was thrown sideways into a clump of nettles. [...] He heard a"hhuuffff" beneath him as the breath was knocked out of his attacker. Thrashing fiercely, Rusty managed to wriggle free." [...] "Then the kitten crashed into Rusty at full pelt. Taken by surprise by Rusty's turnabout, it fell back into a dazed

heap."

Other leaders didn't allow apprentices with little to no training into fights. Though they weren't technically kits anymore, those Leaders understood they're close enough in age to need a degree of protection. For example, Pinestar only allowed Bluepaw and Snowpaw to destroy herbs in Windclan camp with an escort in Swiftbreeze. The sisters' apprentice ceremony literally happened that same day, just like Greypaw. Secondly, Sunstar didn't want Redtail's litter, who had serval weeks of training, to take part in a Sunning rocks battle.

Bluestar and Lionheart were capable of preventing the fight between Rusty and Greypaw from happening since the beginning. Rusty spotted Lionheart before Greypaw even appeared: "Rusty stood very still and looked around. He could see thewhite tip of a red bushy tail trailing through a clump of tall ferns up ahead. [...] He kept his eyes fixed on the strangered fur up ahead, and continued to creep onward."

Lionheart could have ordered his apprentice to stop. Then Bluestar admitted to them purposefully doing nothing: "You fight well for a Twoleg pet," Bluestar meowed. Rusty and Greypaw exchanged confused glances. How could she know?"We have been watching you both. We wondered how you would deal with an intruder, Greypaw. You attacked him bravely. [...] "You reacted well to the attack, kittypet. Greypaw is stronger than you, but you used your wits to defend yourself. And youturned to face him when he chased you. I've not seen a kittypet do that before.".

Then, it gets much worse with Longtail, who's a fully grown warrior. Also taking place in the middle of a crowd, where spectators have to actively get themselves out the way to remain safe. Anyone from an apprentice to an Elder, could have got caught in the crossfire and injured because of it.

Similar to how Thistleclaw encouraged Tigerpaw to attack first, Lionheart did the same for Rusty, "Do you backdown from a challenge?". This is the same cat who Bluestar chooses as her deputy hours later after Redtail's death. Bluestar says nothing thought out the fight, not even laying down safety restrictions since

it shouldn't be a real fight.

Carries on to do this, even when: Claws are unsheltered: "Rusty dug his claws deep into the tabby cat's fur and sank in his teeth. No subtle rituals of swiping and boxing preceded this fight."

Participants were screaming, almost crashing into bystanders: "The two cats were locked in a screaming, writhing tussle that flipped around the clearing at the heart of the camp. The other cats had to spring out of the way to avoid the screeching whirlwind of fur."

The Warrior almost strangled the kitten with its collar, generally putting his life in danger: "Longtail had gipped it between his teeth and was tugging, and tugging hard. Rusty felt a terrible pressure at his throat. Unable to breathe, he started to panic. He writhed and twisted, but each movement only made the pressure worse. Retching and gulping for air, hes ummoned up all his strength and tried to pull away from Longtail's grip."

Both cats had bleeding wounds: "Clumps of fur hung from their ruffled coats. Rusty could feel a cut stinging above his eye. Longtail's left ear was badly torn, and blood dripped down his lean shoulders onto the dusty ground."

Another example of a warrior violently fighting a young cat, is Ashfur and Lionpaw. In that case, the apprentice had serval moons of training, so was somewhat capable of defending himself. However even then, their Clanmates are shown to be unsettled by it: "They're hurting each other!" Hollypaw turned to Brackenfur. "Can't you make them stop?" [...] "That's enough." Brackenfur bounded forward, his voice sharp with shock. "Ashfur, let him up. Lionpaw, sheathe your claws. This bout is over." [...] Cinderpaw and Poppypaw exchanged glances; they both looked too shocked to say anything. Even Hollypaw couldn't bring herself to congratulate her brother. The way the practice session had turned savage had disturbed her".

If it considered unethical for Lionpaw to be fighting his mentor in that matter, it should be the same for Rusty, who's much younger and has no training. Untrained Outsiders have never needed to fight to earn their way into the Clans, specially kits. This isn't apart of

Time period either. When Boulder and Russetfur (Red at the time) joined Shadowclan, older than six moons, Cedarstar didn't make them fight anyone. Which was years before Rusty was even born. Neither were Millie or Daisy expected to do it either. Proving that Rusty being endangered to fight a fully grown warrior was not even traditional and unnecessary on Bluestar's part.

Then finally, despite taking down the tyrant Brokenstar, for that very reason, Bluestar apprenticed underaged kits in Cinderkit and Brackenkit. Greystripe even pointed this out in front of her: "But none of Frostfur's kits are six moons yet!". What's worse, is she didn't do the same with Thornkit and Brightkit - Creating unnecessary favouritism and jealousy among the littermates. Considering the other two weren't made apprentices until a books later, means Brackenkit and Cinderkit weren't even 5 moons, possibly even younger at 4 or 3 moos old.

An extra fact that isn't brought up enough for Bluestar, is her leaving apprentices without mentors for long periods of time. She never gave Rusty a proper mentor until moons into his training, then never gave Greypaw a replacement mentor after Lionheart's death.

The Dark Side of Starclan

Now this is a small snippet of the scene that I think gets my point across. Now if you don't want spoilers, then obviously don't read. However, Pinestar's choose only really covers already established story points, only told in more detail/alternate viewpoint.

He was laying on icy stone, somewhere high up, with only the starlit sky above him. Silver-furred cats surrounded him, their faces obscured by mist. Pinestar tried to sit up but he was pressed down by invisible paws. "Your son is evil!" hissed one of the cats; Pinestar couldn't see which one because the fog was too thick. "He's only a kit!" Pinestar protested. "He won't be a kit forever!" "Your Clan is in danger!" "What can I do?" Pinestar wailed. There was a moment of silence, when even the wind dropped. Then a voice murmured, "Kill him." Pinestar flinched in horror. "No!" "Kill him." "Kill him." "Kill him! It is the only way to save your Clan!" Pinestar flung off the unseen paws and leaped to his feet. "I cannot kill my own son!"

-Pinestar's Choice, pages 192-193

What the heck... I can't tell what worse, the fact that Starclan of all things is trying to encourage a father to kill his own kit. Or this is in a kids book. This confirms to me, that Starclan isn't this righteous wise spiritual guardians but a bunch of dead cats, who are still just as biased as they are in life. Starclan is flawed. Probably sending several cats to the Dark Forest out of personal feelings/bias, rather than a 'higher form of fair judgment'.

It would be ridiculously contrived if Pinestar had actually gone with it. No matter how evil Tigerstar may have been in the future, Pinestar is still killing his last surviving kit, who hasn't done anything wrong yet. Where would of Pinestar ended up in the afterlife?: If he goes to Starclan, that seriously messed up considering he's a kit/child murderer. But at the same time, if they sent him to the Dark Forest, that's equally messed up, punishing him for something they told him to do. It would be some serious figure-pointing on Starclan's part. If they didn't want to be

hypocritical, all of the Starclan cats who suggested it to him, should go to the Dark Forest too, reasonable for a kit's death. For me, no matter the reason, if a character kills a kit, that's it, that Dark Forest.

And what about Tigerkit himself? Do they send a kit to the Dark Forest for the crimes he might of done? Or do they send him to Starclan, living among the cats that had ordered his father to kill him, trying to excuse themselves by claiming, 'it's for the best, you would of been a future evil'.

Destiny:

This is a problem I have the series in general, is destiny. Wondering on whether the Warrior Cats world is a free-willed or destined one. Becuase it seems no matter what the characters do, Starclan's prophecy are always fulfilled. During Flametail's and Mosskit's deaths, it was vaguely mentioned 'it was their time'. So does that mean every cat's death per decided? During Goosefeather's curse, he received prophecies that wouldn't take place until years later, making you wonder if the whole history is predetermined. So for argument's sake, let's just say this is true and let's explore it's worrying implications:

What about when you apply this concept to characters such as Brokenstar and Tigerstar? Goosefeather stated, that even from a kit, Tigerstar was destined to be "evil" because he should of 'died alongside his sisters'. So what? Any cat that doesn't 'fit in the grand scheme' are condemned to eternal suffering in the Dark Forest? Specially in Tigerkit's case, because he had no control on if he survived or not, and of course no one can fault him for fighting his weakness. No one wants to die for no reason when they're innocent. Which is cruel depending if there's actually free will in the Warriors series. It there is no free will and only destiny, that means Tigerstar had no choose other to the Dark Forest, intended to wander in complete isolation for eternity.

And it becomes a lot worse with Brokenstar's case. As Yellowfang mentioned how she thought "Brokenstar was a punishment from Starclan". Working with the idea of this being true for a moment, that means he's made purposefully evil, for a crime his parents did

before he was even born, he had no control of. So it's arguable that Starclan is reasonable for all the innocent kits Brokenstar kills. And like Tigerstar, with Brokenstar being destined to be evil, he's also condemned to suffering in the Dark Forest. A simallar thing happened with Jayfeather. Leafpool thought his blindness was also a punishment from Starclan. If this is true, yet another cat suffering for a crime they didn't do.

Another problem I have with Starclan and the Dark Forest, is the Dark Forest Trainees like Antpelt and Redwillow. If Starclan actually is this 'holy' form of judgement, I think personally that when a cat is judged, they should be judged on individual actions, not the group they happened to belong to. Starclan's judgement should be devoid of biases. It should never be a matter of sides.

Some trainees cats never do anything outside of their training in the real world, that makes them being sent there seem unwarranted. Now I'll admit, maybe the grown trainees who are aware of what the Dark Forest is, can be head more accountable to their actions. And for those who use the excuse, "they choose to go to the Dark Forest", I'll remind you that some of those trainees are brainwashed from the age of a kit like Crookedstar and Tigerstar. Ones like Crookedstar are even fooled into thinking it was Starclan. Crookedstar just happened to be lucky enough to be strong-willed enough to escape. But what about the more weak-minded kit-trainees? Are they left to their own demise?

Starclan or the Clans have no right to judge/blame those cats, when they have done absolutely nothing to save/help those cats. Former Trainees and Medicine Cats don't educate young cats about the dangers of the Dark Forest, with Flamepaw(tail) not never knowing about the Dark Forest yet in Sunrise, despite being a Medicine cat apprentice. So if a Medcine cat apprentice doesn't even know what the Dark Forest is, how can they expect kits to know the Dark Forest is evil?

In Crookedstar's promise, Brambleberry was even aware of Mapleshade's visits to Crookedpaw, but reminded silent on the matter, expecting him to get out completely on his own. And Starclan are even worse, they are fully aware that vulnerable cats are being targeted, yet do nothing to help them. Not warning them

in a dream, nothing! And you wander how the Dark Forest got so powerful.

And it's not like the Dark Forest trainees can just leave. They've got murderous mentor constantly breathing down their necks, threatening them with death if they don't stay loyal. I mean just look at those examples; Beetlewhisker got his spine crushed by Brokenstar for saying he was leaving, Mapleshade kept on endangering Crookedstar's loved ones when he tried to ignore her and
Ivypool was almost killed by Hawkfrost for 'betraying' the Dark Forest.

This is why I dislike the Great Battle so much. In most Warrior Cats battles, no one side should be favored over the other in Starclan's eyes. You kill a cat in battle, that's increases you're chance to end up in Dark Forest. Obviously, other factors can be taken into account, like: if it was self-defense, which side attacked first, etc. But at the end of the day, no Thunderclan cat should have a higher chance to go to Starclan over a Shadowclan cat, for the same crime.

However this where the Great Battle differs, in this case, it is a matter of sides. You simply fight on the wrong side; 'Well screw you, don't care if you hadn't do anything outside of that, into cat hell with all the mass murderers, completely alone brainwashed cat.".

As a quick side note, the line in the Warrior Code that says, "An honorable warrior does not need to kill other cats to win their battles, unless they are outside the warrior code or if it is necessary for self-defense.". So according to this, it's wrong to kill another Clan cat, but a Clan cat free to cause a genocide of kittypets?

Deconstruction:

Well, to be honest, all those points do go off of the assumption that the Warriors world is a determined one. So if an Erin or the Books themselves were to confirm after wises, then the first points about Tigerstar's and Brokenstar's destined evil wouldn't be valid. Including Jayfeather's blindness, as we don't actually know if Starclan actually has the power to do this or if it just Yellowfang's

and Leafpool's own assumptions. But if the world was a free-willed one, I would still stand by my points about the brainwashed trainees and Starclan telling Pinestar to kill his own son.

As the spiritual guardians of the Clans, it should be Starclan's duty to protect cats from the Dark forest, especially since they're the ones who put cats in there in the first place. And they had more then enough power to do so; all it took was a visiting the dreams of a Medicine cat or even the trainees themselves and warn them. Simple as that. Yet they do nothing. Starclan have failed the Clans.

Former trainees ain't much better. Especially ones like Bramblestar and Lionblaze. They're very aware of what the other trainees were going through and should of been more empathetic. Being suspicious instead, is quite a hypocritical reaction. They should of stepped up more, telling their Clanmates the truth and taking the necessary steps to educate them. And if a warrior then chooses to then ignore those warnings, then, they can be held more accountable for their actions, as they had complete awareness of what they were getting into.

Yet that still doesn't change some others incredibly questionably or even criminal things. There worst one so far, ordering a Father to kill his last surviving kit. Allowing certain cats into their ranks like Ashfur, getting away with their crimes scot-free. Serval Starclan being incredibly pressuring of Squirrelflight to raise Leafpool's kits, including Yellowfang lying that Squirrelflight that she was infertile. The Starclan cat, Flametail was going to leave the living Jayfeather to die, for failing to save him. When the Four Clans needed them most, Starclan abandoned them from the problem that was their reasonability, cutting off all contact with the living, to save themselves.

The unfair exile of Brokenstar's Followers

An example I think that proves that Starclan is a flawed system is the damnation of essentially all of Brokenstar's followers. I feel like they were sent to the Dark Forest as a group, rather than individuals. Apart from Clawface and Blackstar, the other of followers haven't seem to do anything. Whether them supporting Brokenstar is right or wrong isn't as simple as you think. A leader training underaged kits are against the Warrior Code but so is going against your leader, as the word of the leader is the Warrior Code. So what's the right thing to do? Also, to their credit, they weren't aware that Brokenstar had murdered his father or Brightflower's kits. It also never said whether they supported the training of kits. Not to mention the rest of Shadowclan didn't do much in the way to prevent it either. They just let it happen.

I mean it's not like his followers were the only ones to do what Brokenstar said, even if was out of fear, the rest of Shadowclan still listened to his orders, helping to kidnap kits, driving out Windclan etc. So no one is truly innocent in this situation. Even the supposedly "honourable" Flintfang trained an underaged kit, Badgerfang and lead him into a battle, which ultimately got him killed. Should he be considered "Brokenstar follower" for that and be exiled? When Brokenstar and his follower' were driven out, how was it decided who 'Brokenstar's followers' even were? Because when they were exiled, it was durying a confusing situation:

Yellowfang, a believed kit murderer at the time, had just been brought into camp, escorted by the exiled elders. Then out of nowhere, those elders start attacking the deputy with some other warriors. Their clanmates are fighting each other with no expectation. And before they can process what's happening, suddenly Thunderclan attack! In usual circumstances, they would expect to able to reply to your Clanmates to help fight back the attackers, but your clanmates are attacking each other as well.

What are you suppose to do? Who are you suppose to trust and who are you meant to fight?

The exile of the Brokenstar's followers were guilty by association, which is not a fair method of sentencing. Instead a fair trial would: cats are judged as individuals, evidence would be reviewed and allowed to defend themselves. Instead, their exile in a massive confusing frenzy, with no chance to say anything in their defence. How do we know no one abused this free-for-all situation, driving out someone they didn't like, then just claimed they were 'Brokenstar's follower' as an excuse. What about cats like Tangleburr? How do we know she wasn't kicked out because she happened to be Brokenstar's adopted sister, instead of proper reasoning? During Yellowfang's Secret, never was she shown to much different from the other Shadowclan cats. Also, it was Whitestotm who chased Blackfoot, but what gives a Thunderclan cat the right to decide if a Shadowclan is exiled or not? Even then, what gives warriors and elders the right to exile to fellow Clanmates?

This is how they should have dealt with it; when they attacked the camp with Thunderclan, their only objective should have been to drive out Brokenstar, no one else. (Maybe Blackfoot as well since he could claim leadership, making the situation even more complicated) Once that was done, with Thunderclan still there to maintain control, Nightpelt should explain what's happening. After things have calmed down, Nightpelt could establish himself as leader, promising to make things better. This is when cats are given the option to swear oath to him or follow Brokenstar into exile, similar to Tigerclaw's exile.

Now, this is where the Dark Forest/Starclan comes in, despite some of those cats returning to Shadowclan and redeeming themselves by serving their clans again, there still sent to the Dark Forest for Brokenstar's crimes. I mean if Blackstar, who was both Tigerstar's and Brokenstar's deputy, who murdered Stonefur and Rosetail, can go to Starclan, why can't cats like Tangleburr and Stumpytail? Now I'm not sure if this is related to Brokenstar, but Deerfoot also went to the Dark Forest. Why? He regretted Brokenstar's teachings and served as a loyal warrior. Unless he did something we don't know

about, my only conclusion is becuase he's Brokenstar's adopted brother, like Tangleburr.

Personally, I think Starclan did this due to dias. Thunderclan is Starclan's poster child, always at the center of every prophecy. So any enemies of them is an enemy of Starclan. Here's is an example: Hawkfrost is a riverclan cat who attempted murder of 1 cat who wasn't even in his Clan, yet went to the Dark Forest. Ashfur is a Thunderclan who attempted murder of 4 cats, who were his Clanmates, yet is able to go to Starclan.

Nightcloud's Forgotten Side

What I'm especially referring to, is Nightcloud's mistreatment of Crowfeather's Thunderclan family. By no means is she expected to get along with them, however, she takes her jealousy way too far.

Lionblaze and Leafpool:

When Breezepelt got into a border fight with his own Half-Brother, Lionblaze, Nightcloud just sat and watched it. However, the real questionable stuff comes slightly later. It's left to Crowfeather's other mate, Leafpool to stop the sons fighting and point out how messed up it is. However, instead of being relieved, Nightcloud is angry at Leafpool for it:

"Finding a paw hold, Lionblaze heaved himself to his paws and thrust Breezepelt clear with another hefty blow. Blood spattered onto the snow like crimson rain. "Stop it!" Leafpool's high-pitched shriek shattered the freezing air as she plunged through the bracken with Cinderheart and Dovepaw behind her. "How can you watch your sons fight?" she screeched at Crowfeather.

Before Crowfeather could reply, his mate, Nightcloud, stalked from the shadows beyond the border. Her black pelt matched Breezepelt's, and her amber eyes glittered with the same venom. "He only has one son." Hatred laced her hiss. "Crowfeather is Breezepelt's father. No one else's!" – Night Whispers, Chapter 18

Nightcloud wants to hog Crowfeather so much, she completely disowns his Thunderclan kits from the family tree, declaring they don't even exist. In the text, it literally points out Nightcloud hates them, to the point she'll watch her son get into violent fight with his own half-brother.

"Stop!" Leafpool shot between them. Breezepelt's lunge hit her square in the side. His claws tore her pelt as he dragged her to the ground. Another jet of blood sprayed the snow.

Lionblaze stared in shock. Before he could reach for Breezepelt, Crowfeather had crossed the ditch and hauled his son off Leafpool.He tossed him aside like prey and leaned over Leafpool. "You chose your Clan, remember?" he hissed.

She stared up at him. "That doesn't mean I didn't love you."

Crowfeather's eyes flashed with pain. "Maybe you did," he growled. "But it wasn't enough, was it?"

"Get away from her!" Nightcloud had crossed the ditch. She sank her claws into Crowfeather's pelt and dragged him away from Leafpool."- Night Whisper, Chapter 18.

Once again, it's up to Leafpool and Crowfeather to stop the fighting, Nightcloud never lifting a finger. Even after Crowfeather saved Leafpool, Nightcloud shows no concern from her son's eagerness to attack his own extended family. In fact, when Nightcloud does turn physical/violent, it's not to protect anyone, it's out of her own jealousy. Crowfeather had saved Leafpool and now's she bleeding on the ground, yet that not enough for Nightcloud to show any restraint.

Jayfeather:

"Are you okay?" Owlwhisker leaned over him. "Did you fall into a thornbush?" Jayfeather could smell his own blood as it welled in his stinging wounds. "Y-yes." He struggled to find his paws and felt Gorsetail's muzzle beneath his shoulder as he helped him up. "What are you doing?" Jayfeather recognized Crouchpaw's mew. The WindClan apprentice sounded frightened. "That's the medicine cat who killed Flametail!"

"Murderer!" Nightcloud growled. "Be quiet!" Gorsetail silenced them. "This is a Clan cat who needs our help."

"I—I'm okay." Jayfeather fought the tremor in his voice. Owlwhisker brushed past him. "We'll escort you to the border." His mew was brisk. "Can you walk that far?" Gorsetail asked. Nightcloud growled. "If he can't, we'll drag him." – Chapter 6, Last Hope.

When Dawnstripe accused Jayfeather of murdering Flametail during Forgotten Warrior, partially everyone knew she overreaching due to grief, even Shadowclans cats, including Tigerheart.

"She's been acting weird ever since Flametail's death," the tabby tom went on. "She . . . she thinks it was Jayfeather's fault that he drowned."
"That's not true!" Dovewing hissed. "Jayfeather was trying to save him." Tigerheart sighed. "He probably was. But I guess it's hard to know the truth, and Dawnpelt wants revenge." – Forgotten Warrior, Chapter 3

[...] Tigerheart hesitated. "Dawnpelt blames Jayfeather for Flametail's death in the lake," he meowed at last.
"That's ridiculous!" Ivypool exclaimed. Tigerheart shook his head, his hostility swallowed up in sadness. "You don't know what it's like to lose a littermate," he told Ivypool. "You want to blame anyone, anything. Not just a crack in the
ice.." – Forgotten Warrior, Chapter 10.

When it comes to Windclan especially, Onestar agreed with Firestar. "Onestar nodded. "I'm sure Jayfeather could have found an easier way to eliminate an enemy."

So as a Windclan cat, Nightcloud has little reason to believe the accusation is true. Not to the point of calling Jayfeather a "murderer" with such confidence. Her own clanmate, Owlwhisker sees the ridiculousness in it and tells her to stop.

This is much more then Nightcloud genuinely believing she's facing a murderer, but the personal history between her and Jayfeather. Given the excuse, Nightcloud would probably eagerly assume any of the three of murder. Even threatening the injured blind Medicine cat with violence if he lags behind too much.

Hollyleaf:

When Hollyleaf first reappears at the Gathering since her disappearance.

"He was distracted from thoughts of the Dark Forest when he

noticed Crowfeather among the WindClan cats. The gray-black warrior had just spotted Hollyleaf, and he was staring as if his eyes were about to leap out of his head. Beside him, his mate, Nightcloud, followed his gaze and drew back her lips in a snarl. [...] "We welcome her back," Firestar continued, turning his warm green gaze onto Hollyleaf. "We are glad to have her in ThunderClan once again, and I look forward to patrolling alongside her for many future moons. [...] Nightcloud rose and lashed her tail, raking Hollyleaf with an icy gaze. "Does she think she's welcome?" she snarled." – Forgotten Warrior, Chapter 23,

This probably has to be the most gross of her actions. Hollyleaf has been considered dead for seasons, yet Nightcloud's first reaction is to snarl at her when she turns up alive. Seemly Nightcloud prefers Hollyleaf dead. Hollyleaf hasn't said anything during this Gathering, Firestar has only announced her returning. So What exactly is Nightcloud implying when she says "welcome"? Does she want Hollyleaf to never go to Gatherings? Or does she wants Hollyleaf to still live in isolation from her home?

And for what? Nightcloud only aware of Hollyleaf revealing the truth at the Gathering. Shouldn't Nightcloud be grateful that the Crowfeather's lies were exposed? The three suffered just as much as Nightcloud and Breezepelt, if not more. So she'd be somewhat more sympathetic towards them. Yet sticks beside Crowfeather and treats the innocent three as if they're the ones to blame. Hollyleaf shouldn't have to carry the burden of continuing lies she's not reasonable for. It's not a crime to report a crime- Especially when it was Windclan's business as well, so it was relevant to the Gathering.

Mothwing shouldn't be a Medicine cat

A worse version of Longtail, Mothwing maybe by no means 'evil', however, she's definitely not a good cat either. She's the redundant ally who still supported and did crimes on a villain's behalf.

She supported Hawkfrost's false accusations of Windclan's thefts at the Gathering and encouraged rising tensions between clans. Which is not a Medicine cat's place to speak up about since it's the topics of territory and prey.

"What should he do?" Mothwing's voice was sharp as she defended her brother. "Keep quiet and let WindClan get
away with it? Every cat in RiverClan knows that for a couple of mousetails those cats would steal the pelt off your back."
Her amber eyes blazed and she sprang to her paws as if she were ready to join in a fight the moment it started.
A furious hiss came from her mentor, Mudfur, reminding her that medicine cats were meant to keep peace, and
Mothwing shot him a glance, half-angry, half-ashamed. – Midnight, chapter 21.

Mothwing may of not personally faked the Moth's wing omen, however, she's still guilty of continuing the lie, even after Hawkfrost's death. Continuing to be a rank she's aware she earnt illegally. A position that sacred, only reserved for 2 cats at a time, high authority and deals with the Whole clan's lives.

Even worse, she lied about her disbelief in Starclan, which was complete of her own lie and not Hawkfrost. Which she did for far too long, all the way up until Mistyfoot become leader. She knew Riverclan would be relying on her for Starclan's warnings and actually put her Clan endanger. All the time, Mothwing was aware she wasn't qualified and lied to become a Medicine cat, which endangered lives. However she didn't care, she had to selfishly hog this reserved position with massive responsibility. It's like someone

lying to become a doctor in real life. Which is a serious case of fraud, an actual crime which can carry a multiple year sentence. It doesn't matter if it's their dream job, it risking lives. It's also disrespectful to the community that raised her, like a non-believer becoming a priest solely for the social or financial benefits.

"Mothwing was unable to receive warnings from StarClan, she didn't know about the Twoleg poisonous RiverClan territory that started killing her Clanmates, and her warrior ancestors couldn't tell her where to find catmint when greencough struck. – Ultimate Guild.

Mothwing had already earned herself a stable future in Riverclan by completing her warrior training and earning her full name. She didn't need to become a Medicine cat. A Medicine cat who doesn't believe in Starclan is contradiction, as half the job is built around it. She could of been a helper like Brightheat, aiding with healing and herb collecting, which are the only aspects Mothwing can do/enjoy – While not taking on the extra responsibilities of Starclan, which Mothwing is neither capable of or deserved.

"Terrified that her lie might be destroying her Clan, Mothwing confided in Leafpool, who began speaking to Willowshine in dreams on her behalf.-" Ultimate Guild

Mothwing was even aware that her lies were endangering Riverclan. However, instead of telling someone is Riverclan and getting it properly sorted out, Mothwing only tells a Medicine cat from another Clan, Leafpool, who could do nothing (To Mothwing's knowledge). So, Mothwing only really does it, to make herself feel better and forget about the Clanmate's lives she could be endangering.

Also, in order to keep her Medicine cat position, not only was she willing to lie, but also destroy lives of her Clanmates – When she faked a dream for Hawkfrost to get Brook and Stormfur exiled. All this, because Hawkfrost threatens to expose her secrets.

However, Mothwing's lies should of never been secrets in the first place, like we covered earlier. Unlike Squirrelflight, who was forced/pressured into it and done to protect others – Mothwing was

in that position solely of her own making and got two innocent clanmates exiled just to protect herself from her own crimes. Nothing extreme would of happened to Mothwing if she was exposed. The Medicine cat position would rightfully be taken away from her because she lied to get it and is unqualified. Then she'd simply return to being a warrior, which she already had the training for and was for her entire life.

But no, Mothwing has Stormfur and Brook get exiled, getting them separated from all their friends and family. Making them homeless, where they'd been alone and exposed to the unknown territories, which easily could of led to their deaths.

Hawkfrost's threat to reveal her secret meant he was able to force her to make false prophec**ies**,
such as the tale about troublesome stones in the river that led to Stormfur and Brook being driven out
of the Clan when they tried to settle beside the lake after leaving their mountain home. – Ultimate Guild.

Also, take note of the highlighted areas. The Troublesome stones dream wasn't the only one Mothwing faked, she's done more. Who knows how much damage those unknown fake dreams of Mothwing has caused. She's already made two innocent mates be exiled, who had already gone through with it once beforehand.

Goosefeather deserves the Dark Forest

1) He constantly abandoned his duties to either search for unproven omens or laze off.

Most notable examples are Leopardfoot's birth or Spottedpaw's injuries. Medicine cat is a serious job, that can't afforded to slacked off on. It deals with Clanmates lives. Goosefeather should of retired much sooner or become a warrior, if he wasn't taking his Medcine cat duties seriously. Specially since he was also wasting his apprentice, Featherwhisker's time, as he constantly needed to check his mentor was doing his job.

2) He gets Whitekit isolated from his father, without speaking to any suitable parties, not the father, leader or deputy.

This was long before the Spottedpaw and Tiny situation, so has nothing to prove Thistleclaw was dangerous to point of doing this. He's still Whitekit's father, and should have the same rights as such. He should of been spoken to until Whitekit was isolated from him, specially since the mother is dead. Goosefeather is only one authority figure and doesn't actually make any chooses for the Clan, he'd adviser at most. Plus, when going through the major choose to separating a kit and father, it should seriously be run through the Leader first.

3) He's shown to be aware of Spottedpaw and Thistleclaw's relationship when he off-handedly mentions she "loves foolishly". However, does nothing to about it, not even

reporting it.

This is not normal for Clan culture, as apprentices have never become parents for a reasons. Dustpelt merely had feelings for Fernpaw, but he kept it to himself until she was a consenting adult/ warrior. Thistleclaw on the other hand, used manipulating tactics/ advancements on Spottedpaw, while she was still an apprentice. She even pointed this out in her PoV. Goosefeather should of reported it, regardless if he knew or not about her specific Dark Forest training.

4) He's shown making regular trips to the Dark Forest. He does nothing to warn the Trainees themselves like Croookedjaw or the Clans they're attempting to take over .

Goosefeather still controls where he goes in the Afterlives with his powers. Jayfeather has similar abilities, and he only went to the Dark Forest once, while with Starclan cats. Also he used it for the important purpose of spying the Dark Forest's battle plans on the Four Clans. However, Goosefeather is seen twice causally strolling around for no ethical reason. He oversees Young warriors being manipulated, like Crookedjaw, who's he partly responsible for being there, and yet he does nothing to warn them. He knows the Clans' young are being targeted by dangerous spirits and never once reports it.

5) He covered up Bluefur's Forbidden Relationship.

If this is the cat he's so persistent about BLuefur becoming Leader, shouldn't Thunderclan have the right to know? This is their Leader who they're supposed to trust. It's not fair that both their leader and Medicine cat are lying to them.

6) He falsely accused Stormtail of attempting to murder with him with a badger.

This is major, as if it was taken seriously, Goosefeather could have got his innocent Clanmate exiled or seriously ruin his social life. Despite his mentor, sister and Stormtail himself pointing out he was

getting help. For all his life, Goosefeather never apologised or admitted he was wrong.

7) Goosefeather got Thunderclan to attack Windclan unprovoked during Leafbare - Using the dirty method of destroying herbs, endangering the life of every Windclan cat, including kits and Elders. Also indirectly getting Moonflower killed.

The Ultimate Guide stated that: *"Goosefeather had a habit of interpreting omens in the darkest way."*. Meaning he caused more trouble for Thunderclan then necessary. His own Clanmates doubted so much information could come from a signal vole. Highly suggesting it's wasn't a real prophecy, only Goosefeather's ramblings. He's allowed to come up with all the crazed nonsense he likes as long as it doesn't hurt others. But that doesn't give him the right to declare them real and pressure his Clanmates to risk their lives over it. And the part of destroying herbs was just unnecessary and down to Goosefeather's own cruelty. This is why I don't use excuse Bluestar's or Goosefeather's "madness" for their actions. If they sense they're becoming mentally unstable, they should retire - Where they can't abuse their authority. However they selfishly remain in their unearned positions and gets cats killed because of it. (Swiftpaw for Bluestar) That's simply too extreme for the excuse of "Madness" to work for me.

The justification/excuse for Goosefeather is often his "curse". Others cats with powers like Dovewing, Yellowfang, Lionblaze, Jayfeather, Tree, Rootpaw, etc. adapt to it as it's their "norma"l, specially not to the point of literally getting others killed and not being apologetic for it.

If we're reaching, it can be called a disability of sorts - However Disabled cats who have challenges like Jayfeather's blindness, Cinderpelt's leg and Crookedstar's jaw, never allowed it to abuse their authority so extremely, it *literally getting cats killed.* That's in no way acceptable or excusable for Goosefeather.

8) After Pinestar had a dream from Starclan demanding he kill Tigerkit, Goosefeather tells him to listen. He's telling a father to murder his only surviving infant. Goosefeather himself also

acts aggressive towards Tigerkit.

It's doesn't matter what Tigerstar was in the future - At the time and place, Tigerkit was an innocent kit and Goosefeather just unhelpfully told his father to kill him. Instead he could of spoken properly to others - Pinestar, Leopardfoot, Tigerpaw himself, his future mentor etc. (Like simply suggesting anyone other than Thistleclaw) This could of been solved so more easily. So Thunderclan and Tigerclaw himself can watch out for an alarming signs later on in his life. If Goosefeather encouraged Tigerpaw to speak up/get therapy, Mapleshade acting as a second voice could of been uncovered and something could be figured out with Starclan to stop her.

If Goosefeather seriously thought he couldn't do anything to avoid Tigerstar's evil, then there's no reason for him to tell his father to kill his infant son. Goosefeather has the pick one or the other: Take an active role to stop Tigerstar turning evil or let "future" take it course. But whatever he did, he shouldn't automatically resort to the most extreme method of Child murder. He didn't even attempt to do anything else, probably due to his sheer laziness. Tigerkit was innocent at the time, regardless of the future.

(Considering Whitekit has similarities to Tigerkit, having an omen that suggests he can a future evil - There's a high possibility Goosefeather also considered having him killed, if isolating him from Thistleclaw didn't work.)

9) He pressured Bluefur, a nursing queen to get rid of her kits at any rate. Didn't care what happened to them, even if they ended up dead.

Bluefur: "StarClan made me sacrifice everything I loved. My kits—"
Goosefeather: "They're alive, aren't they?"
Bluefur: "Not Mosskit."
Goosefeather: "StarClan will honor her loss."
Bluefur: "What about my loss?""
Goosefeather:"It is small compared with the fate of your Clan."

If Goosefeather assumed they were alive, he wouldn't have to ask

that question in the first place. Goosefeather didn't give any advise to Bluefur. He just pressured a nursing Queen to get rid of her kits, not caring what happened to them afterwards. At worst, he accepted/expected the possibility of Bluefur personally murdering them. At best, he neglected the Queen and kits he helped endanger - to relocate in secret, alone and in Leafbare. Either way, he knew the kits could be killed. It was not safe was for them to be taken out of camp, they were 1 moon old. Proven by the fact Mosskit died because of the cold. Goosefeather didn't care for her death, not showing a hint of genuine remorse and moving on instantly.

Reasonably, the goal should of been to solely prevent Thistleclaw from becoming leader. Which easily could of been done if Goosefeather had simply spoken to Sunstar about his vision or more appropriately, witnessing his Dark Forest training. Bluefur didn't need to become Deputy, it literally just needed to be anyone other than Thistleclaw. Getting rid of Bluefur's young litter was completely unnecessary.

10) He attacked two kits next to a river as a Medicine cat - Basically attampted murder. Stormkit broke his jaw and almost died. And unlike his other crimes, there's no grand purpose behind it, he almost killed two kits for no reason.

"The tom's gaze narrowed. "How dare you?" His ears flattened. [...] "He's going to kill us!" Oakkit croaked. "Run!" Stormkit turned and scrambled through the mallow. He skidded to a halt on the first stone, then leaped again. Oakkit landed beside him. "Help!" he wailed as his hind paws slipped off the stone. Stormkit grabbed his brother's scruff before Oakkit could slide into the swirling river. "Thanks!" Oakkit regained his balance and jumped for the next stone. The tom yowled behind them. Stormkit hurtled after his brother. "You don't get away from Goosefeather that easily!" the old cat snarled. Stormkit felt hot breath on his heels and jagged claws spiked his tail. Unbalanced, he leaped for the final stone. His paws hit water as he plunged into the river." - Crookedstar's Promise.

It doesn't matter if the kits were misbehaving, it's strictly against the warrior code to harm any kit, doubly worse since Goosefeather

is a Medicine cat. He's the reason they hastily ran across the Stepping Stones in the first place, because he scared them with needless aggression. Then purposely made the situation worse by carrying on to chase and shout at them, while they were in the vulnerable position of standing above a river.
He was noted to have his claws out and scratched Stormkit's tail. It's an easily foreseeable event that the kits' lives were endangered by his actions of attacking them near a river - Which is why I label it attempted murder.

The Forgotten War

I was rereading Tallstar's Revenage and surprised to remember just how bad Stonetooth and Cedastar really were to them. Turns out Brokenstar isn't the first Shadowclan leader to have the idea to drive out Windclan from their home for good:

"**Next time, we'll drive you from your dens for good.**" Hissing at the watching
WindClan warriors, Stonetooth limped out of the camp. - Tallstar's Revenge Chapter 15.

Stonetooth had no proper reasoning for the Attack:

"Why did you attack us? Why?" Heatherstar shook the ShadowClan deputy savagely.
"**Why shouldn't we?**" Stonetooth hung limp in her claws, **his eyes shining with hate.** "We could hunt
on these moors just as well as you."
Heatherstar's eyes flashed. "The moors are ours and always will be." She hauled Stonetooth to his
paws and flung him toward the edge of the hollow. "Run after your weasel-hearted Clanmates before I
rip you to shreds."
Stonetooth climbed out of the dip, leaving blood in his wake. "**We've seen your weaknesses, you
rabbits!**" he snarled.

He even orders his warriors to:

At the centre Stonetooth, the ShadowClan deputy, reared up on his hind paws, teeth
bared. "**Spare no one!**" he snarled. - Tallstar's Revenge Chapter 15.

This attack even allowed for Brackenwing's death. And if it wasn't for Stonetooth's spefic order, maybe Shadowclan warriors wouldn't of been so rough to cause her death:

The she-cat's eyes were closing. Redclaw looked at Hawkheart, his eyes as round as an owl's. "Can
you save her?" Hawkheart touched the small wad of web with his paw. "It's too late," he growled softly. "She's lost
too much blood." - Tallstar's revenge, Chapter 15.

In the 2nd attack in Chapter 43, lead by Cedarstar, that uses dirty tactics:

First Blizzardwing:

His first attack is to aim for Talltail's throat, the well-known most vulnerable part of the body in Warriors:

White fur blinded him as Blizzardwing knocked him off his paws and lunged for his throat.

He does what he can to stop Talltail from helping his mentor:

Dawnstripe! Talltail tried to jump toward her but claws pierced his flanks and Blizzardwing dragged
him back.

He even taunts him about it:

"You can't save her, rabbit heart!" Blizzardwing snarled

Raggedpaw and an unknown Shadowclan warrior tag-teamed to drive Plumclaw dangerously close to the Thunderpath:

Plumclaw screeched with fury as a ShadowClan apprentice, Raggedpaw, joined the ginger tabby's

attack. The tunneler was beating them off with a flurry of blows, but they were driving her farther
down the slope, closer to the monsters thundering past.

Then Cedarstar and Newtspeck tagteamed against Dawnstripe, seemingly attacking her more than necessary, as she cries in pain serval times in a row:

Dawnstripe shrieked with pain. Talltail whipped around. Newtspeck had joined Cedarstar. The black-and-ginger she-cat was battering Dawnstripe's muzzle while Cedarstar raked her flank with vicious claws. [...] Less than a tail-length from Talltail, Cedarstar wrestled Dawnstripe onto her spine. Newtspeck nipped at her thrashing hind legs. Blood stained her
muzzle. [...] Had Aspenfall persuaded Heatherstar to send warriors? Dawnstripe shrieked. If help didn't come soon, they'd have to retreat. [...] "Talltail!" Dawnstripe's panicked screech ripped through the air.

Their assault was so bad, Dawnstripe is reduced to writhing around on the floor. Yet they carry on hovering around her, just watching her, not leaving her alone, even though she's defeated. Where it becomes clear they are aiming now to kill her, Newtspeck even enjoying it:

Cedarstar loomed over Dawnstripe as she writhed on the grass. Newtspeck leaned back, **her lip curling in delight**. Talltail braced himself to watch the S**hadowClan leader deliver the death blow.**

Even after Windclan reinforcements come, instead of helping to defend his clanmates, like Newtspeck right beside him or attack worthy opponents, he coutuins attacking the clearly defeated Dawnstripe.

With a hefty blow, Cloudrunner sent Newtspeck staggering away from Dawnstripe while Reedfeather
and Hareflight raced to help Plumclaw. Shrewclaw glared at

Cedarstar as the ShadowClan leader pinned Dawnstripe to the ground.

Windclan starts to become less the victim when Shrewclaw and Talltail trying to kill Cedarstar for Brackenwing's death, even though it's not confirmed which Shadowclan cat killed her. That still doesn't change the fact, Newtspeck killed Shrewclaw:

"I'll help you kill him," Talltail hissed. Shrewclaw lifted his forepaws and together they swiped at the blood-spattered tom, driving him toward the Thunderpath.

"Cedarstar!" Newtspeck's yowl split the air as the tabby warrior rushed to help her leader. She dived
for Shrewclaw, ears flat, lips drawn back. She sank her yellow teeth into Shrewclaw's shoulder,
thrusting her paws around the WindClan warrior and hauling him off Cedarstar. Shrewclaw snarled
and thrashed with his paws as he tried to reach for Cedarstar. Hareflight crouched stiffly beside him. "He'll die like his mother." The warrior's mew cracked. "Killed defending the moor against ShadowClan."

Since Cedarstar led the patrol and is the Leader, he'd clearly had some fault for why his Warriors to acted so viciously. He's the one who probably came up the battle tactics. So he's the one who ordered his warriors to:

Tag-team against outnumbered opponents. Including personally doing it himself.

Ordered or allowed Raggedpaw and the other warrior to drive Plumclaw dangerously close to the Thunderpath, which could of easily killed him.

Attacked a defeated warrior beyond necessary and was seemly aiming to kill her.

Allowed his warrior to aim for a throat-bite, usually fatal attacks

and stopped Dawnstripe's apprentice was trying to prevent her murder attampt, including taunting him about it.

So to put all of Cedarstar's/Stonetooth's crimes together: They lead two unjustified attacks against Windclan for no reason. The first was to forever drive out the whole of Windclan from their camp and take all of the territory, not just a small area. The attack lead to Brackenwing's death.

The 2nd attack was against an outnumbered patrol, and they attempted to murder Dawnstripe. And their dirty methods could of easily killed Plumclaw and arguably Talltail as well. Finally, the attack leads to the death of Shrewclaw.

Attempted exile of a whole Clan and stealing of their entire land, just because they thought they were an easy target. Attacks lead to 2 deaths and almost resulted in serval more.

Even for Cedarstar's own clanmates he's questionable. Such as naming a warrior an insult and this is actually addressed in the Book. So this isn't some mistake on the Erins' part, Cedarstar is canonly aware of this. Then, he makes the inexperienced warrior, Raggedpelt deputy, despite his reckless plan had just got the previous deputy killed, which Cedarstar listened to. Also, even if Cedarstar wasn't aware of Raggedpelt's abuse towards his mate or killing his father, there still should of been outwards signs of the kind of cat he was.

When Cedarstar announces Stonetooth's retirement at the Gathering, even Shadowclan was surprised. Meaning Cedarstar hadn't even told his own Clan yet.

Windclan:

However this isn't to say Windclan so innocent, proven by Yellowfang's Secret.

When Yellowkit was in the Nursery, even the kits were wary/aware

of Windclan being the current danger:

"You're not our mentors!" Nutkit snapped. "All you know how to do is mess up our game."
"Your game!" Raggedkit rolled his eyes. "Like you wouldn't go squealing into the nursery **if**
WindClan really attacked our camp."
"Would not!" Rowankit exclaimed.

In the same scenes, The Elders tell stories about having trouble with Windclan even back before their retirement:

The elders were gossiping in a patch of warm sun beside the tree stump. Yellowkit caught a scrap of their conversation.
". . . **sent that WindClan warrior squealing all the way back to his camp,"** Lizardfang meowed. "We didn't put up with **any nonsense from WindClan in my day,** let me tell you."
"No, and not from ThunderClan either," Silverflame purred. Maybe if I go over there she'd tell me a
story. Then she shook her head. **No, more likely I'd have to listen to Lizardfang yakking on about**
all the WindClan warriors he chased of .

When the kits see Snow for the first time, Raggedpelt instantly assumes it Windclan, implying once again, they had run in with Windclan before:

The camp lay under a thick white covering, and more of
the white stuff weighed down the branches of the encircling pine trees.
"Wow!" Yellowkit squeaked. "What happened?"
Nutkit and Rowankit appeared beside her, their eyes round as they gazed out.
"Did WindClan do this to us?" Nutkit growled. **"I'll shred their fur!"**
"No." Brightflower pushed her way out of the nursery, her paws sinking into the white stuff, and
turned to look back at her kits. Her eyes were warm with

amusement. "This is snow. We get it
sometimes in leaf-bare."

As an apprentice, Yellowpaw instantly suspicious of the Windclan tunnel:

"Over there," Deerleap continued, "is another tunnel. That one leads straight into
WindClan territory. What do you think that means?"
"Trouble!" Yellowpaw exclaimed.

Slightly later, a Windclan was found stealing prey and trepassing on Shadowclan territory during Leafbare:

"Cats—and not ShadowClan cats," she mewed softly as she followed Foxpaw. "This could mean
trouble." She caught up to Foxpaw within sight of the Thunderpath. The young ginger she-cat was standing in
the middle of a puddle of feathers, gazing down at them with a look of dismay. [...]
"Look at this," she meowed, beckoning Foxpaw with her tail. "See how small and light those paw
prints are?" she pointed out when Foxpaw reached her side. "I'll bet a moon of dawn patrols that they
were made by WindClan cats." "WindClan!" Foxpaw exclaimed. "Stealing our prey! They can't do that. Let's get them!"

While searching for answers by going into Windclan territory, Stonetooth even plans to give them the chance to explain themselves:

Stonetooth went on. "Listen to everything I say. We won't attack right away. We'll give
WindClan a chance to explain themselves first."
"Like they'll be able to explain WindClan scent and pigeon feathers inside our borders," Deerleap
snarled.

More of Stonetooth's peaceful methods show:

When the ShadowClan cats reached the brow of the hill, they spotted a patrol of WindClan cats
heading across the moor toward them. Stonetooth halted, signalling with his tail for the rest to do the
same. "We'll let them come to us," he meowed.

Ok, this is where is gets more questionable, however, Shadowclan still does have their reasons for attacking:

"What are you doing on our territory?" Reedfeather demanded.
"Don't you know?" Stonetooth challenged. "We found pigeon feathers on our side of the Thunderpath, with WindClan scent and paw marks. You've been stealing our prey!"
"We've done nothing of the sort," Reedfeather retorted. "We chased that pigeon from our own
territory, and that makes it WindClan prey."
"That's not true, and you know it," Stonetooth growled, sliding out his claws.
Reedfeather tensed his muscles, his neck fur bristling. Yellowpaw could smell his fear. The
WindClan patrol was smaller, and the cats looked too weak and skinny to fight well.

[...]

"You need to leave," Reedfeather hissed. "You're not welcome on our territory."
"We're not going anywhere until you've been taught a lesson," Stonetooth responded.
Yellowpaw saw Reedfeather's gaze flicker. "All right," he mewed wearily. "You've made your
point. We'll stay on our own side of the border from now on."
Stonetooth didn't reply with words. Instead, he leaped onto the WindClan deputy, bearing him to
the ground. A heartbeat later, fighting exploded all around

Yellowpaw.

Though Stonetooth quickly goes back being more humble like in earlier quotes:

Glancing around to find another opponent, Yellowpaw realized that the fight was all but over. Most
of the WindClan cats were pelting across the moor. Reedfeather was the last to break away and race
after his Clanmates, with Rowanpaw hard on his paws.
"No!" Stonetooth commanded. "Rowanpaw, come back!" As Yellowpaw's sister returned,
growling angrily, the Clan deputy continued, "**There is no need to pursue a defeated enemy.**"
Yellowpaw thought she could discern **sympathy in the deputy's voice and his eyes as he gazed after
the vanishing WindClan patrol. But he did not admit as much out loud. Instead he raised his tail.
"Back to our territory," he ordered. "There's nothing more to do here."**

After the battle, Hollyflower still knows there will be more Windclan theists/attacks:

"There'll be other chances," Hollyflower told him with a twitch of her whiskers. "WindClan isn't
going to go away."

When Leafbare has drawn to a close and Yellowfang and Raggedpelt are warriors, Raggedpelt bring back news of Heatherstar assuming Shadowclan on trespassing. However, even Shadowclan within their own camp calls ridiculous, meaning it's proably false. As if it was true, Shadowclan would probably be boasting about in safe within their own borders. Or at least, they wouldn't be so offended about it:

"Any news?" Yellowfang asked, springing up.

Raggedpelt's expression was grim. "All the Clans looked better fed than us," he reported, his lips
drawn back in the beginning of a snarl. "And Heatherstar of WindClan told this ridiculous story about
picking up ShadowClan scent on their territory."
"That's completely unfair!" Yellowfang meowed indignantly. "No cat has been over there."

This carries on with patrolling. Once again, Shadowclan offer a more peaceful alternative then fighting:

Archeye halted and stared at the hills with narrowed eyes. "I can't believe what Heatherstar said at
the Gathering last night. She accused us of trespassing!"
Amberleaf flicked her tail. "Let her talk. WindClan cats are all meow and no claws."

Then directly after this, they find a Windclan patrol trespassing just for the sake of trespassing, considering Windclan are better fed now and ain't in need of stealing prey to survive. Also we see a few familiar faces:

How dare those mangy WindClan cats cross our border? Yellowfang thought. They accuse us of
trespassing, and then they set their filthy paws on our territory!
The trail led toward the underground tunnels. But before they reached the edge of the Thunderpath,
the patrol rounded a spindly thicket of birches and came upon four cats, **confidently surveying
ShadowClan territory.**Yellowfang recognized them from previous Gatherings: Dawnstripe and the
young warrior Talltail, and a tom called Redclaw with his apprentice, Shrewpaw.

The Windclan try to us the made up accusation/lie of Shadowclan trespassing in order to trespass themselves:

"What in the name of StarClan are you doing here?" Archeye demanded.
All four WindClan cats jumped at the sound of his voice, and whipped around to face the
ShadowClan patrol. Yellowfang saw a flash of guilt in their faces, which vanished almost at once to
be replaced with defiance. Dawnstripe stepped forward.
"ShadowClan scent has been found on WindClan territory," she asserted.
"That's not true!" Archeye's voice was furious, and his neck fur began to bristle.

The Shadowclan cats are clearly weaker then Windclan cats, yet they feel the need to trespass anyway. They even offer them to leave peacefully, but they won't listen and even mock them about it:

Yellowfang moved forward to stand at Archeye's shoulder. Out of the corner of her eye, she could
see his ribs jutting through his patchy gray coat. **Can't the WindClan cats see we're all so weak that
we can barely make it to the edge of our own territory?**
"Even if we had trespassed on your territory," Amberleaf meowed, "which we didn't, that doesn't give you the right to be over here." She took a threatening step toward the intruders. "Get out now."
"Oh, can't we stay and have a look around?" Shrewpaw asked, his voice full of mock disappointment. "These skinny creatures aren't going to be able to stop us."
Without saying a word, Yellowfang and her Clanmates stepped into a battle line. A lightning bolt of
anger sliced through Yellowfang. ShadowClan is strong! How dare WindClan cats talk to us like
this?
"Look," Archeye began, "you know you're in the wrong. Leave now, and we can avoid a fight."
The WindClan cats didn't move. Yellowfang felt tension tingling through her body from her ears to
tail-tip, and she flexed her claws.
"And if we don't?" Redclaw sneered. "Are you going to eat us?"

After the fight, Shadowclan needs enforcement to defeat the stronger Windclan patrol. They give out more threats, when Shadowclan in the earlier battle, when Yellowfang was apprentice, thought the one attack was enough and planned to leave them alone:

"Get out!" Raggedpelt snarled. "If you think you can come here and attack our cats, you can think again. My
claws will show you that you're wrong."
"Easy enough to say," Dawnstripe growled.
[...]
"Don't you dare set paw on our territory again." Redclaw thrust out his neck so he was nose-tonose
with Raggedpelt. "Or you'll get more of the same."
Raggedpelt let out a contemptuous snort. "You terrify me."

Forgotten Side of Tallstar

Tallstar is commonly seen as one of the most Noble characters in the Warrior Cats series. While his quest to kill Sparrow is well known, where he presumably learnt revenage wasn't the answer. However two others incidents proved he hadn't learnt his lesson as much we're lead to believe.

Alongside Shrewclaw, He tried to take Cedarstar's Nine Lives by driving him into the Thunderpath. This was during a Border attack, when Shrewclaw wanted to avenge his mother's death from a long time ago, when Talltail had already spared Sparrow.

"That's what revenge is. Therewas nothing cold or planned about Shrewclaw's rage.In the heat of battle, it drove him like fire throughbracken. This was a true warrior's battle.Heart pounding, Talltail jumped in beside Shrewclaw,pummeling Cedarstar down as the ShadowClan leadertried to struggled free. Shrewclaw glanced in surpriseat Talltail."I'll help you kill him," Talltail hissed.Shrewclaw lifted his forepaws and together theyswiped at the blood-spattered tom, driving him towardthe Thunderpath." - Tallstar's Revenge.

This also lead to Shrewclaw's own death, as it forced Newtspeck to save her leader. If Talltail hadn't encouraged/aided Shrewclaw and instead try to stop him, this could of been avoided :

"Cedarstar!" Newtspeck's yowl split the air as the tabby warrior rushed to help her leader. She dived for Shrewclaw, ears flat, lips drawn back. She sank her yellow teeth into Shrewclaw's shoulder, thrusting her paws around the WindClan warrior and hauling him off Cedarstar." [...] "Shrewclaw!"Hareflight was crouching over the WindClanwarrior. Talltail raced to his side, slipping on the wetgrass. He glanced down and saw his paws turn red.The wetness was blood. It pumped from Shrewclaw'sbelly like water from the spring."

Later, while Talltail was a Deputy, Thunderclan raided Windclan camp during a Gathering and destroyed their dens. Talltail instantly went Bluefur's throat, another deputy at the time. If it wasn't Redtail getting her medical aid, she'd wouldn't of survived:

"The other WindClancats were attacking: Talltail, WindClan's deputy,leaped for Bluefur's throat. [...] Redtail looked up at the mass of fightingcats all around him just as Talltail slashedBluefur across the throat.Bluefur stumbled. Blood was running downher chest and dripping onto the ground."Bluefur!" Redtail yowled and sprangtoward her, shouldering Plumclaw out of hisway. Talltail was bracing himself for anotherattack."No!" Redtail hissed fiercely. "We'regoing." Talltail hesitated, and Redtail bracedhimself against Bluefur's side. "Bluefur, youhave to call a retreat," he added urgently.Bluefur was leaning heavily againstRedtail's side. "Bluefur?" he asked. The deputyseemed dazed, her eyes fluttering shut, andRedtail could barely support her weight.She can't do it, Redtail realized. Bluefurwas barely conscious. He looked around at theclawing, struggling cats. There were too manyWindClan cats now. ThunderClan wasoutnumbered. As he watched, Patchpelt fellbeneath two WindClan warriors.Bluefur moaned.If we stay here, she'll die, Redtail realised". - Redtail's Dedt.